COMMISSION TO INQUIRE INTO CHILD ABUSE

PUBLIC SESSION HELD AT THE ALEXANDER HOTEL, MERRION SQUARE, DUBLIN 2

ON THURSDAY, 15TH SEPTEMBER 2005

EVIDENCE OF BR. MICHAEL REYNOLDS

BEFORE

MR. JUSTICE SEÁN RYAN

CHAIRPERSON OF THE INQUIRY

ORDINARY MEMBERS:

MS. MARIAN SHANLEY

IR. MED LOWE

I hereby certify the following to be a true and accurate transcript of my shorthand notes in the above hearing.

MEMBERS OF THE COMMISSION PRESENT

REGISTRAR TO INVESTIGATION COMMITTEE: MR. BRENDAN REEDY

COUNSEL FOR THE COMMISSION: MR.

BRIAN McGOVERN SC NOEL MacMAHON SC KAREN FERGUS BL PAUL WARD BL KIERA McGOLDRICK BL MS. MS. MR.

MS. MS. LAURA RATTIGAN BL

Instructed by: MS. FEENA ROBINSON

FOR THE CHRISTIAN BROTHERS: MR.

PATRICK HANRATTY SC SARA MOORHEAD SC MS. MR. JOSEPH O'SULLIVAN BL

Instructed by: MR. IVOR McGETTIGAN

MAXWELLS

19 HERBERT PLACE

DUBLIN 2.

COPYRIGHT: Transcripts are the work of Gwen Malone Stenography Services and they must not be photocopied or reproduced in any manner or supplied or loaned by an appellant to a respondent or to by other party without written permission of Gwen Malone Stenography Services.

<u>I NDEX</u>

<u>WI TNESS</u> <u>EXAMINATION</u> <u>QUESTION NO. S</u>

BR. M. REYNOLDS DIRECT - MR. McGOVERN 1 -

1	THE HEARING COMMENCED, AS FOLLOWS, ON THURSDAY,
2	15TH SEPTEMBER 2005
3	
4	THE CHAIRPERSON: Good morning everybody.
5	Now, Mr. McGovern.
6	MR. McGOVERN: Good morning, Chairman,
7	Members of the Commission
8	This is a public hearing into Artane Industrial
9	School. The hearing will follow the same format tha
10	has been used in the past year or so when
11	investigating other institutions and will be in line
12	with statements made by the Commission on the
13	question of procedures to be followed. This means
14	that the evidence regarding Artane Industrial School
15	will be heard in three phases.
16	
17	Phase 1, commencing this morning, will consist of the
18	hearing of Br. Michael Reynolds, Deputy Leader of
19	St. Mary's Province, Ireland, one of the two
20	provinces of the Christian Brothers in Ireland. Thi
21	province would have had responsibility for the
22	northern half of the country, north of a line from
23	Dublin to Galway and would have included Artane.
24	Brother Reynolds' evidence will be based upon a
25	submission which aims to describe life in Artane in
26	the period coming within the remit of the Commission
27	including the Congregation's view as to how the
28	institution operated and what life was like there,
29	and is intended to serve as a general background

information on the institution.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

1

I would like to make it clear, Chairman and Members of the Committee, that it is appreciated that some, or perhaps even all, of the evidence which he gives will not be accepted by some who were present in the institution at the relevant time. If there are issues raised which require resolution or clarification, they will be returned to in Phase 3 at a later stage. When this brief public hearing comprising Phase 1 has been completed, Phase 2 will This will involve the hearing of evidence beai n. from a number of persons who have filed statements with the Commission outlining abuse suffered by them at Artane. The Committee have prepared a schedule of hearings involving relevant witnesses who may have evidence to give with regard to the institution. These hearings will commence on Monday, 26th September and are expected to conclude in mid-December. These hearings will take place in private as provided for in the legislation governing this Commission of Inquiry.

2324

25

26

27

28

29

After the Committee has had an opportunity to consider the evidence given in both Phase 1 and Phase 2, it is proposed to return to a public hearing which will deal with any contentious matters outstanding or any other relevant issues concerning the management and operation of the institution. At that stage the

Investigation Committee will deal with issues which have been identified in Phases 1 and 2. A decision has been made to leave over these contentious issues until Phase 3 since by that time the Committee will have had an opportunity of hearing evidence from persons who were in the institution at the relevant time rather than now, when the Committee can only have a limited picture as to what contentious issues are likely to arise. When a clear picture emerges as to the issues to be dealt with in Phase 3, interested parties will be notified and informed as to the procedures which will be adopted.

At this public hearing, evidence will be given by Br. Michael Reynolds, who is Deputy Leader of St. Mary's Province, Ireland, of the Congregation of Christian Brothers. Since 1956 the Congregation of Christian Brothers in Ireland was divided into two provinces for administrative purposes; St. Mary's Province for the northern part of the country, north of a line from Dublin to Galway, and St. Helen's Province for the southern half of the country, south of that line. Artane comes within the area of responsibility of St. Mary's Province.

Reformatory schools were set up under legislation in the mid-19th Century to provide for the needs of juvenile offenders. It soon became clear that an alternative system was necessary in order to provide for the care, protection, education and training of children who were not guilty of any offence but who, because of destitution, neglect or lack of adequate parental care were deemed to be in need of residential care. This is how the industrial school system came into existence.

The system which operated in Scotland and England was extended to Ireland under the Industrial Schools Act passed in 1868. These schools were to provide for children who in present day terminology would be 'put into care'. Historically there was a difficulty in getting most local authorities to contribute towards the maintenance of children in industrial schools and an ongoing complaint of those managing these schools was the inadequate level of funding provided by the Exchequer.

After the passing of the Industrial Schools Ireland Act, 1868, Cardinal Cullen, the then Archbishop of Dublin, approached the Christian Brothers to ask them to assist in running the task of running these institutions and, having acceded to this request, Artane Industrial School opened its doors to its first pupils on 28th July 1870. The school was established under the 1868 Act with the intention of catering for neglected, orphaned and abandoned Roman Catholic boys. Its original intake was of three pupils and it rapidly grew in size to a point where

it was housing 700 boys in 1877 and reached its certified size of 825 boys before the end of the 19th Century. During the 1940's the numbers in Artane were close to 800 and ranging from a low of 794 pupils to a high of 818. The average was 802. The 1950's showed a very significant decline in numbers; the total ranged from a low of 422 in 1958 to a high of 762 in 1950 at the beginning of that The average in the 1950's was 620 pupils. The decline in population continued in the 1960's with a numbers ranging from 392 in 1960 to 24 in 1969. The average number during that period was 286 pupils. These figures do not include voluntary or Health Board admissions which were low and only amounted to 262 boys for the entire 30 year period. Thirteen were admitted in the 1940's, 113 in the 1950's and 136 in the 1960's.

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

Reasons for boys being committed to Artane included begging, not having any home or settled place of abode, having a parent who did not exercise proper guardianship, not attendance at school, destitution or being orphaned or involved in petty crime. From 1954 children guilty of criminal offences were not admitted to Artane. This was because it was felt that it was not beneficial to have boys who had committed crime mixing with boys who were there for other social reasons. The vast majority of boys admitted to Artane came from Dublin and most of the

1	rest of them came from other parts of Leinster.
2	
3	The school continued to operate until the decision
4	was made in 1967 that the institution should be
5	closed. This decision was influenced by a number of
6	factors, including changing attitudes towards
7	childcare, the industrial schools system and the
8	inadequacy of State funding for such institutions.
9	The school finally closed on 30th June 1969. Most of
10	the boys in Artane were either discharged or
11	transferred to other institutions. Some 22 pupils
12	remained on in order to pursue their secondary
13	education in St. David's Secondary School which was
14	nearby.
15	
16	Chairman, that is just setting out a brief history of
17	the school and the type of boys who came to be there
18	over the period of its operation. I now propose to
19	take Br. Michael Reynolds through the statement which
20	the Christian Brothers have submitted to the
21	Commission.
22	THE CHAIRPERSON: Yes, very good.
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

1			BROTHER MI CHAEL REYNOLDS	HAVING BEEN SWORN WAS
2			EXAMINED, AS FOLLOWS, BY	MR. McGOVERN
3				
4			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sit down, Br. Reynolds.
5				Thank you very much.
6			MR. McGOVERN:	Good morning, Br. Reynolds.
7		A.	Good morning.	
8	1	Q.	I understand that you are	e the Deputy Leader of
9			St. Mary's Province in Li	rel and?
10		A.	That's correct.	
11	2	Q.	One of two provinces of the Christian Brothers?	
12		A.	Yes.	
13	3	Q.	You were appointed to the	e province leadership team in
14			March 1998 and then to the	ne position of Deputy Leader
15			in April 2002?	
16		A.	That's correct, yes.	
17	4	Q.	I think you have been in	strumental in preparing a
18			statement to the Commissi	on, is that right?
19		A.	Yes, correct.	
20	5	Q.	That sets out in broad to	erms the position of the
21			Christian Brothers on the	e issues which have arisen
22			giving rise to this Commi	ission's work?
23		A.	Yes.	
24	6	Q.	Can I ask you were you yo	ourself at any time in Artane
25			as a Brother doing work	there?
26		A.	No, not in the industrial	school, no.
27	7	Q.	I think you are familiar	with the layout?
28		A.	I am familiar with the bu	uildings and the place as it
29			is now. As it was within	n 12 years of its closing,

- from there on I was familiar with it for a number of years.
- 3 8 Q. On the first page of your statement you say that the 4 contents of the submission is based on certain 5 material, would you tell the Commission what that 6 material was?
- 7 The main sources are the archives of the Christian Α. 8 Brothers, but the province archives which are located 9 on the North Circular Road in the Provincial 10 Headquarters and the archives in Rome. All of the 11 documentation used has already been discovered to the 12 In addition to that, speaking to Commission. 13 Brothers and others who worked there, including 14 former residents, and from various other documents I 15 have referred to that are in the public domain and so 16 on, and various other reports with which people are 17 familiar.
- 18 9 Q. In compiling this submission and in making some of 19 the comments that it does make, was any regard had to 20 the written complaints which were submitted by any 21 former residents in Artane?
- A. Let's say it was written in the consciousness of all
 of these but not specifically in relation to any
 individual complaints. I would be reasonably
 familiar with the overall picture also that is
 presented in the complaints, yes.
- 27 10 Q. You make comment about newspaper reports and radio 28 and television reports. What is your general comment 29 and the comment of the Christian Brothers with regard

1 to media reports in recent times on Artane?

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

11 Q.

Α. My general view on that is that from the late 1980's onwards the picture that was presented at Artane was one that was predominantly negative and I would certainly say that the record shows that that is not I would say it was seriously unbalanced and I would say that it probably in a sense has conditioned the public mind, the mind of the public to that. Certainly the main tenor of my submission would be that taken in the round and in the whole Artane was quite a positive place that made a great contribution to people who were in need. That is not in any way to belittle -- certainly the Congregation does not wish to add hurt to anybody who was abused there, we apologised for that in March 1998 and we repeat that apology to anybody who has been abused. Nonethel ess, I think there is need for balance at this stage because the Congregation's position is that Artane in the whole and in the round was a very positive institution.

Your statement is a lengthy one and I am not going to take you verbatim through it. Obviously the Commissioners have the statements and will consider everything that is in it. There are certain aspects of the contents of the submissions which I would like to take you through and there are some areas, such as funding, which have already been covered to a certain extent in the public hearing in Letterfrack, also involving the Christian Brothers. There are certain

1 particular details you might want to address with 2 regard to that. I think one of the concerns that the 3 Brothers have that emerges from the submission is to contextualise the various matters which have been 4 complained of, is that correct? 5 6 A. Correct. I think it is very difficult for everybody 7 in the sense that Artane, as you have already said, 8 closed on 30th June 1969, which is quite some time 9 So the lapse of time alone makes it difficult 10 to present a picture. The picture of Artane that is 11 presented and is now in the public mind to a large 12 extent does not help. A lot of the Brothers who 13 worked there are now deceased and, therefore, we 14 haven't the benefit of their direct evidence. of those who are still alive are well advanced in 15

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

16

17

The other concerns we would have is that in relation to all of this, it is almost putting an onus on people to prove their innocence, which is really an inversion of the normal process. Therefore, it makes everybody's task, including the task of the Committee, quite difficult.

and the 1950's. Even the 1960's is a long time back.

They are people who worked there in the 1940's

A Lot

25

26

27

28

29

The other thing in relation to context is that many of the attitudes and behaviours that were acceptable at that time in the 1940's, 1950's and 1960's would now not be acceptable, and I accept that. I instance 1 in the submission the industrial school system itself 2 is now gone, but it was the system of the time with 3 its imperfections and so on. The other one I instance is corporal punishment that at that time was 4 common enough in family homes, in schools and so on, 5 and that now has been abolished in schools in Ireland 6

since 1982 and obviously is not acceptable, but

8 within its time it was part of the system 9 12 0. Allowing for that, if I might generalise for a

10 moment, what is the position of the Christian 11 Brothers regarding the complaints that there was 12 excessive corporal punishment and that there was 13 sexual abuse? Without asking you to agree that every 14 complaint was valid, in overall terms what is the 15 position of the Christian Brothers?

> The position of the Christian Brothers is that there Α. were instances of both perpetrated by individual people, but the overall picture that has been given of Artane as an abusive institution is not correct. in fact the opposite is the case.

We will come back to this in more detail later 13 Q. obviously, but to try and get some general observations out of the way first of all. your statement and submission is divided into a 25 number of areas. The first deals with the early years and then you deal with management and administration, funding and finance, admission and daily routine, and discharge procedures in Artane?

A. Yes.

7

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

26

27

28

29

- 1 14 Q. Then issues of general welfare, such as food and
- 2 health issues, then education and then you deal with
- a special inspection in December 1962, which was an
- 4 inspection Archbishop McQuaid had put in place which
- 5 the Christian Brothers were unaware of at the time?
- 6 A. Yes, it was an inspection that the Department of
- 7 Education put in place as a result of events.
- 8 15 Q. Of course, you are quite right. The Archbishop had
- 9 set up an investigation unknown to the Brothers and
- then following on that, there was another
- investigation by the Department?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 16 Q. We will be coming back to that. Then you deal with
- the issue of deaths of boys in Artane in the period
- 15 under review?
- 16 A. Yes.
- 17 17 Q. Then the final years and closure. Your last section
- deals with the issues of both physical and sexual
- 19 abuse?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 18 Q. Just to go to the particular areas of the statement
- 22 and submission, can I ask you this; in general terms
- was the somewhat potted history and brief history
- 24 which I gave of the institution correct? Was there
- anything you would disagree with in terms of the
- 26 chronology of events?
- 27 A. No, I think that is fine.
- 28 19 Q. We know it started around the time Archbishop Cullen
- 29 asked the Brothers to get involved and it ended in

1 1969?

- A. In the early years the Brothers already had the property in Artane, it was intended for a novitiate and a training house for the Brothers. When the request came from Cardinal Cullen, the proposals in relation to the novitiate were shelved and the property was then used for the industrial school.
- 8 20 Q. Yes. The school was there to provide education, I
 9 think, up to Primary Cert Level and then some further
 10 education evolved as well, is that right?
- 11 Α. Yes, I would say there were three things. There was a formal primary school, which would be the same as 12 13 any national school throughout the country and was 14 under the Department of Education and so on and subject to Department of Education rules and 15 16 regulations for primary school and for inspections. 17 Then there was a trades training section or 18 department, not a vocational school, but a training 19 in trades. In addition to that, there was, I would 20 say, part of the training in Artane was for the 21 welfare, care and the health and so on of the pupils, 22 and there was a lot of emphasis at that stage on physical care, on matters of hygiene and so on, on a 23 24 way of life and practice of life and on seeking to be 25 good at whatever you were doing. That sort of 26 character building was very much a part of it as well 27 and, I would say, was characteristic of Artane, and 28 it is referred to frequently in the submission.
- 29 21 Q. On page 9 of your submission you deal with the

subject of management and administration. You say that on the establishment of Saorstát Éireann, the Department of Local Government and later the Department of Justice became responsible for the administration of industrial schools?

6 A. Yes.

27

28

29

7 22 Q. Then this task was passed on in 1924 to the 8 Department of Education?

9 A. That's correct, yes.

10 23 Q. Did that remain the position?

11 Α. Yes, it remained the position. My understanding is, 12 and I am not as well up on the legalities of it as 13 obviously yourself and other people, that the 14 Department of Health would have responsibility for 15 health and particularly for contagious diseases like 16 tubercul osis and so on. Generally speaking the main 17 agent of the Government that was dealing with Artane 18 was the Department of Education under two branches; 19 the Primary School branch which dealt literally with the primary school in Artane, as it did with any 20 21 other primary school in the area, and the Industrial 22 School section which dealt with all other aspects of 23 the institution.

24 Q. You then deal with the issue of local management of 25 the school. I think the day to day management was 26 the responsibility of the Resident Manager?

A. Yes, the overall responsibility was that of the Resident Manager, in other words, on the day to day basis, the buck stopped with him. Then within each

- section, primary school, the trades, the farm, the band, the infirmary and so on. There was a person in charge of managing that and reporting, as it were, in management terms to the Resident Manager. On the
- ground they ran their thing and he was the overall boss, as it were.
- 7 25 Q. Was the Resident Manager invariably a Christian 8 Brother?
- 9 A. Yes, for the total period.
- 10 26 Q. How would he be appointed?
- 11 A. He was appointed by the Provincial Council normally 12 for a period of six years.
- 13 27 Q. What other people would be in the hierarchy of management of the school?
- 15 Α. One I think that is possibly sometimes neglected was 16 he had a bursar who looked after all that end of 17 things, because obviously all of that area had to be 18 catered for and accounts were kept and so on. Then 19 you had the principal of the primary school. principal of the primary school was exactly the same 20 as the principal of any other primary school at the 21 22 time or, for that matter, the principal of the 23 primary school now. There was no Board of 24 Management. At that stage in all primary schools 25 there was a system of unitary management. In other 26 words, an individual was a manager, and that was the 27 Resident Manager and he was also the manager of the 28 For the running of the institution primary school. 29 outside of primary school, you had a person known as

- the "disciplinarian" and his role was also a Brother
- 2 for the entire duration of the period of relevance
- 3 here, also for that 30 year period. He was
- 4 responsible for the day to day management of the
- 5 students outside of school hours. So for the total
- time outside of school hours, he was the person in
- 7 charge there.
- 8 28 Q. I think he was responsible for the general welfare
- 9 and safety of the boys in all matters other than
- 10 educational and medical matters?
- 11 A. Yes, correct, and for supervision and so on. To an
- 12 extent if somebody was injured in the yard, or
- 13 whatever it was, then that child was referred to the
- infirmary.
- 15 29 Q. To go back to the Resident Manager for a moment, was
- the Resident Manager a member then of an Association
- of Resident Managers of industrial reformatory
- 18 school s?
- 19 A. Yes, he was the Resident Manager for all the duration
- and for quite an amount of the time was an executive
- 21 member as well. He was also the superior of the
- 22 Local community of Christian Brothers. Then there
- 23 was an Association of Managers of Industrial Schools
- 24 under the management of the Christian Brothers, a
- 25 smaller and less formal one than the Association of
- 26 Resident Managers of Industrial and Reformatory
- 27 Schools. It really met once or twice a year,
- 28 normally it met in the morning prior to the afternoon
- 29 meeting of the Resident Manager.

- 1 30 Q. What sort of things would be discussed at those meetings?
- A. Mainly looking through the minutes. Finance, unfortunately, was the main item on the agenda.
- 5 31 Q. In the national umbrella group, the Association of 6 Resident Managers of Industrial and Reformatory 7 Schools, what would they do?
- 8 In relation to all aspects of running an industrial Α. 9 school and particularly in matters that concerned the 10 Department of Education, it was a sort of umbrella 11 group. Rather than having the Department dealing 12 with each individual industrial school, they acted as 13 an umbrella group for the managers of industrial 14 schools and they dealt with all areas of relevance. 15 Again, finance forms a large portion of the minutes 16 of those meetings.
- 17 32 Q. What about the teaching staff in Artane?
- 18 Α. Up to about 1947 the teaching staff consisted of 19 20 something Brothers and then up to I think 46 or 47, there were six lay staff as well on the primary 20 21 Generally they were phased out. school. From there 22 on in, from 1947 until it closed, it was practically 23 all Brothers with the exception from 1966 or 1967 24 afterwards in which a remedial teacher was appointed 25 to the staff of the primary school. She was the only 26 lay person on the staff at that stage, the rest were 27 all Brothers.
- 28 33 Q. At the top of page 12 of the submission, you give 29 some indication of the workload of the Brothers'

1 teachi ng.

2 A. Yes.

3 34 Q. Could you just tell the Commission about that?

The teaching Brothers were also responsible for 4 Α. supervision. Whereas, the disciplinarian had overall 5 6 responsibility for supervising people, obviously one 7 person wasn't going to be able to supervise anything 8 ranging from 400 to 800, depending on the students in 9 There was a rota of Brothers who the vard. 10 supervised during break times and so on, who 11 supervised the dormitories in the morning when the 12 children were rising, at night when they went there 13 and prior to going to bed and preparations and so on, 14 and a supervision rota for that as well, then the 15 dining room. All aspects of supervision required the 16 assistance of the other Brothers and that mainly was 17 the lot of the teaching Brothers simply because they 18 were active and young and able for it. Essentially 19 they were providing what was almost a 24 hour seven 20 day a week service.

21 35 Q. Did they get any holidays?

22 A. They did, they would have got a month's holidays in 23 each summer and shorter breaks during Christmas and 24 Easter.

25 36 Q. I would like you to comment on an item that appears 26 in one of the visitation reports, this would be a 27 report of the Christian Brothers' own inspectorate 28 who would visit from time to time. It is at page 58 29 of that book of documents you have. One of the 1 comments made in this particular report, which is 2 dated May 1968, just a year before it closed, it 3 says:

4

5

6

7

8

9

"There was a feeling among them that we do the work, that it has some basis. It does not help that some of the senior Brothers have little sympathy for the younger Brothers who have very long hours in a very wearying day's work for the most part seven days a week. They have some justification for their belief that they are being watched and criticised by the older non-teaching Brothers."

11

10

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This suggests that within the community themselves some of them felt they had a very heavy workload.

- They had a very heavy workload, that is true. Α. think the reference there was, and I referred to it in some other section of the submission, that a lot of the older brothers who had retired and so on, they were still people who looked back to the Artane of the 1940's and the 1950's, and when the younger generation then were moving along and did bring in change bit by bit, sometimes it was resisted because people thought that the system that they knew was tried and tested and that it shouldn't be changed, and so on. As you can see from the submission, gradually change did come in and significant change in the late 1950's and early 1906's and right through the 1960's.
- 29 37 Q. The disciplinarian also had a very onerous day, would

Yes. 2 Α. 3 0. You talk about this in the summary at the end of 38 4 paragraph 2.6 of the submission. 5 A. Yes. 6 39 0. It is on page 13. You say: 7 "The role was an onerous one because of the many and varied duties associated with the post." 8 9 10 11 Α. Yes. 12 Q. Did that impose any stresses or strains on the 40 13 disciplinarian, do you think? Well, on individuals obviously I don't know because I 14 Α. 15 don't know the individuals, but it certainly was an 16 onerous task, the same as the principal ship of the 17 school, either primary or secondary, is an onerous 18 The disciplinarian was responsible for order 19 and safety, for organising home visits, for organising Godparents, for ensuring that boys didn't 20 The one thing I want to say 21 abscond, for discipline. is that in one sense it is a misnomer because the 22 23 issuing of sanctions wasn't the primary role of the 24 disciplinarian, the primary role of the

1

25

26

27

28

29

that be right?

and so on, but that wasn't the primary role.

disciplinarian was the care and welfare of the pupils

outside of school time. It did, of course, entail

dealing with recalcitrance and issuing punishments

discipline in question was a positive discipline

1 rather than a negative one.

affairs.

- 2 41 Q. Yes. I think there were other administrative staff
- in Artane as well, the trades area, the farm, the
- 4 ki tchen?
- 5 A. Yes.

18

19

- 6 42 Q. The band and the infirmary, they all had designated people to run those?
- 8 Α. Some of these, their management role would They had. 9 be smaller than in others. Obviously there was a 10 farm manager, who was a Brother, whose role was a 11 very significant one. The Brother in charge of the 12 band was strictly an administrative role, not a 13 musical one as such. There were musical directors 14 and so on and teachers who taught music. The same in 15 the infirmary, there was a Brother who generally 16 looked after the nuts and bolts issues in the 17 infirmary, but you had the medical officer, the
- 20 43 Q. What forms of inspections was the school subject to?

doctor and the nurse who looked after all the medical

- A. Three really, three forms of inspection. Number one, from the Department of Education, the primary school
- was under the normal inspection of the Department of
- 24 Education for Primary Schools. They were really
- 25 three types of inspection. You had a general
- inspection in primary schools where an inspector or a
- group of inspectors came to a school and spent a
- period of a day, two days, three days a week,
- depending on the size of the school. All classrooms

were visited and so on. Teachers were inspected at their work and all the various documentation was inspected, at the end of which a general report was issued. They inspected individuals then who were in their first year of teaching after completing training college. You had to do a two year probationary period really and there were inspections during that, at the end of which you were certified as a qualified national teacher. Then there were casual inspections. An inspector was advised to spend about a fortnight a year in his district calling into schools and so on.

In relation to the other half of the Department then, you had inspections by the Department of Education's Industrial School branch. From my reading of the documentation, it would appear that the medical section of that was carried out well and vigorously, but there seems to be little evidence that any other aspect of the institution was adequately inspected by the Department. I would have to say the primary school one, there is plenty of evidence there that it was inspected quite well. I would say in relation to the Department of Education and the institution, that included medical issues as in strict illnesses or injuries, general health, food and clothing, but I would say other aspects of it were not well, and that is referred to in the Kennedy Report and I think the Kennedy Report stated that the experience of other

European countries would show that you would need at least six people in Ireland to provide that type of inspection that was needed.

The third time was there was an inspection by the Congregation visitor. The Congregation visitor was a member of either the Provincial or the general Council who came along and also spent, again depending on the size of the community and the ministries that were going on there, anything from three or four days to a week or more. His role was a double role; it was pastoral on one level, he would have met all the Brothers and met the community and so on, but it was definitely inspectorial in relation both to the religious observance in the community and in relation then to the operation of any ministries that were there, which included personnel, how the work was done, buildings and general conditions.

I think it is true to say, when one goes through the visitation reports, that occasionally there would be criticisms made of a particular Brother, this is within the Order?

23 A. Yes.

24 45 Q. Of Christian Brothers themselves, that they would
25 make criticisms of a Brother if he wasn't adhering to
26 his religious vocation properly or practices, or if
27 he was too strict or harsh on the boys, is that
28 right?

A. Correct, and I give some examples of that.

- 1 46 Q. Yes.
- 2 A. The visitation itself was a rigorous exercise through
- 3 which the Congregation carried out what it saw as its
- 4 role in ensuring that everything was as it should be,
- 5 both within the community itself and within the
- 6 school or whatever institution was in question.
- 7 There was a report written which didn't come back to
- 8 the community, it went to the relevant Council, the
- 9 Provincial Council. A covering letter came back to
- the superior or manager highlighting some of the
- positives, but generally highlighting the negatives
- and the things that needed to be attended to. There
- was follow up on those to ensure that it happened.
- 14 47 Q. Do you think the follow up was adequate?
- 15 A. I would say in general yes, in other instances no. A
- 16 I of that would depend on the individual person.
- 17 In some that I could point out, I would certainly say
- in one that I quote, the 1952 visitation report was
- 19 certainly one that was carried out that I have quoted
- quite liberally on, in which a lot of views were
- 21 expressed and I would say it was responsible for a
- 22 I of the discussion that took place among the
- 23 Brothers themselves through the 1950's and eventually
- led to significant changes in the running of the
- institution.
- 26 48 Q. Do you think that the suitability of a Brother to
- 27 remain in the school would be something that would be
- 28 addressed in these reports and followed up?
- 29 A. It would, and I have no doubt that Brothers were

ı		changed out. I have read all the reports and reading
2		through them, one of the things I said to myself at
3		times was that if the visitor was putting that in
4		writing now about a Brother, he might want to consult
5		his legal advisers before he would write some of the
6		things that are written.
7	49 Q.	I want to draw your attention to one such matter, and
8		before the Chairman gets too apprehensive, it is
9		redacted, there is no name in it. At page 48 of the
10		book which you have there, there is a visitation
11		report for 1958/59, and below the heading "Poultry
12		Farm" the next heading says:
13		
14		"The arrival of Brother, who is a
15		mental case, created the problem of trying to get him something to do."
16		
17		Then he lists a few different catastrophes he was
18		involved in.
19		
20		Then if one moves on to page 51 in that book, you
21		will find another reference in the second paragraph
22		on that page:
23		
24		"Brother is seemingly a mental case and it is very difficult to place him."
25		and it is very difficult to prace mim.
26		
27		If you go on to the next page, page 52, that is a
28		visitation in 1963, some considerable time later. I
29		know it is not entirely helpful because the names of

the Brothers who were there at the time are blanked out, but you may take it from me that that Brother's name is still there as a member of the Congregation in 1963, having been referred to in those less than flattering terms in 1958/59.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

A.

I would say a number of things about it. First of all, obviously I know who the Brother was, I knew the Brother and I would not agree with the description of the visitor, but so be it. Secondly, I would say that he wasn't a teaching Brother and I don't think the criticism was in relation to the mental soundness I think the main criticism was here of the person. was somebody that was sent in and he does not seem to be able to fulfill any role, so essentially I think the visitation report said that he was a negative quantity in the place. I would take that certainly I presume not in the community and from religious observance, but from the point of view that his work rate wasn't very good and his contribution wasn't adequate in the eyes of the visitor. As you wisely say, why not take him out. The simple fact of the matter was he was left there, they tried him in a number of situations, they didn't work and eventually he was moved on. During part of that time incidentally, the Brother in question was studying in university, he wasn't a full-time member of the staff.

28 50 Q. I will be coming back to this later, Brother. There
29 are examples of some Brothers who were there a very

1 long time, some as long as 30 years, not many, but 2 there are some there over 20 years, 25 years or 3 years. Was there any fixed policy in the 4 Christian Brothers about ensuring a regular

turnaround of Brothers?

5

- There wasn't, I would say, in relation to industrial 6 A. 7 and residential schools, because people with 8 experience and who were seen to be successful were 9 left there. I think it is also worth noting that 10 many of the primary and secondary school principals 11 nowadays are also there in that once you go into the 12 job, that is it, and there is no system of 13 sabbaticals or anything like there, you are there in 14 the job for that duration.
- 15 51 Q. I am not suggesting that there wasn't a regular
 16 turnaround, because we have been furnished with the
 17 dates when Brothers were there, and they clearly show
 18 that a great many of them were there only for two or
 19 three years at a time. I am just wondering was there
 20 any policy on this?
- 21 From reading it I would say the teaching Brothers A. 22 were probably transferred more frequently and moved along, but part of the reason for that was that the 23 24 system within the Brothers was you had a primary 25 school in Artane and the system within the Brothers 26 at that stage was, and right up until recent enough 27 times, that every Brother who trained as a teacher 28 trained first as a primary school teacher and then 29 the decision afterwards as to whether or not he

wanted to move to secondary school or remain in primary was largely left to himself. Those who were moving, who were deciding they were going to go would be applying to go to university and so on, and they would be moved rather more quickly so that they would attend studies and move into secondary school. the principals, all of the them -- well, not all, and I am trying to think of names at the minute, but most of the primary school principals were there for a longer duration, but they were also people who were committing their lives to primary school education

and hadn't any desire to move out of it.

- The next section of the submission deals with funding and finance. Chairman and Members of the Committee, I propose briefly to go through this, but I think there is a general acceptance -- maybe that is too strong a word -- but the level of funding here was way below what it was in other jurisdictions in the neighbouring islands and in Northern Ireland, isn't that correct?
 - A. That's correct. The Kennedy Report itself said that the level of funding of institutions was seriously inadequate. On Table 1 on page 20 I have given there the maintenance grants about half of which was coming from the Government and the other from the local authority. If you take 1950 when the total grant coming in for the institution was 19 shillings, and we are back to that type of money, 19 shillings in Artane. In England it was £5-4s-9p. In Scotland it

1 was £4.15 and in Northern Ireland it was £4, which is 2 more than a factor of four. That is not even, as I 3 pointed out in some of the tables later on, that is not comparing like with like, because in Northern 4 5 Ireland there was a salary for the Resident Manager, there was a salary for the Assistant Resident Manager 6 7 paid directly by the Ministry, there was a salary for 8 the Principal of the primary school, there was a 9 salary for the cook, there was a salary for the band

master and there was a salary for the carpenter in

12 53 Q. You show these in a table on page 22?

trades.

13 A. I do.

10

11

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

14 54 Q. None of these would have been paid as extras in the 15 Republic at that time?

> Α. That's correct. On page 23 I put figures on them, because the reason that that information is there is that we have documentation on file from the Resident Manager at the time, who obviously had been talking to a resident manager of a similar certified school in Northern Ireland and had got the rates from them, and he sent those to the Provincial. What I did was I took them at the 1967 level where there were 272 pupils in Artane and I applied the Northern Ireland rates to those 272, I applied the actual Artane rates. I am not going to go down through them, but the sum total under the Northern Ireland system Artane would have been getting £209,904, but under the system in Artane, Artane got £73,991, so

1			you are almost talking to	a factor of three.
2	55	Q.	Yes, there was a deficit	of £127,000 nearly?
3		A.	Yes.	
4			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Mr. McGovern, I am not
5				inclined to get into this
6			too much. I appreciate t	that the Christian Brothers
7			say, 'look, we were under	-funded, we didn't have
8			enough money,' and we kno	ow from other institutions
9			that there is a degree of	controversy about whether
10			the money was properly sp	pent and all that. That is
11			an issue and we have expe	erts looking at that. In
12			fact, if I am not mistake	en, they may actually at the
13			moment be looking at Arta	ne and seeing what was. It
14			is probably better to wai	t and see what they come up
15			with. Obviously whatever	views they express and
16			whatever information they	get has to be validated,
17			and that is another day's	s work. It is probably best
18			to take it as a general p	proposition that the
19			Christian Brothers say, '	look, we think there is a
20			big issue here.' I don't	think anybody will have any
21			dispute that there is a b	oig issue as to financing and
22			just acknowledge it, mark	cit, but it is probably best
23			not to get into it in any	real detail, if that is
24			sati sfactory.	
25			MR. McGOVERN:	Very good, I will move on
26				then.
27			THE CHAIRPERSON:	It is not a criticism, I am
28				glad that you flagged the
29			issue. People should kno	ow that that is the

1			si tuati on.	
2			MR. McGOVERN:	I am grateful for that and
3				the Commissioners have, of
4			course, got all the tab	oles and the information before
5			them. Just one other t	thing(INTERJECTION).
6			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sorry, can I just say, it
7				gives me the opportunity to
8			let people know that it	is not something that we are
9			trying to hack through	ourselves and do, we have
10			asked experts to look a	at this area.
11	56	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	One matter before we move
12				on from this, I think to
13			some extent Artane had	certain activities which
14			helped fund the school	like with the farm and maybe
15			the band, I don't know?	?
16		A.	The farm, the band and	the trades to a certain
17			extent, but each of the	ose ran at a trading loss to
18			take it in strict finar	ncial terms, none of them were
19			self-sufficient, and at	t a trading loss before
20			salaries were taken int	to account. Their main purpose
21			was to provide people w	with training. A significant
22			contribution of the far	rm in Artane was it provided
23			food for the table and	that is not in the figures
24			here. The figures here	e that I have presented in the
25			submission really only	deal with cash values.
26	57	Q.	Moving on to the next s	section of the Christian
27			Brothers' submission wh	nich deals with the admission
28			and daily routine in Ar	rtane and the discharge
29			procedures. You point	out on page 33 the vast

- 1 majority of those admitted came from Dublin, over 70%
- of the boys admitted between 1870 and 1968 were from
- 3 Dublin?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 58 Q. A further 18% from the rest of Leinster?
- 6 A. Yes.
- 7 59 Q. I think that a decision had been made in 1954 not to
- 8 continue taking people who were guilty of criminal
- 9 offences and it was only for issues of neglect?
- 10 A. That's right, the Congregation made that decision,
- but obviously it had the approval of the Department
- of Justice and the Department of Education because
- the system operated. In other words, from that time
- on young people guilty of criminal offences were not
- 15 submitted. The other thing I would say in relation
- to that is that it was a decision in one sense that
- 17 was ahead of its time, because in 1970 Kennedy Report
- the report also stated that offenders and
- 19 non-offenders should not be accommodated in the same
- 20 home. It was accepted, even in 1969, that the
- 21 decision was correct.
- 22 60 Q. When boys were admitted, they were assigned to a
- dormitory, given new clothes and an opportunity to
- shower. Then they were assigned to the primary
- school, is that right?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 61 Q. How would they be assigned in school?
- 28 A. They were assessed. The principal assessed
- 29 youngsters when they came in and they were assigned

in school according to the level of attainment on entry, not according to age. A major difficulty in relation to Artane, as distinct from other primary schools, was they were coming in at various times of the year, at various ages and at various levels of There is a table to show the level of attainment. attainment, for obvious reasons, because of previous school experience or lack of it and because of socio-economic background, they obviously weren't coming in well educated and so on. In fact, they were put into classes according to ability. assessed, but it had to be returned. The results of those assessments had to be returned to the Department of Education on Return B of the judicial statistics which was sent in every year, and the principal carried out the assessment. I can't tell you what standardised tests were used or if standardised tests were used, but certainly an assessment was carried out. The only reference I could find where there was an early one was in 1939 there is a reference in the visitation report to say that the principal assessed them and that there was written and oral assessment, and that not only were the written papers of the pupils kept, but a written account of their answers to the oral questions were also retained. Unfortunately, they weren't retained until the current table, but they were retained in the office at the time.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

62 Q. Did a different system operate where the assignment

of boys to dormitories were concerned?

2 A. Yes.

3 63 Q. I think they were assigned by need?

- Yes, again for obvious reasons, they were assigned to 4 Α. The younger ones were on the first floor, the 5 older ones were on the second floor for reasons that 6 7 are reasonably obvious, safety and horseplay and 8 everything else and people going to dormitories. You 9 wouldn't want nine year olds and fourteen year olds 10 sharing the same dormitory or moving to the same 11 dormi tory. So they were done according to age.
- 12 64 Q. When boys were admitted, what sort of documentation 13 was the school given providing information about 14 them?
- 15 Α. As far as I can make out, very little, though I give 16 on page 34 a brief section of an interview that was 17 given on RTÉ, I think around 1986 or 1987, where a former resident of Artane described in an RTÉ radio 18 19 programme what happened on admission. He said documentation was presented, though the Cussen Report 20 21 in 1936 had suggested that all information in 22 relation to the medical condition of people and so on 23 should be submitted prior to any order being made. 24 It wasn't even arriving as it transpired after the 25 order had been made, and there was a certain amount 26 of disputation about that between the Department and 27 the industrial schools, and they came to an 28 agreement. That would have been in Form A. They 29 came to an agreement in 1944 or 1945 that the

1 Department would submit the original Form A when they

2 had it to the school, the school copied it. I

3 presume there had to be a manual copy as this

4 pre-dated any sort of technological copy, and then

they returned the original. Other than that, as far

6 as I can see, there was no information supplied.

- 7 65 Q. On the issue of supervision of boys, you talk about 8 the Resident Manager's role, he was responsible for 9 their care and welfare?
- 10 A. Yes.

- 11 66 Q. There was a system of monitors, could you tell us 12 something about that?
- 13 The monitor system was somewhat similar to the Α. 14 prefect system that was in operation in a lot of 15 boarding schools at the time. The monitors were 16 older boys who were trusted boys and so on and who 17 were judged to be people capable of this. The total 18 school was divided up into groups of about 40 and 19 there was a monitor in charge of each group. that was used was as follows. 20 Take for granted, 21 let's say, 600 youngsters in the yard and they had to 22 move to the dining room. They were playing around 23 the yard and so on and the time came to move to the 24 dining room, then the disciplinarian blew the whistle 25 to give the signal that it was time to move. 26 then lined up in front of the primary school in their 27 divisions and the monitors brought them into the 28 dining room, they sat at the tables and then food was 29 The same when they were going to the served.

- dormitories; they lined up and so on, and they were brought to the dormitories. It was really a matter of order and safety and so on.
- 4 67 Q. You talk about the recreation that was available
 5 there and there were the usual games. Then there was
 6 the band which, of course, is famous and has been for
 7 years?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 68 Q. Then there were musicals and other stage productions as well?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 69 Q. And things of that nature.
- 13 I think the musicals in some of the reports, the Α. musicals in the 1940's and later in the late 1950's 14 15 or in the 1960's were open to the public. You had 16 public personages there by invite, but they were open 17 to the public and they were reported on in the local 18 press. In reporting on a musical that was staged in 19 1944, one of the papers said that precision which is the hallmark of everything that this institution or 20 21 this school turns its hand to was a very pleasant 22 aspect of the production, and went on to talk about 23 exits and entrances and so on that could be a lesson 24 to many an amateur producer. There was a high level 25 of work put into that. Included in that the school 26 also participated in school games and competed in the 27 primary school competitions and, in fact, certainly 28 right through the 1940's dominated the hurling and 29 the football, winning the premier trophies in both

1 for quite a number of years in the 1940's. I think 2 they were a victim in the sense of their success 3 because for some years in the 1950's, they were excluded, but they got their way back in. 4 5 early 1960's they won the premier football 6 competition among all primary schools in Dublin for 7 six years in succession. In a sense, that didn't 8 happen without people having ample time to practice, 9 teams being picked, people being trained and skills

being honed and so on. All of that went on.

11 12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

27

10

As well as that, from 1948 it started, and I am not sure when it finished, there was a covered area in the yard for playing games, I would say really mainly for playing football or whatever it was, and that was moved afterwards and a games room added to it. You also had films once a week. There was a tiered theatre in Artane which was used for the stage productions but also was used as a cinema. Then in the mid-1960's there was an indoor heated swimming pool built. You had television sets, I would say, I ong before -- well, because it was in Dublin, they were able to have television sets long before other parts of the country had any access to television.

25 70 Q. 26 Discipline is something you deal with on page 43 of the submission. You say the spirit of discipline and diligence pervaded in the Artane campus.

- 28 A. Yes.
- 29 71 Q. You go on to say:

1				
2			"Such regimentation wa	s not looked on
3			"Such regimentation wa as punishment but was positive aspect of tra and the promotion of s	ining of the boys
4			and the promotion of s	err-arscrprrne.
5				
6			There is an article which	is in one of the documents
7			here, there were a series	of articles on child
8			delinquency in industrial	schools. If I could draw
9			your attention to page 22	of the book of documents.
10			I am afraid I don't know	the newspaper nor who the
11			special correspondent is.	
12			THE CHAIRPERSON:	It looks like The Irish
13				Times.
14	72	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	Yes, it looks like it. On
15				page 22 at the bottom of
16			the page on the Left unde	r the heading "The Object",
17			it says:	
18				
19			"The aim of any instit therefore be to stimul	ution should
20			condi ti ons. "	ate nome
21				
22			I presume they mean 'simu	late'.
23				
24			"Ours do nothing of th	e kind. They are
25			"Ours do nothing of th usually without any ho whatsoever. Why? Par	tly because the
26			Government will not an orders cannot provide	the money to
27			convert them and partl grown accustomed to th	y because we have
28			cannot see how disastr	e system and ously had it is
20			cannot see how disastr Take the case of Artan	ously bad it is. e, the best known
29			cannot see how disastr	ously bad it is. e, the best known ols. It holds building. The

cots spaced mathematically over the inadequate floor space. Their whole life is communal; meals in a huge hall, play in a big concrete waste. Nothing could be further from family life. Artane is within its limitations a good school."

5

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α.

1

2

3

4

It does go on to say that, that the vocational training they receive is excellent and so on, and that their health is well looked after. The point this writer seems to be making is that the whole system within the industrial school system itself, and in Artane in particular, would have been very much against what you would find in a home environment, it was so regimented from the time the boys got up to the time they went to bed. Was this a good thing or not, or was any thought given to that? It was, and it is referred to again in the 1952 visitation report that I spoke about where the visitor said in the continuation of that particular passage that you are referring to, he said that it was a good school and that it turned the handicap of its size to its advantage. It also goes on to say that it ran an extremely good primary school, that the trades were good and so on. In a sense what it was talking about was the industrial school system, that was addressed and size was addressed in the visitation report of 1952 where the Brother said if the industrial school system was what you wanted,

get, and so on.

that Artane was as near to perfection as you could

At the end he did say within the

1 system and he did say that he had discussed that with 2 some of the Brothers in the community. I know that during the 1950's it was a matter of discussion with 3 the Brothers themselves and with the community, and 4 resulted in changes in which the school was divided into the seniors and the juniors and a person put in charge of each, and so on. Then as we moved into the 7 8 1960's, the whole discipline thing relaxed, but then 9 the numbers got smaller. 73 Q. I think the visitation report you refer to is on page 10 11 32, 33 and 34 of the book there that you have in front of you. At page 33, the reporter states at the 12 13 bottom: 15

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

"From rising until lights out, the boys are regimental under the watchful eyes are regimental under the watchful eyes of Brothers who are experts in their various duties, so that it becomes almost true to say that the boys are never called on to make decisions for themselves, even in small details, except at one moment in the day, the moment when they must decide to go or not to go to the altar for communion. Then one begins to wonder if it can be possible that this system, so perfect in itself is fundamentally all wrong from top to bottom."

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

It queries the whole notion of having freedom of choice and so on. Do you think this was something that wasn't understood properly at the time?

Α. I think the particular man, and again I have the advantage of knowing who he was and seeing some of the things he did and said, was a man ahead of his

1			time, because I would say	what he described there
2			belonged to an area in so	ciety where children were to
3			be seen and not heard. In	n one sense, other than its
4			size, that type of descrip	otion of children in school
5			or children in an institu	tion was no different from
6			what it was he was call	ing into question the
7			system and he said possibl	y that the system itself
8			was, I think the phrase he	e used was 'fundamentally
9			wrong from top to bottom,'	and that he had talked
10			about this to others. He	does go on to say at the
11			other end that the boys ap	opear to be in excellent
12			health, a attribute to the	e good food and regular
13			life. He talked about gre	eeting them and that
14			frequently they initiated	the thing with a 'cheery
15			good' morning or 'good eve	ening, Brother', or whatever
16			it was. In a sense the re	eport is balanced, but he
17			was calling the system in	to question without a doubt,
18			yes.	
19			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sorry, what is the page of
20				that? I lost it there.
21			MR. McGOVERN:	Pages 32 to 36, Chairman.
22			THE CHAIRPERSON:	That is 1952.
23			MR. McGOVERN:	Yes, 1952.
24		A.	Yes.	
25	74	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	Does anything happen as a
26				result of that, Brother?
27		A.	Yes.	
28	75	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	Does anybody follow it up
29				and say, 'yes, okay, you

ı			are right, or no, you are wrong, or does it just
2			rest there with somebody's comments that we disinter
3			now so many years later?
4		A.	I would say a bit of both. It certainly became a
5			topic of conversation among the Brothers themselves
6			and something that I referred to earlier, the younger
7			generation of Brothers that were coming in were
8			saying the place needs to be changed. There was a
9			certain amount of resistance, but that is not unusual
10			in organisations and particularly in organisations of
11			that size and educational organisations of that era.
12			It was certainly the late 1950's or 1960's before any
13			significant changes took place, I grant that, yes.
14			THE CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.
15	76	Q.	MR. McGOVERN: You deal with the issue of
16			corporal punishment on
17			page 44 of the submission, you say it was governed by
18			the rules and regulations for certified industrial
19			schools and the rules for national schools by the
20			acts of Provincial Chapter of the Congregation and by
21			circular letters issued from time to time by the
22			Superior General. Then you say:
23			
24			"The rules and regulations for industrial schools show that prior to
25			November 1946, a more severe level of punishment was permitted in an
26			industrial school than that permitted in national schools."
27			TH Hatt Onal Schools.
28			
29			You give examples of chastisement with a cane, strap

1		or b	irch was permissible, and caning on the hand was
2		forb	idden. Then you talk about the provision in the
3		rul e	s and regulations being amended, stating:
4			
5		11	In future in industrial schools
6		t	orporal punishment should be confined o the form usually employed in school,
7		n I	o the form usually employed in school, amely slapping on the open palm with a ight cane or strap."
8			
9		You	point out that this is slightly at variance with
10		the	instruction in the Department circular issued to
11		mana	gers of national schools which stated only a
12		ligh	t cane or rod may be used.
13	А	Yes.	
14	77 Q	Then	there is a further amendment that only a light
15		cane	, rod or leather strap maybe used for the purpose
16		of c	orporal punishment. You then set out a summary
17		whi c	h you have gleaned from internal documents of the
18		Cong	regation on this policy in relation to corporal
19		puni	shment during the period relevant to our
20		enqu	iries. You say:
21			
22			1. Corporal punishment should be
23		р	educed to a minimum. Corporal unishment should never be administered
24		C	or failure at lessons. Proper omportment, gravity and propriety
25		S	hould be observed in administering orporal punishment. The only form of orporal punishment authorises a
26		l	eather strap on the palm of the hand.
27		S	ertain form's of punishment such as arcasm or pushing a child away were
28		d	i scouraged. "

- Do you think that these ideals were adhered to in Artane?
- 3 Α. I would say they were certainly broken by some The only thing I can go on are 4 people, yes. visitation reports or inspectors' reports and there 5 6 is no doubt, and I have instanced them later on, that 7 there were instances of severe punishment. 8 talking to Brothers who worked there, their memory of 9 it now is that certainly within the school, that the 10 system of discipline in the school in Artane wasn't 11 any more strict than it was in the primary schools of 12 the country at the time. I am not saying by any 13 means that all of these were adhered to 100% because 14 any of us who went to primary school anywhere will 15 know that they weren't. For instance, punishment for 16 failure at lessons, that that certainly wasn't 17 adhered to, not only in Artane but I would say in a 18 lot of other primary schools throughout the country 19 as well.
- 20 78 Q. I am sure you are aware from the many many complaints 21 which have come in, there is a constant reference to 22 people being punished for failure at lessons and not 23 always punished in the manner which is permitted 24 under these rules or regulations or the principles 25 set out by the Congregation itself. Would you agree 26 with that, broadly speaking?
 - A. Certainly I would agree that the rules and regulations that were put as an ideal and that the Congregation were promoting weren't always adhered to

28

1			by people. I think if you go on to page 45, you will
2			see from the visitation reports the impression of the
3			vari ous vi si tors:
4			
5			"The disciplinarian is not severe but
6			and gets excellent results. Can
7			without having to make use of corporal
8			works on the character of the pupils and gets excellent results. Can maintain a high standard of discipline without having to make use of corporal punishment. In 1952 during my stay I never saw or heard of corporal punishment. Exit the chief
9			disciplinarian there is not much need for corporal punishment."
10			Tor corporar puri siment.
11			
12			That also is a trend that is true, so, in a sense, I
13			am left in the middle with a balance that I have one
14			group of people saying there was a lot of corporal
15			punishment and I have documentation saying there
16			wasn't. The reports of the national school
17			inspectors is closer to what the visitation report is
18			saying than what is in the complaints.
19	79	Q.	Yes, there is a quotation on page 46 of the
20			submission, it is from one of the inspectors and I
21			don't know if it is a medical inspector, I think it
22			may be?
23		A.	No, that is actually from the 1962 general
24			inspection, and it is from the Inspector from the
25			Industrial Schools Branch. He says that:
26			
27			"The school emerged very credibly from the inspection. No serious fault could
28			be found in Artane and the impression
29			of the big happy family atmosphere which pervaded the entire institution was inescapable."

2 80 Q. There is a quote earlier just above that saying:

3

4

6

7

1

"In Artane there is a very friendly relationship between the boys and the Brothers. All the boys spoken to were happy and cheerful and replied frankly to questions put whether the Superior was present or absent during the conversation."

8

9

Who is that quote ascribed to?

10 Α. I think that is the same person. Yes, it is, yes, 11 that is from the same person. I would also refer in that context to something I mentioned earlier on in 12 13 the radio interview where a former resident of Artane described that when he was finished whatever had to 14 15 be done in the office, he went out to the yard and he 16 met somebody who knew, or I would take it from 17 looking at it, he might have known at the time was a monitor who introduced him to the Brothers and all 18 19 the other staff, which wouldn't appear to me to be something that would happen in a very oppressive 20 institution, that one young fellow was bringing the 21 22 other and he mentions the drill master, the various 23 Brothers and so on, that he was brought around from 24 person to person and introduced to them by one of his 25 It doesn't sound to me like a place that was 26 Having said that, instances of extremely oppressive. 27 extreme punishment did take place, and I have some 28 documented later on.

number, and I don't think too small a number, of complainants who specifically say in their complaints that they were afraid to complain and, worse still, some of them say that when they did complain about certain things, be it physical or other forms of

abuse, that they were subsequently severely punished by the Brother they had complained against?

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

28

29

Α. I certainly haven't come across any evidence of that. I have come across evidence in the 1940's in relation to sexual abuse where boys made written statements of complaint. One of the people in question, the boy who obviously didn't feel up to writing it, dictated it to a Brother, it was written down and it was presented to the Resident Manager, investigated and action taken. On the one hand you have one group of people saying this didn't happen, but there is documentary evidence to say not just in relation to corporal punishment, but in relation to sexual abuse that complaints were made, and there is documentary evidence showing that they were made and that action was taken, that it was investigated and action was taken as a result.

23 82 Q. I just want to suggest to you, Brother, that while
24 undoubtedly those quotes exist and this is what these
25 people said, that the statements of complaint made by
26 quite a number of people would be very much at
27 variance with that picture, would you agree?

A. I would, and that is a matter obviously for another section of this investigation.

- 1 83 Q. Yes. You then have a section dealing with accidental
- injury, and I don't think anything significant turns
- 3 on that?
- 4 A. No.
- 5 84 Q. In the whole period we are concerned with, there were
- 6 13 accidental injuries?
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 85 Q. I think that number is small?
- 9 A. The reason I dealt with them there on that level is
- 10 because we submitted documentation to you documenting
- them, so I included them. There are two or three,
- maybe four, very serious ones, but cuts and bruises
- and bruises and people being dealt with and so on,
- and the general run of the thing.
- 15 86 Q. There is one matter which does arise there which I
- 16 would ask you to comment on. There are a number of
- 17 reports among the papers we have read which suggest
- that in relatively serious accidents, there was one
- 19 case where a boy had an injury at the top of his
- fingers and his fingernails were gone, and his
- 21 parents weren't told about this. I think there was
- 22 at Lease one case where parents were making enquiries
- about their child who had become ill or been injured
- and they were being fobbed off, I think is the only
- way to put it?
- A. There were certainly two cases of that, but in the
- 27 first one that you refer to where the person had some
- 28 sort of injury with a machine, the Resident Manager
- at the time, there was correspondence between the

1			Department and the Resident Manager afterwards, and
2			the Department pointing out that they had no
3			correspondence in relation to it and please explain,
4			and so on, which was their job. The reason the
5			Resident Manager gave was that the doctor had
6			examined it and said in fact that it wasn't a serious
7			injury. Unfortunately, as I say, and I deal with it
8			in it, I am not sure which one it is.
9	87	Q.	I think it is number 11 on page 50, it is at the
10			bottom of the page.
11		A.	If you see at the bottom of the page:
12			
13			"On receipt of the original letter from the Department of Education, the
14			Resi dent Manager replied that he had not notified the accident as the doctor
15			in the hospital had assured him that the injury was not serious and there
16			would be no permanent injury."
17			
18			I am not excusing it by that, I am saying that was
19			the Resident Manager's reply. Obviously the resident
20			manager had to make a call between what would be
21			called normal cuts and bruises with youngsters, do
22			you contact home in relation to every one of those or
23			do you not, and this is one in which I think the
24			Department of Education is telling him that he made
25			the wrong call.
26	88	Q.	I am not suggesting for one moment that for every
27			bump and bruise parents should be notified, but do
28			you think, having looked at the papers you have
29			looked at, that there is evidence there that in a lot

- of cases parents weren't told about either an illness or an injury when they ought to have been told?
- A. I am not sure I would say that, but certainly there
 are some and they are documented and we have supplied
 them. As I say, it was a call the Resident Manager
 had to make and in some instances it would appear
 from the documentation that the Department is saying
 to him or that others are saying to him, 'you didn't
 make the right call in relation to that one, that one
- was sufficiently serious to have been notified straightaway.'
- 12 89 Q. Moving on then to the discharging of pupils from
 13 Artane at page 53 of your submission. You point out
 14 that boys were usually committed to Artane for the
 15 maximum period, namely until their 16th birthday?
- A. By that I mean that was on their detention order, that was the date that was down, not necessarily that they remain there for that period.
- 19 90 Q. I presume the reason for that was it wasn't related 20 to any offence they would commit, it was for reasons 21 of keeping them in what we would now call 'care'?
- A. Yes, and it was normally their 16th birthday or date of birth that normally went down on the detention order.
- 25 91 Q. As we know and as you point out, many would have been 26 discharged to their parents prior to that for one 27 reason or another?
- A. Uh-huh.
- 29 92 Q. The main areas of employment in which pupils were

placed, you say, between 1940 and 1969 were farming, tailoring, shoe making, paging, weaving, dying, mechanics, hotel work, carpentry, messaging, gardening, factory work, baking and painting. With the exception of perhaps tailoring and carpentry, they all seem to be very unskilled and non-academic

7 types of work?

1

2

3

4

5

6

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α. Yes, with the exception maybe of the hotel and hospitality, and that came in late unfortunately when Artane was running a Cert course maybe for about two years before the place closed down, which was quite successful and a number of people were placed. would say tailoring again because the City & Guilds course was in tailoring and they were quite successful in that. What I would say is they hadn't a vocational school and if you compare that with the national school system at the time, people were coming out in or around the same age and going straight into work in the same type of work if they could get it, and I don't know what the retention rate was in relation to the work, but I do know that in 1956 the retention rate up to sixth class in primary schools was 56.1, which means another 44%, or whatever it is, had left the school before they reached sixth class without a Primary Cert and with no training in any skills or trade. At least the people in Artane, even though they hadn't a formal vocational school or second level school education, in the main they were leaving with some sort of

1 training and with something which equipped them to go 2 into work. There is one visitation report, and I 3 can't give you the reference off the top of my head at the moment, where the person in charge of 4 after-care had recorded that he had visited 5 6 200 pupils who had left over some period of time and 7 that only 18 of them at that stage were unemployed, 8 which means they were getting into employment. 9 the retention rate in the employment was I don't know

11 93 Q. I will come back to that in the section of your 12 submission dealing with education, but I want to 13 suggest to you that by and large they were very 14 unskilled types of work boys were going into?

A. Yes, but I am not sure that all the farmers would agree with you that farming is unskilled, however.

17 94 Q. I agree with you, I don't want to get into trouble
18 with any of the people, but we will come back to that
19 because there are some questions I want to ask you
20 about the education generally. Moving on to
21 after-care, I think there was an obligation on
22 industrial schools to have an after-care system?

A. Yes.

really.

10

15

16

23

26

27

28

29

24 95 Q. There were at various times certain Brothers who 25 would look after that issue and keep an eye on boys?

A. Yes, it would appear in the early 1940's that the Resident Manager and one other Brother were looking after it. The war years then made it extremely difficult for purposes of travel and so on, and at

that period the assistance of voluntary organisations like the Vincent de Paul and the Legion of Mary and so on, that was used and, in fact, the Gardaí to visit people who had left and so on and see how they Then around 1947 a Brother was not were getting on. appointed to it full-time but with the Resident Manager, it was his responsibility, even though my understanding is that for a number of years he was teaching as well because the visitation report said that he had his own methodology, meaning that he had the system worked out but that he was saying he hadn't sufficient time to do it, and some time after that a second Brother was appointed.

In going through the individual cases and so on, obviously I didn't go through everybody's record and look at it, but in the various cases in relation to injuries and punishment and so on, in some of them I have mentioned 'this boy left in such a year,' and frequently I have written underneath it, 'record of seven after-care contracts, record of five after-care contracts, record of ten after-care contracts.'

First of all, the Cussen Report in 1936 suggested that there should be a person put in charge of after-care. The Brothers at that stage then already had -- this is on the top of page 55 -- already had their own system worked out in which it said:

"Each school was to be responsible for the care of its own pupils in relation to after-care. The manager or Brother

1			appointed shall write to each boy
2			within a month. The employer should be communicated with at the same time. He
3			will ordinarily be revisited once a year for the first two years etc."
4			
5			In relation to that, there was also a system by which
6			if the boy was dissatisfied or was unhappy, he could
7			contact the school and in some cases the boys even
8			came back for a while until alternative work was had
9			for them. In relation to that, they were issued with
10			a sort of vade mecum that they brought with them
11			saying 'do this, do that, don't do this, do that,'
12			that broadly could be divided up into various
13			sections; one in relation to religion really. The
14			first bit dealt with praying and so on. There was a
15			section then with work and I think when I mentioned
16			earlier on order and hygiene and discipline, I think
17			number 7 at the bottom of page a 55 is significant,
18			because I think it characterises was Artane was
19			trying to do. This is being issued to a boy on
20			I eavi ng:
21			
22			"Always aim at becoming an expert at
23			"Always aim at becoming an expert at your trade. Take a pride in your work. You can not be proud of work badly
24			done. "
25			
26			So I would say that describes the ethos of Artane and
27			what Artane was trying to do.
28	96	Q.	Do you think that the system of after-care worked in
29			fact? Can I suggest this to you, that there is some

I		ance dotal evidence that a disproportionatery high
2		number of people who were in Artane ended up in
3		prison or down and out in dead end situations; would
4		you agree with that?
5	A.	Obviously I haven't got the statistics but some
6		obviously did, I take that for granted. I haven't
7		got statistics on it. In saying that, the cause and
8		effect relationship is not easy to establish. All
9		the people who are in prison at present went to
10		school somewhere, but I don't think their former
11		schools would be that pleased with saying, 'oh, you
12		went to school X.' In fact, at one stage in the
13		1940's, a letter appeared in one of the daily
14		newspapers berating a judge for mentioning the fact
15		that the boy in the sentencing had been in Artane and
16		telling him that if he had been in some high class
17		boarding schools, that comment wouldn't be made. So
18		the answer to that is I don't really know what
19		percentages, but I do know that has been said, yes.
20		
21		The other thing possibly I would like to draw your
22		attention to on page 55 is that in a recent newspaper
23		in 2005, it reported that:
24		
25		"More than half of the teenagers of the
26		State's most secure unit for young offenders ended up in adult prison, Health Board care or were homeless
27		within six months despite the fact that
28		the State was spending an average of £362,000 per person on the centre."

- I beg your pardon, that is page 56, the second last paragraph, the last sentence. So in actual fact, the situation at present, despite the level of spending that is there, seems to be somewhat similar to the
- that is there, seems to be somewhat similar to the one you were describing a few minutes ago.
- 6 97 Q. The next part of the submission deals with general welfare, and food and health?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 98 Q. The Commissioners have the report there. I am not so sure that any great issue turns on food. There are complaints about food from people here and there, but I don't think there is any major issue about that that I need to go into with you.
- 14 I would have to say that the reports don't tie in Α. 15 with the medical inspector's reports, particularly 16 with the report in 1962 where the group of inspectors 17 arrived on the place unannounced and they said that 18 they had pork chops and vegetables and potatoes for 19 dinner and on inquiry they found out that they had four sausages for breakfast that morning, it doesn't 20 21 seem to tie in with a lot of what I see in the 22 complaints.
- 23 99 Q. The submission deals with I think a lot of the
 24 reports which were made, including there was one in
 25 1957, a visitation report when there was severe
 26 criticism of everything in connection with the
 27 kitchen, and there was work done on the kitchen?
- A. There was work done. The medical inspector had referred to discussions that were taking place

1 between herself and the Resident Manager prior to 2 The other thing that I note which really gives validity to both, and I would say in relation to both 3 I am talking about the visitation reports and the 4 5 report of the medical inspector in relation to food 6 and clothing and so on, that there is a remarkable 7 trend similarity between them. When one was saying 8 the food was good or very good, the other was saying that at the same time, even though they were 9 10 obviously independent reports. In 1957 you will find 11 that the medical inspector's report at that stage 12 said the food was only fairly good, or something like 13 In general I would have to say that the 14 general picture coming through from the medical 15 inspector's report, and she was in Artane three and 16 four times a year, that it was in the main very good, 17 is how I would describe it.

18 100 Q. Moving on then to the issue of medical care. You say
19 at the top of page 69 that for a number of years at
20 the end of the 1950's and the beginning of the
21 1960's, there was no nurse available and during that
22 time the infirmary was managed by a Brother.

- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 101 Q. I don't need to know the Brother's name but do you know who that Brother was?
- A. I do, yes.
- 27 102 Q. Was that Brother medically trained?
- A. No, but you referred earlier to the 1962 inspection and so on, that the medical inspector said that both

she and the medical officer, and the word used was "full confidence" in the Brother, that he was capable of dealing with any emergency, that he had worked in an infirmary in another institution before he came, and that at that stage and in fact prior to that anyone in need of medical care, either the doctor was The doctor normally came, whether it was once or twice a week, but he certainly came formally once a week and then was on-call for anything else that might have been needed. Early on there was a policy that people who were in need of anything more than general first aid was referred to The Mater Hospital, which was relatively close by and which was

15 103 Q. To what extent would parents have been consulted if children had to be referred to hospital?

very accommodating in relation to Artane.

Α.

I don't know. I would say certainly the expectation would be that they would have been told, but the answer to that is I don't know and I certainly know that there is one instance, and I have instanced it for you, in which two boys were going in for, and it is only a tiny reference, I think it was either their aunt or their sister or somebody met them and was surprised, and in that instance it certainly wasn't. It is back to something I mentioned earlier, the Resident Manager had to make some sort of call on that. In other words, presumably if you were talking about stitches, or whatever it was, I don't know if the doctor in place did that type of thing or did

- 1 they go to The Mater. There certainly is one or two
- instances in which it didn't happen. I haven't any
- great feeling from reading the documentation that
- 4 non-reporting to parents was a problem in relation to
- 5 hospitalisation.
- 6 104 Q. You say that generally there were positive reports
- 7 about the records?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 105 Q. But in 1956 there was some criticism of the way the
- 10 records were being kept?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 106 Q. I think on one previous occasion at least?
- A. I think you will find in the follow up on in both the
- medical inspector and the visitation reports, that
- afterwards the reports were kept excellently. I
- 16 think the other point that is worth mentioning is
- 17 that the criticisms that were issued by the medical
- inspector, the only criticisms really mentioned were
- in relation on two occasions, possibly three, that
- the record keeping could have been better, but at no
- 21 stage during any of that was there anything other
- than the medical welfare of the boys and so on was
- 23 well looked after.
- 24 107 Q. Can we turn to the issue of bed-wetting which was
- something that was common to all the industrial
- 26 schools and similar institutions?
- 27 A. Yes.
- 28 108 Q. Would it be fair to say that there was very little
- 29 understood about the causes of this problem at the

- 1 time?
- 2 A. Yes.
- 3 109 Q. A lot of it was probably due to insecurity?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 110 Q. Can I ask you this; from what you have seen and from
- the statements you have read, do you think that boys
- were regularly punished if they wet the bed?
- 8 A. Are you talking about corporal punishment?
- 9 111 0. Yes.

- 10 A. I don't think so, I must say, but I haven't any 11 evidence of that. I do know that, unfortunately,
- ovidence of that. I do know that, and canatery,
- part of the process was the sheets had to be washed

and they brought them across to the laundry which was

- a long distance away and they had to go through the
- 15 yard at the time. That wasn't as a punishment, but
- in fact obviously from the point of view of the
- 17 youngster doing it, it wasn't very pleasant and by
- present day's standards it certainly wouldn't be
- 19 done. I have no great expertise in dealing with
- 20 this, but I did dip into the net and there are lots
- of interesting things there from families and so on
- who tried, even more recently than Artane, who tried all kinds of methodologies and who made a lot of the
- 24 mistakes that were made everywhere else as well. I
- 25 have also seen that helping to clean the thing up and
- so on is recommended in some cases which surprised
- 27 me, though I would not recommend that it be done in
- 28 public.
- 29 112 Q. You are probably aware that quite a number of

- complainants have said that they were punished, that they would have been slapped or whatever for
- 3 bed-wetting or whatever?
- 4 A. Yes, they may have happened in instances, and all I am saying is I haven't any documentary evidence.
- Obviously it would be a matter of dispute between the group in question and the person who is being accused
- 8 that will be dealt with in a different forum. I
- 9 would say it was a difficult problem and if you have
- 10 a large number of children like that, it is bound to
- 11 arise. I would say it was handled within the
- 12 knowledge at the time from the point of view of
- managing the night end of it, that they were called
- and so on at certain times during the night and given
- an opportunity to go to the toilet. Some of the
- other things like the sheets and so on, I wouldn't
- say that that was very well handled.
- 18 113 Q. Moving on then to the issue of education. You say
- that the school had its own primary school which
- operated under the Department of Education?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 114 Q. And was subject to its rules and regulations?
- 23 A. Yes.
- 24 115 Q. In general terms, how do you feel the standard of
- 25 education was in Artane?
- 26 A. In relation to the primary school my general
- impression is very high and that was the general
- impression of the inspectorate at the time. On at
- least two occasions they have been quoted; one was

quoted as saying that Artane was the best school in its district, and the other was quoted as saying Artane was the best school in Dublin. speaking, the actual reports of five general inspections, in other words in which the whole school was inspected as I described earlier on, and in all of these the amount of negative criticism or of criticism was very low. There is a section in it for negative comments and there was comment on the standard of buildings and so on, and that was under discussion for quite some time. Then the type of critical things that would have been said in relation to teachers, and I would stress in a very small number of things, was too much wrought learning or too much chorus answering, or whatever it was. general the impression of the Department of Education, and I believe it was the correct one, was that Artane Primary School was a very good primary school, particularly when you consider the standard of attainment on entry that was there when the boys I am not saying that it was a school that you could put out and that everybody left that with a good education, but I am saying from the level at which they came in to the level at which they left, they received a very good education and the improvement rate was quite good, and the primary school results show that. Was there any vocational direction given to the boys 116 0.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

as to what areas they might go into or what trades

1			they might be put into?
2		A.	The only reference I have come across in that is in
3			the visitation reports, one of which said that
4			generally speaking the boys are given their choice.
5			Then I have seen other things which make it out that
6			that was not true, so I don't know really.
7	117	Q.	There were some complaints that boys, certain boys
8			who wanted to do certain things were put into other
9			areas, other trades?
10		A.	Yes, that may have been the case, I don't know. My
11			only experience in something like that is as
12			principal of the secondary school trying to assign
13			students to a range of optional subjects when they
14			reach their first two years of Leaving Cert and they
15			are all applying to get into A, B or C, and at some
16			stage or other somebody has to make a call and you
17			try and prioritise and meet the demands as best you
18			can.
19	118	Q.	In the visitation report, and this is page 35, the
20			visitation report of 1952, the person reporting says:
21			
22			"Artane has a more elaborate organisation of trades than our other
23			industrial schools. These trades serve or are supposed to serve a dual
24			purpose; training the boys for outside
25			life and balancing the Artane budget. Brother has charge of the shops and
26			each shop has one or more lay tradesman. In practice some of the
27			trades serve only one purpose. For example, the wages of two shoemakers
28			amount to £800 per annum. It is believed that this sum plus the money expended on the other would supply the
29			expended on the other would supply the boys with factory made boots for one year. On the other hand, the tinsmith

2			supply provide the establishment with such things as kitchen wear and refectory wear at a cost well below factory prices, but no boy has been placed as a tinsmith in any outside factory for the past six years."
4			
5			There seems to be a certain futility about that,
6			training boys to be tinsmiths if they are not going
7			to get jobs?
8		A.	Yes, I think the point the visitor was making is
9			there was a degree of both and there was an attempt
10			to reach a balance there. What he is saying in
11			relation to the shoemaking is that was totally for
12			training boys because, in fact, they could have
13			bought the shoes for less money than they were paying
14			the person who was training, that was the point he
15			was making there. In relation to tinsmithing, and
16			that was true in relation to a number of those, as
17			the time moved on, obviously tinsmithing at that
18			stage was beginning to be phased out, I don't know
19			what number were involved in it, but that certainly
20			wouldn't give you any great prospects into the
21			future. I think that is what the visitor's report is
22			sayi ng
23	119	Q.	The author then says lower down:
24			
25			"The position is satisfactory with
26			regard to placing tailors, shoemakers, waiters, band boys and farmers. Unsatisfactory in the case of bakers,
27			weavers, carpenters, mechanics and
28			painters, and hopeless in the case of tinsmiths. These latter have to be
29			fitted in anywhere a vacancy can be found, irrespective of its nature.
			Here another question mark annears

1	would the boy who has served as a tinsmith for two years and who has to
2	tinsmith for two years and who has to go out into a post of a very different type for which he has received no
3	ťype for which he has received no training have a grievance, would he
4	feel that he had been exploited for two years? Are the Brothers justified for
	economic reasons in putting a boy to
5	economic reasons in putting a boy to such work when they know that he is almost certain not to continue with it
6	later?"

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

of them.

Bearing in mind that the school was there to provide people without a stable background with a prospect for the future, would you have any comment to make on that?

A. The first comment I would make is that obviously tinsmithing should have been done away with at that I don't know when that happened. stage. I would also bring you back to the point I made earlier, that the corresponding group of people in lots of national schools were leaving without any training in There was a small number of trades at that stage that essentially were becoming obsolete. of the others, the sheet metal working which was mentioned also, they had to discontinue which was a very worthwhile one, but then during the war years and so on the availability of raw materials became impossible to get. I would agree with you that if various trades were becoming obsolete, then the obvious thing to do was to phase them out and get rid

28

29

The other thing in relation to, and I am not

referring now to tinsmiths, but the other one in relation to some of the trades was there was a difficulty with the trades union because they didn't recognise the training. I think I have that mentioned as well and it is mentioned in the visitor's report?

7 120 Q. Yes, you do.

Α.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

That the trade unions didn't recognise the training because they weren't going through the formal apprenticeships that others were going through, but I would stress Artane was an industrial school with a primary school and a trades department offering Some of it was more formal and was trai ni na. amenable to be examined, others weren't. Certai nl y when they started, it was quite obvious that it was thought that there were openings there. Then it does mention in a number of reports that the area needed to be looked at. In 1954 then they went about setting up what they called the "Trades Preparatory School", even though that is not a term that you will find in the educational books and so on. There were trade preparatory schools in Northern Ireland where youngsters were taught a trade. We actually had one in Cork, and one of the Brothers who was there was transferred into Artane to try and bring this about and put the whole trades area on a much stronger The real think of that had started about footing. the 1950's and really came to a head in the 1952 report, that is why I said the 1952 report was a very important one from the point of view of bringing
about change in Artane, but then that was the purpose
of the visitor, to point out those things and to
challenge people on what they were doing.

- Is anything known about the level of attainment in general terms that boys who had gone through Artane reached in their vocational lives? Did many people go on to third level education, did many people achieve anything of that nature?
- 10 Yes, I won't be able to find it for you, but inside I Α. 11 have a quotation in which I think one of them was in the legal profession, a number of them were clergy 12 13 and so on. I would say the whole musical area was a 14 big one, though in lots of cases and people were mistaken in their take on that because they said they 15 16 didn't find jobs in that, they didn't find them 17 immediately, but that is where they ended up, and 18 that is with bands and orchestras and so on in the 19 wider field found employment there.

2021

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

In relation to third level education, in the mid-1970's the national percentage rate for entry to university was 7%, and that is from people who had gone through secondary school. So I think to expect people who went through national school system and who left two years after that, if they did attain university, they certainly had done a lot of work in between themselves.

29 122 Q. What I am really trying to explore here, Brother, is

the whole issue of opportunity given to the boys. It is quite clear from your submission and from the documents we have all read that a substantial number of boys were coming into Artane for non-attendance at school and issues like that, and clearly they would have been challenged and present a challenge to the Brothers in terms of educating them.

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Α. Can I ask you to look at Table 10 on page 81 which gives the breakdown on that. If you remember I mentioned earlier on that when boys came in they were assessed by the principal and so on. Their details were then filled in on a Return B of the judicial statistics. We have submitted them to the Commission and they are available from 1st January 1939 to some time in 1958, and we have based the percentages here on that. I think one of the appendices, in fact you were given all the figures and they certainly are giving a bigger breakdown. The percentage was as 42% of those came in during that period 1939 to 1958 were deemed illiterate; 26% read and write imperfectly; 19% moderate proficiency in reading and writing; 13% read and write well and nobody above that with superior instruction. other words, in taking that table, you are adding the 19 and the 13, so 32% that were moderate or better. When you then take into account that the background from which they were coming and that many of them were coming in at 10, 11 and 12 years of age, so if you were getting in a large group of people who were

that age and 42% of them are illiterate, then you are into a difficulty. In comparing the 19 and the 32, that is moderate or above, but not superior, the number for that including superior, except there was nobody in that particular category, the national figure for that was 85%, as mentioned on the next page in relation to some research that was done with the Kennedy Report. They are talking about people going into industrial schools, indicating that 11.9% were mentally handicapped, 2.5% and the figure for the population was 2.5%. 36% borderline mentally handicapped as against 12.5% nationally. This Leaves 51% who are average or above, as against 85% in the national population. When you combine that then with the primary school results in Artane, which were 97% success rate but if you include absenteeism on the day, it becomes 95%, and I think it averaged out somewhere about 75% in relation to national schools in general. In fact, the standard of attainment that was achieved following their years in Artane, I think is remarkable all things being taken into account. 123 Q. There is another group of students you might comment on, Brother, and that those who would have come in from other industrial schools or whatever, who would have gone as very young children being taken into care at the age of four or five, and they would have come from convents where they would have been students or pupils for a number of years, and they would have come straight to Artane, there were quite

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- 1 a number of those?
- 2 A. There were, yes.
- They would have gone virtually through the entire school system up to age 16 from age four away from the deprived background they had been taken apart from holidays they would have at home, so they were in the care of the State, whether it was in Artane or
- 8 other schools?9 A. Apart from the effect
- A. Apart from the effect of institutionalisation, I am not sure that you can get them out of the situation, but you are not actually getting them away from the overall effect in the sense you institutionalise them, which was the way for dealing with it at the time and we know now that isn't a very successful way of doing it.
- 16 125 Q. Should some of these children, the brighter ones, not 17 have been able to come through and had more of an 18 education than what they were given?
- 19 Α. Certainly they were given an excellent primary school education and after that they were trained in a 20 21 They hadn't the opportunity for post-primary 22 education, but free post-primary education arrived in Ireland in 1967. I can't give you statistics on the 23 24 percentage that were attending second level school 25 prior to that, but they are better off, I would say, 26 a good deal better off than they would be in the 27 absence of Artane, because at least they had a good 28 primary school education and they were trained in a 29 How successful they became afterwards was a trade.

1 combination of a lot of factors, including these. 2 saying this, I am not for a minute saying that Artane was perfect and that the trades situation was 3 perfect. I am saying the primary school was 4 5 excellent and I think generally that is taken as a 6 given by the Department of Education and is reflected 7 in the visitation reports. There was a lot of 8 discussion about the trades. The setting up of a 9 vocational school was mooted at one stage and the 10 reply from the Provincial was that it is not 11 practicable. I can't interpret that, but when you 12 look at the level of funding for what was being 13 provided, I am wondering how you were going to run a 14 vocational school as well, it just wouldn't have been 15 possi bl e. At one period vocational school teachers 16 came in and were successful for some years and not 17 successful in other years. Then in the early 1960's 18 the discussion took place as to whether or not they 19 would introduce a secondary top or a vocational top. The secondary top or the vocational top is a section 20 21 within a primary school which offers education up to 22 what we would now call junior level at second level. Their option would have been for the vocational top, 23 24 but because of a lack of woodwork and metal teachers 25 and so on, they had to opt for the primary one in 26 which they were putting them through the Inter Cert, 27 but they only had them for two years and then the 28 Department put in a rule that you couldn't sit the 29 Inter Cert unless you had three years.

1 126 0. Was there any facility available for children who had 2 gone from a very young age through a convent and 3 straight into Artane and who showed little or no aptitude or taste for a trade but were bright 4 intellectually, was there any provision made for them 6 that they could go on somewhere? Some of them were 7 there until they were 16 years of age? 8 Yes, if you are talking about formal education the Α. 9 answer is no. 10 Yes. 127 Q. 11 Α. In the 1960's they did attend the local secondary 12 school. 13 Yes, and I think the Brothers set up the school? 128 0. 14 Α. That's right, not specifically because of Artane, 15 they set up the school in that area which happened to 16 be adjacent. 17 The reason I mention this is if I could just put up a 129 0. 18 document here, I think it is from a promotional piece 19 on the Artane Boys Band, and it may have been around the time of one of the tours in America. 20 21 very last page in that book. I know it is 22 promotional and it must be read in that context, but 23 I think it is factually correct. If you look at the 24 left-hand side of that page, the second paragraph, 25 there is a reference: 26 27 "This has led to the belief that the repertoire consists entirely of martial airs. Yes, these boys can play 1,000 compositions and more, fingering difficult works of Bach, Supae, Saleyah, Wagner, Romberg, Sousa, Gould 28

29

1			• • • •
2			
3			And so on. Then at the last paragraph on the other
4			page, it says:
5			
6			"A foreign musical critic who heard the
7			Artane Bŏys Band playing in Dublin recently paid this tribute to them:
8			'I have beard and oni eved many
9			'I have heard and enjoyed many bands in many countries, but I recall none to surpass the
10			Artane Boys. The extent of their repertoire is simply
11			amazing. They playing with preciping with an appreciation
12			and with such evident enjoyment that the pleasure of listening
13			to them was to me at least quite unforgettable. I shall cherish
14			the memory for years to come and
15			hope to be given the opportunity in the near future of hearing this wonderful band once more.'"
16			this worlder fair band once more.
17			
18			This is something coming out of Artane, on the
19			musical side they are able to get boys from the mixed
20			background you have described, some from very
21			impoverished backgrounds coming in at ten or eleven
22			and being illiterate, others who have come through a
23			convent system, and they are able to turn them out as
24			expert musicians.
25		A.	Yes.
26	130	Q.	What I am asking you is why couldn't they do
27			something comparable on the educational side
28			general I y?
29		Δ	I would count this as part of the educational side

1 very much so.

2 131 Q. Yes, but in other facets of their education?

3 Α. I presume within the limited resources I think that is an extraordinary tribute to the boys and it is 4 something which was not known, I would say, in lots 5 of places in Ireland that they had a classical 6 7 repertoire because they saw them mainly in Croke Park 8 and because of the nature of what was going on there, 9 they played marching tunes. It would also want to be 10 noted that the band wasn't the only music that went 11 on in the place, there was also a choir in the place 12 that has been commented on in several places as well, 13 not with the same notoriety as the band. Musi cal s 14 were produced and so on. All that area, the cultural 15 area let's put it, was catered for well. Deal ing 16 with the strict academic, narrow academic 17 intelligences possibly could have been dealt with 18 better, but there is a variety of intelligences and 19 certainly some of them were catered for very well in 20 Artane.

21 132 Q. Overall how would you assess the level of education 22 in Artane both in terms of general schooling at 23 primary level and then in trades?

A. I would certainly assess the primary school as
excellent. It was known as highly efficient in
inspectors' reports and so on. In the trades I would
say some sections of it worked very well; the
tailoring, the catering. It also should be noted
that in one of the reports, I know it was in a

1 visitation report, but it may well have been a 2 quotation from one of the after-care Brothers who 3 said that those who had got employment in farming afterwards turned out to be the most successful and 4 the most stable. In other words, they were 5 6 successful at what they did and they remained doing 7 In fact, later on in a different forum you will 8 discover the two of them actually inherited farms. 9 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC: That's why the prisons are 10 full, that's how well they 11 turned out. 12 133 0. MR. McGOVERN: Anyway, so far as the 13 Brothers are concerned, you 14 feel you did an adequate job? 15 Α. Yes. 16 You wouldn't agree with the criticisms which have 134 0. 17 been expressed that a lot of boys left there with 18 little or nothing? 19 Α. Well, it depends on what "little or nothing" means. 20 Taking the point at which they entered, and to use 21 the terrible phrase from the business world, the 22 "value added", I would say it was a very efficient, effective and successful school. 23 24 Can we move to the next section, section 7 of the 135 Q. 25 submission dealing with the special inspection in 26 December 1962. I think this was a inspection carried 27 out on 20th and 21st December 1962 by the Department 28 of Education, is that right?

That's correct, yes.

29

Α.

1 136 Ο. Could you just give some of the background to this? 2 Α. I don't think the background is as clear maybe as 3 some of the documentation in relation to it seems to The documentation seems to suggest that 4 5 Archbishop McQuaid asked the then Chaplain to give 6 him a report on Artane. From the Archbishop 7 McQuaid's perspective, he had shown a great interest 8 in industrial schools, including after-care right 9 back as far as the 1951 Commission on youth 10 unemployment and so on, and had lots of ideas in 11 relation to how it should work, including small 12 groups and all that. I would say its downfall was 13 the expense and how costly it was going to be. 14 any case, it would appear he did ask the then 15 Chaplain to present a report and the Chaplain 16 presented a report which he said was from his own 17 personal experi ence. This was supposed to be a 18 confidential report to the Archbishop, but then when 19 the Chaplain in question met with the Joint 20 Committee, he talked about it and so on. 21 of it is that, first of all, he was talking to the 22 Chairman of that Joint Committee and it was the Joint 23 Committee on Juvenile Crime, and according to himself 24 he had made a reference to this, but it was quite 25 obvious from the detailed notes and so on that were 26 taken that he did more than making reference and I 27 think he then realised what he had done. 28 process of that, the Chairman of that Committee 29 suggested that if this was the case and that was the

1 way he felt in relation to Artane, that he should 2 inform the Department of Education in relation to it. 3 Then a meeting was convened on 13th December 1962, in which the various people, I would say possibly some 4 5 from the Joint Committee and people from the Department of Education and the Chaplain were there, 6 7 and one person from the Department of Education took 8 serious offence at it and said that this certainly 9 was not true and that if the Chaplain had given that 10 type of report to the Archbishop, that he would have 11 to contact the Archbishop and correct the thing. 12 Then there was various to-ings and fro-ings with

- 14 137 Q. I think another senior civil servant however agreed 15 with the Chaplain?
- 16 A. That's correct, yes.

13

17 138 Q. There was a disagreement between the two?

letters, meetings and so on.

18 Α. There was a disagreement between the two and not only 19 that, I think the civil servant, who was not a member of the Department of Education, then took serious 20 issue with the Department of Education person and so 21 22 The Department's solution to it was let's set up 23 an inspection, which, as you say, was carried out on 24 the two days in late December. What I would say 25 about it was on their report, they contradicted 26 practically everything he said in relation to 27 specifics in relation to the standard of education, 28 to the food and health. I would say that both the 29 medical inspector and the Department of Education

1 people were highly annoyed about it and when they 2 went out unannounced -- for instance, one of the 3 things he had complained about was the food and they decided that in order to inspect this, they would 4 5 time their visit for ten to one when the boys would 6 be going in for dinner and, as the report said, it 7 backfired a certain amount because they were all 8 coming back from the cinema where they had been out 9 Then the dinner he described as at a film. 10 People enquired about what the breakfast excellent. was and one morning they had cornflakes, tea, bread 11 12 and marmalade, and on that particular morning they 13 had had four sausages. They actually went to the 14 fridge, because one of them said the sausages were 15 small, so they actually went into the fridge and 16 looked at them and measured them. They went into 17 great detail and they visited the dormitories. 18 only section they didn't visit was the primary school 19 because shortly before that there was a general 20 inspection carried out in the primary school and they 21 asked the Resident Manager about that, but in all 22 probability they knew about that anyway. 23 speaking in relation to specific areas, they 24 contradicted everything that was in the Chaplain's 25 report. 26 They seem to have concluded that no serious fault 139 Q.

27 could be found with Artane?

28 Yes. Α.

29 And the impression of the big happy family atmosphere 140 Q.

1			which pervaded the entire	institution was
2			i nescapabl e?	
3		A.	Yes.	
4	141	Q.	Isn't that seriously at v	ariance with a lot of the
5			complaints which have bee	n made about Artane?
6		A.	Yes.	
7	142	Q.	Can I again suggest that	if all the boys spoken to
8			were happy and cheerful a	nd replied frankly to
9			questions, I want to sugg	est to you that there are
10			many boys who are complai	nants, former pupils there,
11			who say that when they di	d complain, either nothing
12			was done or they were sev	erely punished and in some
13			cases beaten by the Broth	ers they had complained
14			about?	
15		A.	I haven't any evidence, c	ertainly from the
16			documentation, to say tha	t was true. The other
17			difference between the tw	o(INTERJECTION).
18			MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC:	Why don't you ask me?
19			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sorry, I can't have this.
20			MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC:	l am a member of a family
21				of 18.
22			THE CHAIRPERSON:	I can't have this.
23			MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC:	That man is lying down
24				there. He is lying through
25			his teeth down there. No	t one of my family
26			progressed, ten of them i	n institutions for twelve
27			years, every one of them,	and not one progressed.
28			Tell that man to stand up	and tell the truth.
29			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Just a minute now, before

1 we all get involved. 2 MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC: What about all the baldy 3 heads that were sent to Letterfrack? 4 5 THE CHAIRPERSON: Just a minute, before we 6 get to anything now, let's 7 take a break here and take a moment to reflect. 8 is a public meeting. It is a public inquiry. here to do our job ... (INTERJECTION). 9 Wait now, iust 10 a minute, I am speaking now. If you want to you can 11 make my job impossible, in which case we won't have a 12 meeting ... (INTERJECTION). Hold on, we understand, 13 and Mr. McGovern said it at the start, we understand 14 that there are going to be things said that people in 15 the room don't agree with. There may be a lot of 16 things said that people in the room don't agree with 17 and disagree with very strongly. That is the purpose 18 of having an inquiry. One thing that has to happen 19 is the Christian Brothers have to be permitted to 20 have their say. 21 22 There is no perfect system. This system isn't perfect, but it is the best system that we have been 23 24 able to come up with to run this Inquiry. I can 25 understand people getting frustrated. 26 Br. Reynolds is doing is giving evidence on behalf of 27 the Christian Brothers. He wasn't there. 28 largely speaking from documents and making comments,

29

so strictly speaking his evidence is hearsay.

1 this were a court, it probably would be inadmissible 2 in any case, but it is the best system we can come up 3 We can't have a situation where he is sitting there wondering is somebody going to shout something 4 at him in a minute, I can't have that because he 5 6 can't be sitting there, he is going to get confused 7 and he is going to get lost. We, as the Committee, 8 are simply going to be concentrating more on whether 9 somebody is going to shout or somebody else is going 10 to disagree or somebody else is going to disagree with what has last been said. We can't have that. 11 12 have to have a system of order. 14 15 16 17 18

13

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29

Bear in mind, everybody understands, and Mr. McGovern said it at the start, I don't know whether you heard it, he said how much he acknowledged that there would be a lot of things said that people didn't agree with, so I understand all that. We are here to hear evi dence. This is our way to do it. I am not getting into a big criticism mode, I am simply explaining to you we can't do it that way. Okay, I understand, now let's proceed with Br. Reynolds' evidence. I am not taking questions from the floor. MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC: It is not a question. THE CHAIRPERSON: It is not a debate. don't care what it is from the floor, I don't care what it is, I am not taking interventions. I am trying to be as sympathetic as I am not conducting a general discussion possi bl e.

1 If you have questions, you can approach the 2 legal team or one of the administrative team, because 3 anybody's experience up to now in dealing with our inquiry has been they have been dealt with 4 5 sympathetically and given straight answers when they 6 ring up, when they write to us or when they contact 7 So there is no need for a question and answer 8 If you have a question, there are people 9 around the room who will be happy to consider it if 10 you want to. We are now getting on with the evidence 11 on that basis. Very good, now, Mr. McGovern. 12 143 0. MR. McGOVERN: Can we go back to this 13 report, I think the 14 Brothers take exception to the report of the 15 Chaplain, is that right? That seems to be the thrust 16 of what is in the submission? 17 You mean now? Α. 18 Ο. Yes. 144 19 Α. Yes, because one of the things that has emerged, first of all, I was aware for some time back of the 20 21 existence of the report, but I wasn't aware of where 22 it came from or why the inspection was carried out in 23 the first place. The interesting thing is it would 24 appear from talking to those who were on the staff 25 that until I talked to them, they were totally 26 unaware of it as well. I don't know did the Resident 27 Manager know anything about it. Certainly, what I am 28 saying is that the Department of Education, who 29 carried out an inspection in receiving these

1			complaints, they did not agree with it.
2	145	Q.	I want to ask you to comment on this, whatever about
3			some of the statistics that were referred to and that
4			the Chaplain may have been mistaken about, in the
5			course of his statement at page 8 of the book of
6			documents, he makes the following comment, and he is
7			talking about discipline:
8			
9			"In Artane it seems to me that
10			discipline is rigid and severe and frequently approaches pure regimentation. Every group activity is
11			reguently approaches pure regimentation. Every group activity is marshaled, even the most elementary such as recitation of The Angelus during recreation."
12			during recreation."
13			
14			Would you agree that that seems to accord with one of
15			the visitation reports, that everything is very
16			regimental?
17		A.	Yes.
18	146	Q.	So he appears to be correct about that?
19		A.	Yes.
20	147	Q.	
21			"The administration of punishment is in
22			the charge of the disciplinarian but in practice is not confined to him. There
23			seems to be no proportion between punishment and the offence. In my
24			presence a boy was severely beaten on the face for an insignificant
25			mi sdemeanour. Recently a boy was puni shed so excessively and for so long
26			a period that he broke away from the
27			Brother and came to my house a mile away for assistance. The time was 10:45p.m., almost two hours after the
28			boys retired to bed. For coming to me in those circumstances he was again
29			puni shed with equal severity."

1			
2			These are things, whatever about the punishment that
3			happened subsequently that he may or may not have
4			seen, he saw a boy being severely beaten on the face
5			for an insignificant demeanour. Are the Brothers
6			challenging an eyewitness account of the Chaplain as
7			to matters like that?
8		A.	No, we are not, and we are saying that if anything
9			like that happened it shouldn't have happened and it
10			was wrong. The thing that surprises me about it was
11			that he didn't bring it to the attention of the
12			Resident Manager.
13	148	Q.	Another matter he refers to is at page 13 of the
14			book, he is talking about personnel and he says:
15			
16			"Six Brothers are at the school from 15 to 35 years and to these are entrusted authoritative and
17			entrusted authoritative and administrative positions."
18			admi m strati ve posi trons.
19			
20			It is a different issue, I know, but just to jump
21			back to where we were some time ago. I have had a
22			look at the details given by the Order to us as to
23			the time served by Brothers there. Just looking this
24			morning at them before coming here, I found one at
25			36 years, 29 years, 22 years, 20, 18, 16 and
26			15 years. Some Brothers were there a very long time
27			with very onerous tours of duty, would you agree with
28			that?

29

A.

No, I would say those who were there for a very long

1			time were those who hadn't the very onerous tasks,
2			who were in the administrative end of things. The
3			Resident Manager was normally there for six years. I
4			haven't an average on the principal, but the
5			principals would have been there seven, eight, nine
6			or ten years, which is not an extraordinary length of
7			time in relation to being principal of a primary
8			school.
9	149	Q.	There is another document I want to draw your
10			attention to in the context of this disagreement
11			between the two civil servants over the special
12			report. At page 16 of the book of documents,
13			Mr. Berry is writing to Mr. O'Rafferty, and he says:
14			
15			"I am being given information which goes to show that there is something
16			very very wrong with the way the industrial school system is functioning."
17			functioning."
18			
19			At page 17 he says:
20			
21			"I feel it necessary to say that having heard Fr. X twice, having carefully
22			re-read your letter of 3rd December (with some of the conclusions of which
23			I do not agree) and having listened to your cross-examination on
24			13th December, I am entirely satisfied in my own mind that conditions in
25			Artane Industrial School are not what they should be and that the Chaplain's
26			basic complaints of under-financing and bad_management, producing social
27			misfits in afterlife are well-founded. On the subject of bad management, you
28			will recollect that I told you in our talk this morning on Wednesday,
29			5th December that your Inspector of Reformatory and Industrial Schools had

weeks earlier described the manager of Artane school to me as being entirely inadequate."

3

4

These are very serious criticisms?

- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 150 Q. These are being exchanged between two senior civil servants?
- 8 One of them was from the Department of Education and Α. 9 the other, who certainly was never in Artane whatever 10 about being in an industrial school, and whose source 11 of information is a chaplain who is a part-time there for two years, who said he was working from 12 13 experience and who hadn't access to information, who also had said that when he went in, it was the 14 15 understanding of the Archbishop in appointing him 16 that he was to have a role and so on in after-care, 17 but it arose later that that was his own decision. 18 don't know what it is, but there certainly was some 19 sort of agenda in there. What draws me to that conclusion is the reaction of the two Department of 20 Education people; one is the medical officer who 21 22 said: "I refute completely allegations that boys are 23 under-nourished, lack ample wearing apparel and bed 24 clothing, and that their footwear is inadequate, " and 25 I am amazed that the Chaplain could make such 26 an unfounded statement. The fact that Mr. McDevitt 27 in his covering letter, which isn't included and which I haven't seen, but Mr. McDevitt took the 28 29 matter so seriously that he came to the conclusion

- 1 that the Chaplain must have been "actuated by
- 2 malice", is the phrase he used. I don't concur with
- 3 that, but I use it in the sense that what
- 4 Mr. McDevitt is saying is that the picture this man
- is painting is not the actual picture and the only
- 6 conclusion seemingly he could come to was a rather
- 7 drastic one with which Mr. Berry disagreed and, I
- 8 hasten to add, with which I would disagree. I don't
- 9 believe for a minute that it was actuated by malice,
- but there certainly was an agenda at work there that
- I don't understand, I could speculate but I don't
- intend to.
- 13 151 Q. Can I ask you to comment on this; the Chaplain's
- 14 report of some of the things he saw, can I invite you
- to agree that that actually accords with some of the
- 16 complaints made by some of the boys who were in
- 17 Artane?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 152 Q. Whereas, the Department have never found any of those
- 20 complaints, I am not saying to be justified, they
- 21 have never made any observations about any complaints
- of serious physical or sexual abuse, isn't that
- 23 right?
- A. That's correct, yes.
- 25 153 Q. They have never made any comment about it. The
- 26 Brothers accept, and I think you have accepted this
- 27 yourself, that there were, albeit on a limited basis,
- there were incidents of this nature?
- 29 A. Yes. I am not saying that everything the Chaplain

1 said was incorrect. For instance, he mentioned 2 things like the need for psychological assessment and so on, a certain amount of which was in train at the 3 time, whether he knew about it or not, I don't know, 4 female staff and so on. The staffing that he was describing in Artane would be replicated in boys' boarding schools right throughout the country. 7 8 Artane wasn't the only institution for boys of that 9 age that had a very limited number of female staff. Moving then to the issue of deaths of boys in Artane. 10 154 Q. 11 This is section 8 of the submission at page 96. 12 "Between 1933 and 1969 inclusive, 38 boys who were resident in Artane died of whom 26 died in hospital, hospice or sanitorium, nine in Artane itself and three while at home on holidays. 15 of the 38 died of tuberculosis or other pulmonary related diseases, ten in the 1930's and five in the 1940's. Three of the 15 tuberculosis related deaths occurred in Artane, the remaining 12 13 14 15 16 17 occurred in Artane, the remaining 12 having been licensed to a hospital, hospice or sanitorium." 18 19 20 I think what you have done then is you have set out 21 22 other cause of deaths, such as meningitis, heart 23 disease, diphtheria and so on. You have then a table showing all of these particular cases, and I think 24 25 then you produce national tables and information 26 about deaths nationally from various illnesses within

the same period.

27

28

29

is the total number of male deaths nationally in the

six to 15 year old age groups between 1931 and 1969

I think what that shows at page 102

- 1 was calculated at 12,010.
- 2 A. That is the annual figure.
- 3 155 Q. Yes. You say in Table 18 the total male population
- 4 of six to 15 years old was 2, 228, 654. This
- 5 represents a national death rate of 0.54% for the
- 6 entire period.
- 7 A. Yes.
- 8 156 Q. The death rate for the same age cohort in Artane
- 9 Industrial School for the period 1933 to 1969 was
- 10 0.43%, so it is 0.43% for Artane and 0.54%
- 11 nati onal I y?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 157 Q. Then on page 103 you give statistics broken down into
- 14 1940's, 1950's and 1960's. I think what those show
- is that the death rate for boys in Artane and the
- 16 comparable cohort was actually below the national
- 17 average?
- 18 A. Yes, yes.
- 19 158 Q. Your next topic in the submission deals with the
- 20 final years and the closure. You deal with the
- 21 period coming up to mid 1960's and the decision to
- 22 close. Could you tell the Commission about that?
- 23 A. At that stage, first of all, in one sense the
- character of Artane was changing and the Brothers,
- 25 particularly under the direction of the principal at
- the time, had made quite a number of changes and had
- 27 involved Dr. Paul McQuaid from The Mater Hospital and
- 28 a number of others who used to come to the school and
- 29 work with the youngsters individually and in groups

1			and so on. Generally speaking, I think the feeling
2			was that among the general public the whole system of
3			industrial schools was certainly being called into
4			question. I think it was 1960's, there is a letter
5			that I have included in the Discovery, in 1967
6			stating that at that stage the Brothers had come to
7			the conclusion that they were going to close
8			industrial schools. The interesting thing is that at
9			that stage the Department of Education wanted them to
10			remain open for five years and they had enlisted the
11			assistance of the other Dr. McQuaid of the Archbishop
12			to try and convince the Brothers of that, so
13			obviously he didn't take the Chaplain's report as
14			seriously as Mr. Berry did or he wouldn't be asking
15			the place to remain open for another five years.
16	159	Q.	I has to be said that there appears to be something
17			of a paradox here, because if we look at the document
18			which is at page 19 from Archbishop McQuaid, dated
19			18th December 1962, to the Chaplain, he says:
20			
21			"If by an act of God Artane could
22			disappear today, I would be a much less anxious Archbishop."
23			
24			Are you saying that when the Brothers decided to
25			close, that the same Archbishop seemed to be against
26			the closure?
27		A.	I am not sure he was against the closure, but he was
28			certainly willing to work with the Department in
29			order to have it remain open for a further five years

and said in the process that it was quite obvious
that the Brothers were becoming frustrated at the
undergirding of their work and that anybody who was
involved in that and in criticising them obviously
didn't know the work that was being done for the
children who were there. So there seems to be quite

a contradiction in his position.

Part of what I would wonder is because, as I mentioned earlier, Dr. McQuaid was talking about industrial schools in general, I would say, just as much as Artane, but he was including Artane as it was the largest one, but I think what he was talking about was the system rather than the individual sections of it or the work that was going on. I would find it, and I was aware of the quotation you mentioned, I would find it rather extraordinary that somebody would say that in 1962 and in 1968 be trying to convince the Brothers that they should keep it open and saying that it was a pity they were going to move out of this work.

- 22 160 Q. Is it not the fact though that Archbishop McQuaid had 23 been something of a critique of Artane over the 24 years?
- A. Not to my knowledge. The only references I can come across in 1952 at a meeting at which he had stated, and it was reported back to the Brothers, that the knowledge of religious education in Artane was the best in the City. In 1960 or 1962 at the opening of

1 the new renovated primary school and so on -- sorry, 2 in 1959 he had also made the same statement to the 3 principal and in 1962 he praised the level that was One of the interesting things as well is that 4 one of the criticisms that was contained in the 5 6 Chaplain's report was in relation to the chapel, and 7 shortly after that period the Archbishop wrote and 8 got permission to use the chapel for one of the local 9 So it seems there are lots of pari shes.

10 contradictions in it and that is why I am saying
11 there is obviously something else in there that I
12 certainly don't understand.

- 13 161 Q. I got the impression from reading some of the
 14 documentation that the Archbishop wasn't entirely
 15 happy about being asked to bless or open certain
 16 buildings in the school?
- 17 A. No, I don't think that is so.
- 18 162 Q. Maybe I am rephrasing it inelegantly, but there was something there in the background?
- 20 A. He was asked at that stage to open two places; one 21 was out north of Swords, a training house that was 22 out there, and he was also asked at the same time to 23 bless the primary school in Artane. There were 24 letters and trying to fit it into schedule and so on. As it turned out, he certainly did officially open 25 26 Artane and I am not sure about the other, but I think 27 he opened that one as well. I think it was diary and 28 calendar issues rather than anything else. 29 said, the surprising thing about it in relation to

- the Dr. McQuaid was that if he was that worried about
 Artane, how come he didn't make it known to the
 Congregational authorities, because he wasn't a man
 known for reticence, let's put it that way. He was
 in constant contact with religious orders and
 particularly with those involved in education, so I
 don't understand, but those contradictions are there
- 9 163 Q. Would I be correct in saying he wouldn't have had any authority over the Christian Brothers?

without a doubt.

8

11 Α. No, that might be a legal canonical thing, I don't 12 know, but no, not in the sense that you are talking 13 about, not in the sense that he would be interfering 14 on a regular basis with the day to day. He did, for 15 instance, in the 1960's approach the Brothers to ask 16 them to open quite a number of schools right around 17 the edge of the city because he was looking at population trends and so on, so he had the connection 18 19 with them at that level. You will notice as well that in the closure, because the fact that the 20 21 Provincial at the time was away at General Chapter, 22 one of the omissions there was that they had sent in the letter of notice, the six months notice to close 23 24 Artane and they forgot to inform the Archbishop. 25 am not saying he took object to that, but they did 26 write afterwards saying that this was an oversight, 27 and the Provincial at the time met him and so on to 28 explain that. In that sense, certainly Archbishop 29 McQuaid himself looked on himself as somebody with

- jurisdiction at some level in relation to Artane, yes.
- 3 164 Q. Can you just tell the Commission something about the 4 actual closure, I think it was due to take place in 5 1968?
- 6 A. That's right, it was due to take place in 1968. The 7 problem for the Department, and it is an 8 understandable one, was there was still at that stage some 200, or whatever it was, children there, and 9 10 they were saying to the Brothers, 'if your final word 11 on this is that you want to close Artane, we need 12 time to make provision for the children that are As a result of that, the Provincial then 13 14 went back, or the Resident Manager went to the 15 Provincial, I don't know which, and they reconsidered 16 it and they postponed the closing for 12 months. So
- 18 165 O. I think it was 30th June 1969?

17

A. In 1969, yes. To facilitate it, a number of boys who because of the fact that they were engaged in second level education, or whatever it was, a number of boys stayed on there, even though at that stage it was no longer an industrial school and the certificate was revoked at that stage.

instead of 1968, it went 1969.

- 25 166 Q. What happened to the 22 boys or so who had remained 26 on?
- A. There was still staff there. They really remained on living there but they were going to the secondary school. I don't know the details of it, and it also

1			appears there may have b	been some people who were
2			working there, some your	ng people, because the other
3			thing that had to happer	n was the workshops and all of
4			those had to be dismantl	ed and all of that type of
5			thing. So the actual st	taff of Brothers and some of
6			the boys remained there	for a number of years. I
7			can't tell you when the	last boy who had been
8			resident in the industri	al school actually moved off
9			campus.	
10	167	Q.	Can we move on now to wh	nat are probably the most
11			contentious aspects of	the evidence you have to give
12			and that is section 10 o	of the submission dealing with
13			the abuse and allegation	ns of abuse.
14			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Is this a good time? What
15				is the estimation? I am
16			conscious that Br. Reyno	olds should have an
17			opportunity of taking a	break. Is this the final
18			area we will be dealing	wi th?
19			MR. McGOVERN:	This is the final section,
20				Chairman, and at the rate
21			we are moving, although	this will take some time, we
22			will finish it this afte	ernoon.
23			THE CHAIRPERSON:	It seems a good time to
24				gi ve everybody a chance to
25			have a break. We will s	say two o'clock.
26				
27				
28			LUNCHEON ADJOURNMENT	
29				

1			THE HEARING RESUMED AS FO	LLOWS AFTER THE LUNCHEON
2			ADJOURNMENT.	
3				
4				
5			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Thank you. Yes,
6				Mr. McGovern.
7				
8			BR. REYNOLDS CONTINUED TO	BE EXAMINED BY MR. McGOVERN
9			AS FOLLOWS	
10				
11				
12	168	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	Thank you, Chairman.
13				Brother, just before lunch
14			I was about to move on to	the issues of physical and
15			sexual abuse and the comp	laints relating to these
16			matters, but there is one	item I overlooked which
17			I would like just to deal	with for a moment and
18			that's the issue of absco	nding. I think there was a
19			problem with absconding o	ver the years and you have
20			in appendix 4 attached to	the submission a table
21			(INTERJECTION)	
22			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Just before you go any
23				further, Mr. McGovern, just
24			so that people know where	we are. I have Mary
25			Raftery and the Irish Tim	es, articles by a
26			Mr. Connor. You know not	hing about that?
27			MR. McGOVERN:	No.
28			THE CHAIRPERSON:	They have been left here.
29				We will have a look at

1 Anyway, we have all got copies of these just 2 so that everybody knows what's happened and that's 3 the only thing I know about them. I wasn't suggesting that you left them there Mr. Lankford. 4 5 169 Q. MR. McGOVERN: Just to go back to where we 6 were, Brother. Thi s 7 appendix shows the number of absconding boys over the 8 period 1935 to 1971. It seems to have been a low 9 number in the earlier years and then it jumped 10 dramatically in 1963 for a period of a years? 11 Α. Yes. 12 170 0. What was the reason for that? 13 I don't know what the reason for it except I know Α. 14 that it is a fact and that a similar pattern happened 15 in Letterfrack. 16 171 That's right. 0. 17 A. I simply haven't any documentation that gives me any 18 further information on that except the statistics. 19 These statistics were assembled from going and 20 finding out any place absconscion was mentioned, but 21 there isn't any detail in relation to any of them as 22 to why or wherefore other than whether or not the 23 person was re-admitted. We know the absconscions 24 took place and we certainly know that there was a 25 very marked increase in that period referred to, but 26 unfortunately I can't throw any light on that 27 whatsoever. 28 Was that around the tame time as the report from the 172 0. 29 Department which said that there was a big happy

- family atmosphere in Artane, it's referred to in page 46 of your submission?
- A. It was probably one year before there was a large number. If you look at '62 you had 13 and then from '63/64 up to '67 it was inordinately high, yes.
- 6 173 Q. I am just wondering why if there was such a happy 7 atmosphere that the number of people absconding 8 increased dramatically?
- 9 I have no idea one way or another, nor have I any Α. statistics, let's say, on mitching from school at 10 11 that time and whether or not that was becoming --12 part of the reason, and I think it's mentioned in 13 appendix 1 at some stage by the former resident who 14 gave the radio interview, he reckoned that the 15 disciplinary procedures at that stage became very 16 much relaxed and that people weren't as excited about 17 absconding as they were heretofore, but whether or 18 not that is correct I don't know.
- There was a time when boys who had absconded, when
 they were brought back they were punished and they
 would have their heads shaved, is it accepted by the
 Christian Brothers?
- 23 A. Is it accepted that it happened?
- 24 175 Q. Yes.
- A. In instances it is accepted that it happened, it's not accepted as being acceptable.
- 27 176 Q. Yes, I see. Can we move on now to section 10 of your 28 submission, this is dealing with abuse and 29 allegations of abuse. You have divided this part of

1			the submission into two parts. The first part deals
2			with issues of physical punishment, the second part
3			with physical injury and the third part with
4			allegations of neglect?
5		A.	You will find there is an editorial error in that,
6			that second part as you will notice has been moved to
7			another section.
8	177	Q.	Yes, you are quite correct.
9		A.	Yes.
10	178	Q.	Then the fourth part deals with various aspects of
11			sexual abuse. You say that the policy of the
12			Congregation about corporal punishment has been
13			outlined and you are not trying to justify any
14			wrongdoi ng?
15		A.	Yes.
16	179	Q.	You then go on to point out that there is documentary
17			evidence in relation to 11 cases where excessive
18			physical punishment occurred or was alleged to have
19			occurred?
20			
		Α.	Yes.
21	180	A. Q.	Yes. Now, you say:
21 22	180		Now, you say:
	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that
22	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that extensive physical punishment was administered. In other cases there is
22 23	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that extensive physical punishment was administered. In other cases there is either insufficient documentary evidence or evidence of opposing views
222324	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that extensive physical punishment was administered. In other cases there is either insufficient documentary
22232425	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that extensive physical punishment was administered. In other cases there is either insufficient documentary evidence or evidence of opposing views expressed in correspondence leaving
2223242526	180		Now, you say: "There is sufficient evidence in three of these cases to establish that extensive physical punishment was administered. In other cases there is either insufficient documentary evidence or evidence of opposing views expressed in correspondence leaving

1			reported to the congregational visitor that a different brother in each case
2			had been severe on the boys. There are
3			had been severe on the boys. There are two cases where a complaint was made in which the balance of evidence clearly show the complaints are not sustainable."
4			sustai nabl e. "
5			
6			Then there was a newspaper article you have referred
7			to?
8		A.	Yes.
9	181	Q.	Taking the period of 1940 to 1969. You have here
10			documentary evidence relating to 11 complaints of
11			physical abuse. To what extent when you were dealing
12			with this subject did you have regard to the
13			statements of complaint made by boys who had been
14			pupils in Artane?
15		A.	No, I am not including those for the simple reason
16			that I didn't feel it was appropriate. I mean I was
17			dealing with, as I said in the beginning, with
18			evidence in our archives and so on and with
9			documentation, other documentation. I did not
20			include in that statements of complaints by
21			individuals. No, that's not included in that.
22	182	Q.	I am not in asking you that question trying to
23			suggest that every time somebody sent in a written
24			complaint or made a statement of complaint that you
25			should accept it, but was any evaluation done by you
26			of the complaints to see whether a substantial
27			proportion of them appeared to the Christian Brothers
28			to the credible or none of them appeared, to evaluate
29			them in any way?

- 1 Not to any detail that I would be able to give you Α. 2 statistics on. I would say that there are some we 3 would certainly dispute and there will be some of them that we don't. When I was making the submission 4 I was taking it for granted that that was a matter 5 6 for a different forum for the private hearings and, 7 therefore, as a result I didn't deal with it in this. 8 I would have to go talking to other sides; in other 9 words, all I would have would be evidence from one 10 side only. As well as that I didn't want to get into 11 that particular field.
- 12 183 Q. That's not really what I am talking about, Brother. 13 I am talking about looking at a substantial body of statements from complainants and trying to weed out 14 15 some as obviously improbable, others that you 16 couldn't make up your mind about, but others that 17 when you would cross check with people in the Order 18 might be credible, did you do anything like that, was 19 any such exercise carried out?
- 20 A. It has been done, but I certainly didn't do it and it's not included in this.
- Are you aware that there are a significant number of 22 184 Q. 23 people who went through the industrial school system 24 who said when they were in other industrial schools, 25 say convents before coming to Artane, that in many 26 cases they found their treatment there very good and 27 they compared Artane in a very adverse fashion to the 28 places there had been in earlier?
- 29 A. Yes.

- 1 185 Q. Would you have any comment on that or could you offer any reason you could think of why they would say that?
- Probably the fact that they were younger. I would 4 Α. say at that stage the issue of corporal punishment in 5 primary schools and so on, if you were looking at the 6 7 occurrence of it right across the board there would 8 have been higher instances of it at an age level from 9 10 to 14 or whatever it would be rather than from 10 5 to 10 or 5 to 8, whatever the school going age was 11 at that stage.

12 13

14

15

16

- I am not saying in that and I am not criticising the fact that people are saying that they felt they were treated more kindly in other institutions than they were in Artane if that's their experience of it.
- 17 186 Q. For a lot of these children their first memory of
 18 being taken away from their family even in very poor
 19 circumstances would have been in the earlier
 20 institution and they would to some extent have been
 21 institutionalised by the time they went on?
- A. Yes. I would also say it's fair to say, and obviously I don't want to talk about other institutions, that there is also a significant level of complaint on the individual basis now in retrospect in relation to other institutions as well --
- 28 187 Q. I accept that.
- 29 A. -- some of which are ones you are referring to which

- 1 would be the pre-Artane age group ones.
- 2 188 Q. Yes, I accept that there are indeed. So when you set
- out the 11 cases that are here in the submission --
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 189 Q. -- can I suggest to you, while they are obviously
- 6 helpful, they are a very limited picture of the
- 7 si tuati on?
- 8 A. Yes. As was said earlier on I am depending really on
- 9 documentation so I presented what I found in the
- documents and in some cases I passed comment. In
- other words, I presented the documentation and said
- to the Commission that's the documentation we have
- and therefore call obviously is yours after that.
- 14 190 Q. Yes. I don't propose to go through each of these
- incidents, they are there and the Committee can see
- them. In many ways items might be better for private
- hearing. If we take the second case, it's on page
- 18 109, there was an incident of a boy whose arm was
- 19 broken and who was hospitalised and it was a
- 20 complaint by his mother. Your conclusion is that
- it's quite clear the boy was injured and his arm was
- broken. The brother in question was transferred out
- of Artane. Do we know where he was transferred to?
- A. I do. I think it was Thurles, but I wouldn't be too
- sure. He was transferred to another school, if
- that's what you are asking.
- 27 191 Q. Yes. Do you think that was appropriate?
- 28 A. It wasn't appropriate. I would say it wouldn't have
- been uncommon in various places at the time.

Certainly that one is the most serious incident we have and it was handled badly I would say from all aspects of it. The other thing that probably gives some sort of indicator or is indicative of the attitude of society at the time and what surprised me when I read it that even Peadar Cowen the TD who alerted the Dáil to it at the end of it said 'this is an isolated incident, we it won't happen again' and so on. That came as a surprise to me, but I am taking that as being indicative of the times as well. It's probably indicative of the attitude that somebody who did something of that nature could be transferred elsewhere.

- 14 192 Q. In the third case you mention there was a boy who was
 15 beaten on the back and legs. He had to go to the
 16 infirmary. You say there was no indication that the
 17 matter was investigated or any action taken against
 18 the brother?
- 19 A. I am not saying that it wasn't. All I am saying is 20 that I didn't come across anything to indicate that.
- You seem to contextualise a lot of these Ο. complaints in the mores of the time we are talking about where physical punishment was accepted, do you think that when you look at all of these statements of complaint and when you look at all the records that are available to you that perhaps the situation was more severe in Artane than elsewhere, when you consider some of the observations in the visitation reports?

- 1 A. I am not sure that I would, I must say. I mean
- I haven't any great evidence to tilt the balance in
- either direction if you compared it to Letterfrack.
- I would have to say that in relation to this, I did
- 5 the research in relation to Artane and, therefore,
- 6 would not be in any way as familiar with other
- 7 institutions as I am with the Artane one, and again
- 8 I am talking from documentation.
- 9 194 Q. Yes. There was a requirement to keep a Punishment
- 10 Book in all industrial schools?
- 11 A. Yes.
- 12 195 Q. I think the Christian Brothers were aware of that --
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 196 Q. -- during the period we are talking about?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 197 Q. Was there a Punishment Book kept?
- 17 A. I believe there wasn't. I came across nothing that
- would indicate that there was so my answer to that
- 19 would have to be no.
- 20 198 Q. Do you know why not?
- 21 A. I don't know why not.
- 22 199 Q. Was that ever raised by any inspector from the
- Department of Education insofar as you are aware?
- A. No, there is no evidence whatsoever. I haven't come
- 25 across, I think I am correct in saying I haven't come
- 26 across a reference to the Punishment Book anywhere in
- 27 the documentation either from other own documentation
- or from documentation from the Department and so on.
- 29 [Mobile phone rings]

1			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sorry, could we ever have
2				the mobile phone turned
3			off. Did anybody hear me	? Who has the mobile phone?
4			There is a silent or a me	eting function on any mobile
5			phone. All you have got	to do is do that and put it
6			into your pocket and then	ıifit buzzes you can walk
7			outside the door and do i	t. It's very distracting.
8			It happened several times	this morning. Whoever has
9			it could they ever just t	ake it out, put it on silent
10			or turn it off even bette	er.
11	200	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	Brother, as I understand it
12				you are saying that with
13			all the numerous records	of Department of Education
14			inspections there is noth	ning you could find where the
15			issue of a Punishment Boo	ok ever arose, either being
16			looked for by a Departmen	it official or being produced
17			for an official?	
18		A.	Yes, but you will recall	that I said that the
19			Punishment Book was a req	uirement of the institution
20			and not a requirement of	the primary school.
21	201	Q.	I see.	
22		A.	Therefore, I said the ins	spection in relation to the
23			primary school I thought	was quite good, but in
24			relation to the instituti	on wasn't. [Mobile phone
25			rings]	
26			MR. McGOVERN:	I think somebody is in
27				denial about their mobile
28			phone.	
29			MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC:	Like the man up there

1				gi vi ng evi dence.
2	202	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	There was no requirement
3				you say from the Department
4			to have (INTERJECTION)	
5		A.	No, I am saying there was	n't a requirement for a
6			primary school to have a	Punishment Book. The
7			requirement was for the i	nstitution to have it.
8			Therefore, I also said that	at the inspection other than
9			the health and welfare, the	hat is Dr. McCabe, that the
10			inspection of that partic	ular aspect of the
11			institution was quite ina	dequate as has been
12			mentioned in the Kennedy	Report in relation to all
13			institutions.	
14	203	Q.	Yes. Do you know was this	s ever discussed at Resident
15			Manager Association meeti	ngs the issue of Punishment
16			Booki ngs?	
17		A.	The issue of punishment,	yes, but not the issue of
18			Punishment Books. When I	say that all I am saying is
19			that I don't know that it	was. It may well have
20			been, but I haven't come	across it.
21	204	Q.	Dealing with the issue of	neglect, physical neglect,
22			your submission gives a n	umber of cases there. I am
23			not sure how many of them	there are, there are 11,
24			I think. Sorry, I beg you	ur pardon, there is
25			14, I think, there?	
26		A.	Yes.	
27	205	Q.	I lot of these involve pa	rents trying to find out
28		A.	Yes.	
29	206	Q.	things about their boy	s?

- 1 Α. Quite a number of them. I would say in relation to 2 the 14 that seven of them are specific. I have 3 included in that anything that I came across in the documentation that came in. I had to find some 4 category to put it into so some of them found their 5 way in here and in fact to say that they are actually 6 7 neglect might be stretching the point. I would say 8 there are seven cases in which specific neglect, in 9 other words, was mentioned. For instance there are 10 two newspaper articles in there and comments of that 11 nature that I included as well. There are four 12 newspaper articles, but there were seven cases where 13 I would say there is a specific allegation in 14 relation to specifics. Some investigation was 15 carried out and asked to be carried out and a report 16 back is made.
- 17 207 Q. Yes. In the first case where the mother removed her boys to Birmingham?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 208 Q. I think there was a solicitor's letter sent
 21 indicating that a doctor had found some problems with
 22 the boys; is that right?
- A. That's right, but when the mother in question, she removed -- I think it was boys, was it?
- 25 209 Q. Yes.
- A. She removed the boys from the home and they had been on holidays for the best part of a month at that stage. If there was a problem, and I think it was hair lice, if I am correct, if there was I think

after a month at home it would be a bit difficult to
lay the total blame on the institution for that
particular case.

4 210 Q. Yes. Were there a number of occasions when parents
5 called to Artane to see boys and they weren't allowed
6 to see them?

Yes. There are some of these. I think there are two I have mentioned there. In one there seemed to be some dispute involving some other gate lodge or something else in relation to that. I think in one of them I think it is stated quite clearly in correspondence from the institution to the Department in one case that the institution didn't understand the complaint because on the day in question everybody who arrived at visiting time was allowed access to the boys or whoever they were visiting. So that wasn't the case.

Α.

The other one, I think, was in relation to the boy going out and being released home or something like that and that part of the reason he wasn't released home for that particular day was because it was part of a punishment which was used because of his insubordination and threatening with knives and things like that. I would say there probably isn't a great incidence of that, but it has been mentioned in a number of the cases.

28 211 Q. Do you think there was a general suspicion on people 29 held by the Brothers in respect of people who would make complaints from outside. The reason I ask you this is I recall seeing one batch of correspondence where a grandmother was making some complaint. She was being described as "dangerous" by the Brothers or a Brother?

Α. I think in that particular case they had reasonably good foundation for the conclusions that they came I don't particularly want to talk about the good lady in question, but I think if you examine the documentation in relation to that case it is quite clearly shown that No. 1 an investigation was carried out and the considered opinion of the Resident Manager was that the incident she was complaining about didn't actually take place. Nonetheless, they did issue a letter, not just to Artane, to all our industrial schools saying if punishments of this nature, if it should happen that they did take place it should cease if that is the custom or if it has happened. I am not sure why that happened.

It would appear to me that that was their action to it first of all in relation to giving instruction to the various institutions and may well have said to the mother or the grandmother who was complaining 'we have done this. We don't accept your complaint, but we have done this in relation to that complaint'. I haven't documentary evidence in relation to that, but I can't see why else they would send that out to all industrial schools if there wasn't some reason of

- 1 that nature for it.
- 2 212 Q. The submission refers to the occasion when Deputy
- 3 Michael O'Leary made a complaint in the Dáil
- following some newspaper article?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 213 Q. I think that's at page 116 of the submission.
- I would just invite you to consider this and comment
- 8 on it. Brother, when you look at correspondence
- 9 relating to that issue between the Christian Brothers
- 10 and the Minister, Mr. George Colley, it has the
- appearance of being hypersensitive, do you feel that
- or is that unfair?
- 13 A. Whatever was the hyper it certainly seems sensitive,
- 14 yes. They did invite Mr. O'Leary to spend a week at
- his pleasure in any or all of our industrial schools
- and see the situation for himself, an invitation that
- 17 he didn't take up. Mr. Colley didn't, but
- 18 Mr. Leni han, hi s successor, di d.
- 19 214 Q. Yes. You refer to the apocryphal account of
- 20 Mr. Lenihan Leaving and saying to his driver, 'get me
- out of this effing place'. You then talk about that
- on another visit with the Brothers he was quite
- cordial and pleasant?
- A. No, in the same visit.
- 25 215 Q. It is the same visit?
- 26 A. Yes.
- 27 216 Q. Can I just ask you this: Which do you think is more
- 28 likely that a person's true feelings would be
- 29 expressed to a third party outside or face to face

- 1 with the person?
- 2 A. I don't understand your question.
- 3 217 Q. If you are a guest in somebody's premises and you
- 4 have certain feelings about it do you think you are
- 5 more likely to express them if they are bad feelings
- to the person concerned or wait until you get out?
- A. Well, according to this he expressed them on the spot and they were overheard.
- 9 218 Q. I see. Anyway, perhaps (a) it's apocryphal and (b)
- it's probably something that is unfair to ask you to
- interpret.
- 12 A. I think a certain urban myth may have grown around it
- at some stage or another, but there is a description
- of it in the annals of the actual thing. Now,
- obviously that was written from within.
- 16 219 Q. There is a contemporaneous record?
- 17 A. Yes, of the visit.
- 18 THE CHAIRPERSON: Of the visit.
- 19 220 Q. MR. McGOVERN: Sorry, I thought you meant
- of this being overheard?
- 21 A. No, of the visit.
- 22 221 Q. Yes, very good. The Christian Brothers seem to
- accept that there was an element of physical abuse
- 24 there but on a limited scale, do I correctly
- 25 understand the position?
- A. There are three and possibly four cases there where
- I would say, yes, there was certainly very severe
- 28 punishment administered. I am not saying that is the
- 29 totality of it, I am saying that that is what I can

work out of on record. I would say the discipline
was quite strict and corporal punishment was used and
so on. What I am saying is I don't think that even
in relation to physical punishment that it was an

5 abusive institution by the standards of the time.

6 222 0. You are probably aware that there are a large number 7 of complaints and of these complaints a great many of 8 them talk about incidents of gratuitous violence to 9 put it bluntly by the Brothers on some of the boys, 10 some of the Brothers on some of the boys. I am not 11 just talking about the classroom situation, I am 12 talking about in day to day activities?

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

- First of all, the Congregation is not condoning Α. anything of that nature that happened and if such did happen the Congregation doesn't condone it now and didn't then. The difficulty I suppose at this remove that the Congregation has with it is that these complaints have come in retrospectively 30 years later and there are people who are named and accused and lot of whom are saying that didn't happen. I am more or less in the middle and it's something that a decision has to be made on it at a later stage in private hearings or however those two perspectives are going to be balanced. The Congregation is not saying that no physical -- obviously because we have instant cases here that no physical abuse took place.
- 27 223 Q. I would just like to be a little clearer on this, 28 Brother. Are you saying that the Brothers limit 29 their extent of the acceptance to just what's

2		A.	No, no.
3	224	Q.	Do you accept that it probably went further than
4			that?
5		A.	I do, yes. Unfortunately I am doing that in one
6			sense off the top of my head or from a gut feeling
7			rather than saying if I was challenged on that
8			I can't stand it up with documentation because
9			I haven't got it, but I am not saying that in the
10			absence of documentation that nothing else happened
11			other than what was documented here.
12	225	Q.	You are I am sure aware that there have been a great
13			number of complaints on this topic?
14		A.	I am, yes.
15	226	Q.	Just moving on to the issue of sexual abuse, this is
16			at page 121 of the submission. You say the approach
17			to sexual abuse is a moral one where such abuse is
18			seen as a grave moral failing and which was the cause
19			of scandal and immoral danger both to the child and
20			to the abuser, that there wasn't an awareness of the
21			long-term psychological damage that could be caused
22			and so on and the issue of recidivism.
23			
24			If you just look at page 124. After you have listed
25			six cases, which you are aware of, you say:
26			"As can be seen from the above six
27			cases, sexual abuse was viewed as a
28			grave offence. Unfortunately neither the serious emotional impact on the abused child nor the recidivistic
29			nature of abusers was adequately understood.

documented?

1			Sexual abuse was seen as a moral failure on a number of grounds:
2			1. It was morally wrong, sinful in
3			i tsel f.
4			 It was a cause of serious scandal to and endangered the morals of the
5			chi I d.
6			 It damaged the reputation of the individual offender, the institution and the Congregation."
7			and the Congregation."
8			
9			Can I suggest that there should at least have been
10			one more item, and I will leave it to you as to
11			whether it should have been No. 1 or No. 4, and that
12			is that it was also a crime?
13		A.	Yes, it would certainly be No. 1 now.
14	227	Q.	It was a crime then?
15		A.	Yes, I am not disputing the criminality of it then.
16			What I am saying is that the Congregation at that
17			stage dealt with it simply from the Congregation's
18			point of view. They were wrong is what I am saying,
19			but that is what happened. Obviously I am not trying
20			to excuse it on those grounds. All I can say is
21			I don't know why it wasn't reported. I can give you
22			as I mention a variety of things there, it was seen
23			as a moral problem. The Congregation dealt with it
24			in a way that they felt was very serious and had
25			serious consequences for the people who abused. All
26			of those in question that are mentioned there, with
27			the possibility of one who was advanced in age, that
28			they were dismissed from the Congregation.
-			J

228 Q.

Yes.

- 1 A. Why the Congregation didn't report it, I simply don't
- 2 know. The spectrum of why they didn't is from the
- 3 moral perspective on it rather than the legal
- 4 perspective or the criminal perspective on it.
- 5 229 Q. Did some of those brothers go on to take up teaching
- 6 positions in other schools or go to other places
- 7 where there was children?
- 8 A. I don't know. I think most of them probably weren't
- 9 teachers. Well, a lot of them weren't teachers
- 10 anyway. The simple answer is I don't know. Really
- 11 you are talking about the 40's for the vast majority
- of them, the 1940's for the vast majority of them so
- in a sense they are names to me that I found in
- documents, I don't really know anything about them.
- 15 230 Q. I would just like to explore for a moment with you,
- 16 Brother, the thinking of the Christian Brothers on
- 17 this topic. If you look at the document, it's at
- page 63 of the book of documents you have, it's a
- 19 document from the Christian Brothers. It's to the
- 20 Provincial dated 5 March 1938. It's talking about a
- 21 brother who had been involved in sexual abuse: The
- third line or fourth line of the letter says:

"Br. Blank is more to be pitied than censured."

- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 231 Q. What do you think that meant?
- 27 A. I have no idea what it meant, I don't agree with it.
- 28 232 Q. Yes, but it does seems to suggest in the mindset of the author of that letter the idea of punishing the

I			person or submitting them to the rigours of the raw
2			would be far from the writer's mind?
3		A.	Unfortunately I am at the disadvantage that I don't
4			know which case it is referring to or who it is or
5			whether or not he was dismissed or what happened to
6			him so I am in a sense
7	233	Q.	Yes. The next item I would like to refer you to is
8			at page 65. This was a case involving sexual abuse
9			and it says in the third paragraph:
10			"For a whole year he has been
11			"For a whole year he has been interfering in a homosexual way with two of these very respectful boys at Tramore Christian Brother's school."
12			Tramore Christian Brother's school."
13			
14			Now, I accept this appears to be in relation to
15			matters outside Artane, but it is involving the
16			Christian Brothers and their attitude to these things
17			that I am asking the question. It's described
18			further down as:
19			"The case is, as I have stated, one of
20			the worst we have had. Do everything you can to secure an immediate
21			dispensation and forward same as
22			expeditiously as you can. Needless to add how sorry I am to have to ask you to do this distasteful task. The Lord
23			has been very good to us in allowing
24			the discovery to have been made by the very prudent Dominican Fathers."
25			
26			What does that suggest to you?
27		A.	My reading of it, and I am reasonably familiar with
28			the case, was that the brother in question had
29			written to one of the youngsters who was at that

1			stage in that particular college. The priest had
2			come across this information and luckily enough he
3			did because he brought it then to light to the
4			various, whoever it happened to be, I presume to the
5			Provincial of the Congregation.
6	234	Q.	You don't read into it the other interpretation that
7			thank God it was the priest and not the civil
8			authorities that found out and reported it?
9		A.	I am not though I am not saying that that may not
10			have been in the thinking of the person who wrote it.
11	235	Q.	I see. Could you look at pages 66 and 67. There is
12			an interesting letter here in relation to an
13			offender, which probably at the beginning betrays the
14			time it was written in, 1959, because it refers to
15			the brother who has been sent away to England. It
16			refers to the fact:
17			"That he has done almost to the lowest
18			"That he has gone almost to the lowest depths. Amongst his belongings were two copies of the News of the World and
19			also a copy of a French newspaper. The News of the World is a banned newspaper in Ireland."
20			in Ireland."
21			
22			To be less frivolous about it, a serious matter.
23			This is dealing with a brother who had been found to
24			be guilty of sexual abuse. When I say "guilty", not
25			in the courts but it was known that he was doing
26			this. At the end of that letter, it says:
27			"He knew he said that it was the collar
28			"He knew he said that it was the collar that saved him from jail."
29			

1 What does that mean?

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

- A. I don't know what it means because I don't know what happened the case.
- Doesn't it appear to mean that there was one régime for clerics and another for lay people with regard to these sort of matters, isn't that what it appears to be?
- A. In that instance it is certainly open to that interpretation without a doubt.
- 10 237 Could I invite you to think about this and maybe 0. 11 comment on it. Do you feel that at that time there 12 was this culture among the Christian Brothers, and 13 perhaps other religious bodies too, that scandal was 14 the uppermost thing and there was less concern about 15 the victims of sexual abuse and there was great 16 concern that it wouldn't get into the public domain 17 and be reported to the civil authorities?
 - A. They were certainly grateful that it wouldn't get into the public domain. I would say the understanding of the abuse and its effect on the young people wasn't known and certainly it wasn't in any way addressed not only not adequately, it probably doesn't seem to have been addressed at all because there is never any mention as to what happened in relation to the youngster, there is in relation to this one as to what happened. My understanding on that one, if I am thinking of the right one, is that the person in question disappeared off to England. I don't know from whom the collar

1			saved him or who knew about it and decided that
2			because of the fact he was wearing a collar nothing
3			else would happen.
4	238	Q.	If you look through the examples you give in this
5			section of the submission, there are six cases you
6			deal with?
7		A.	Yes.
8	239	Q.	You are aware I am sure that there are numerous other
9			complaints before the Commission of sexual abuse?
10		A.	Yes.
11	240	Q.	If you take the sixth example there at the top of
12			page 124. You say:
13			"The Superior boying confronted the
14			"The Superior having confronted the accused who admitted to such offences
15			sent a written report of the complaint and the response of the accused to the Provincial Council."
16			Trevineral education
17			Dispensation then was granted to this person. Here
18			we have a Brother who has admitted what is a criminal
19			offence, a serious matter, a sexual assault on a
20			child and it's not reported to the Gardaí. It's not
21			a question of not being sure, the person has admitted
22			it?
23		A.	Yes, I accept that. I don't know what the situation
24			in relation to reporting at the time was. It would
25			appear on a reading of these cases that for whatever
26			reason the authorities and the Congregation at the
27			time didn't see that as a step which they should have
28			taken, which I am saying obviously now that they

should have. The only thing I can do is offer you a

- spectrum of what may be the causes, I can't say what
- 2 particular reason it was that brought them to take
- 3 that decision or rather not to take the decision
- 4 which they should have taken.
- 5 241 Q. The first example you deal with in this section of
- the submissions is at page 122. Again we have the
- 7 brother confessing voluntarily that he abused a boy
- 8 in Artane?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 242 Q. In this case it was considered by the General Council
- of the Congregation and a unanimous decision was
- taken not to expel him but to issue a canonical
- 13 warni ng?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 243 Q. We have the Congregation being unanimous in a
- decision not to expel him even though he admitted he
- 17 has abused a boy?
- 18 A. Unfortunately in relation to that case as you can see
- 19 it's dated August 1932.
- 20 244 Q. Yes, it's outside ... (INTERJECTION)
- 21 A. I am not saying that it's outside, but I don't know
- 22 what happened to him afterwards and in fact had great
- 23 difficulty in finding any reference to him or who he
- 24 was or what the nature of it was. It may, for
- instance, have been, and I think that is mentioned in
- some other one, that at that stage he was elderly or
- 27 whatever it happened to be and they said at this
- stage that perhaps in everybody's best interests the
- 29 things to do was to keep him within the Congregation,

1 which is the call that would still have to be made by 2 any Congregation at present if there is an abuser, 3 what's the best course of action to take. hand people may say obviously he should be expelled, 4 5 but then in which instances is he a greater danger to Where he is expelled and left to his own 6 7 devices or where he is in a Congregation who may in 8 some way be able to monitor his actions or at least 9 have some control over him. I am not saying all that 10 thinking went into the 1932 one, I presume it didn't, 11 but unfortunately I haven't sufficient and it took 12 quite some search to some up with any document, for 13 obvious reasons in 1932 to come up with any 14 documentation on that. I don't know. As you can see 15 there is nothing at the end as there are in the other 16 ones as to what happened him or where he went or what 17 age he was or anything of that nature, but that is 18 simply a lack of documentation and of knowledge. 19 245 Q. Case No. 2 there where the matter involving that 20 brother was carefully investigated by the Superior of 21 Artane? A. Yes.

22

23 246 Q. The members of the Brothers Consulters indicated 24 long, continuous and frequent wrongdoing on the part 25 of the brother. This wasn't reported to the Gardaí 26 ei ther?

27 Α. No.

28 Do you know of any case where a complaint of sexual 247 0. 29 abuse or worse still an admission of sexual abuse on

ı			the part of a prother was reported to the Gardai in
2			this period?
3		A.	Not in that period.
4	248	Q.	Was any Layperson ever reported by the Christian
5			Brothers?
6		A.	I don't know. I haven't come across documentation of
7			it, but I am not saying that it didn't happen.
8	249	Q.	On page 124 you say:
9			
10			"That the procedures for dealing with child abuse are exemplified in the six
11			cases outlined above. When the abuse came to the attention of the local
12			Superior he reported it to the Provincial, at which stage it was
13			investigated by the Provincial Council. The Provincial then forwarded it or
14			reported to the Superior General and its Council where it was investigated
15			again. At all stages the allegations of abuse were put to the accused. The
16			sanction applied was either dismissal or canonical warning."
17			
18			You say:
19			"It's notoworthy that in the 1044 eaces
20			"It's noteworthy that in the 1944 cases where the boys themselves made
21			complaints they were believed and encouraged to make written statements and swift action was taken."
22			and Switt action was taken.
23			Then you say:
24			"This contradicts the commonly hold
25			"This contradicts the commonly held perception that boys could not report abuse because they would not be
26			believed and might even be punished for telling lies."
27			terring ires.
28			Can we just discuss this for a moment. What do you
29			think, looking back to the 1950's and 60's if we take

that period, what do you think in the 1950's would be the chances of any child, either in an institution or outside an institution, reporting that they had been sexually abused by a priest or a brother?

A. I think statistically it would probably be low.

Currently I think the instances of reporting at that level is low. The point I am making there was that that needn't necessarily always be laid at the fault of the management of the institute because in the ones in the 40's there are written statements of evidence in the children's own handwriting and in one instance as I mentioned in the handwriting where it was clearly an adult who took the statement down.

I am not saying that that was the norm for the time and that youngsters either within or outside an institution would readily feel themselves able to report sexual abuse because I don't think they would.

I think the whole trauma of the sexual abuse itself would militate against somebody going along and being able, apart from what the reaction of the other people might be, the actual fact of bringing themselves to admit this would happen. Frequently the abused unfortunately took on themselves the responsibility and said there must be something wrong, if this is happening to me there must be something wrong with me and so on. Anything that I say in here is not meant to diminish the seriousness of sexual abuse and so on. All I am

- saying is that there are examples in the
- documentation in relation to actual complaints made
- and acted on, admittedly not well.
- 4 250 Q. I understand what you are saying. What I am
- 5 suggesting to you is that in that era, first of all,
- 6 people generally didn't discuss sexual matters or
- details of sexual matters very much and certainly not
- 8 openly, would that be fair?
- 9 A. That's correct.
- 10 251 Q. Secondly, the clergy were held in very high esteem
- and there would have been an added reticence to make
- 12 such an accusation?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 252 Q. On that account I suggest to you that a lot of people
- 15 would feel that they wouldn't be believed?
- 16 A. I mean that seems to be the case. First of all,
- 17 youngsters of that age it would be a very difficult
- thing for them to do. Secondly, they certainly
- 19 wouldn't be believed as readily then as they would be
- 20 now. In spite of that there are examples of it
- 21 having taken place.
- 22 253 Q. Of course. Even what you say wouldn't that tend to
- 23 suggest that there would be a serious underreporting
- of these instances?
- 25 A. Yes.
- 26 254 Q. That is likely?
- 27 A. That is likely right across society.
- 28 255 Q. Across society as a whole, I agree. There are a
- 29 number of complaints, and I can't go into them in

- 1 this public forum, but from statements which have
- been given, and I have in front of me 10 different
- 3 complainants where boys made complaints relating to
- 4 sexual abuse and these matters were frequently
- 5 punished or to put it bluntly beaten as a result of
- 6 making those complaints and in one or two instances
- were actually assaulted again in a sexual way by the
- 8 person they had complained of?
- 9 A. First of all, as you say they are individual cases
- and I am not familiar with them here so really I am
- not in any position to comment to them except to say
- that presumably they will come in private hearings.
- 13 256 0. Yes.
- 14 A. The other thing I would say about them that only one
- side of the equation is contained in those; the other
- side of the equation has to be put alongside.
- 17 257 Q. Of course I accept that. What I am really inviting
- 18 you to agree with is that having regard to the mores
- of the time and the customs and sensibilities of
- 20 people at the time that it's quite likely that there
- 21 was a serious underreporting not only in industrial
- 22 schools but in society in general of sexual crimes
- agai nst young people?
- A. I agree with you on that, yes.
- 25 258 Q. Would you agree, therefore, that the picture you
- give, accurate as it may be, is a very limited
- 27 picture of your knowledge and the Christian Brother's
- 28 knowledge of the problem?
- 29 A. Correct. The only ones I felt at liberty to deal

with as I say were ones that if I was challenged on I could -- some of these admittedly are coming sensitively to the public forum here, but there are people who may recognise themselves and may come along to me and say 'I totally deny all of that'. All I am saying is I have sufficient documentation to be able to stand over and to present it to the Commission and from there on in the decision really is up to the Commission. That's why obviously people

259 Q. Yes. Would you accept or not that the whole atmosphere within a place like Artane or any other similar type of institution where you have a whole lot of adolescent males, no females at all, and brothers, some of whom went into the religious life at a very young age, was conducive to some forms of sexual abuse or exploitation?

aren't named in it.

A. I wouldn't really, not the abuse we are talking about here. There may have been a certain amount of peer abuse that would have been taken as a normal natural development of young people. In saying that I would have to apply the same norms or the same judgment on all single sex boys boarding schools, which I certainly would not feel able to do with probably the same balance of staffing levels on them as well. It isn't quite true to say that there were no females on the staff, there was a limited number. There was a nurse, there was a seemstress, there was a woman working in the laundry. Towards the very end there

1			was a woman on the staff	of the primary school, but
2			generally speaking it was	a male dominated society,
3			both young and old. So I	would say were quite a lot
4			of boarding schools at th	e time and, therefore, to
5			make a generalisation of	that nature I don't think is
6			sustai nabl e.	
7	260	Q.	Yes. What you say in you	r submission is that while
8			you accept and the Brothe	rs accept that there was
9			some sexual abuse that it	wasn't systematic?
10		A.	Yes.	
11	261	Q.	What do you mean when you	say "systematic"?
12		A.	That it wasn't inherent i	n the system. In other
13			words, there were individ	ual cases of abuse, but it
14			isn't a system which by i	ts very nature produced
15			abuse or that there was a	knowledge right across the
16			board that abuse was goin	g on and that it was
17			happening in a manner in	which groups of people were
18			cooperating with each oth	er. I am using in both
19			levels both systemic in o	ne sense and systematic in
20			the other. Obviously in	an individual case
21			(INTERJECTION)	
22	262	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	Is there a difference
23				between systemic and
24			systematic?	
25		A.	Yes.	
26	263	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	What is it?
27		A.	One, (INTERJECTION)	
28			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Sorry, I am not trying to
29				trick you. This is a

1			genuine question, it may	lead to my embarrassment.
2		A.	I can set about my work i	n a systematic fashion doing
3			it one step after another	and an individual abuser
4			can set about his abuse i	n a systematic manner by
5			grooming somebody and the	n moving on. That's what
6			I would call systematic.	The other is systemic. The
7			very fact that you are in	that system means that you
8			were likely to be abused,	that's the difference I am
9			making between the two.	
10			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Mr. Lowe seems to agree
11				with you. I would have
12			thought that the word sys	tematic meant pertaining to
13			a system and that systemi	c meant something of the
14			same, but I can see what	you mean. There is systemic
15			infection, I suppose, is	it in the system.
16			MR. LOWE:	I accept his distinction.
17			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Very good. Then you are
18				obviously right.
19	264	Q.	MR. McGOVERN:	There appeared from the
20				limited records that are
21			referred to cases where b	rothers admitted to their
22			superiors that they were	guilty of sexual abuse?
23		A.	Yes.	
24	265	Q.	There was a knowledge the	re on the part of the
25			superiors that this was g	oing on?
26		A.	Yes.	
27	266	Q.	Do you think that that was	s adequately dealt with
28			then?	

A. Not by present day standards, but if you look at page

1 125 you will see that in, I think it's about 1944, 2 that the Brothers did, the Congregation Leadership at the time did issue quidelines which just to run 3 through them quickly said: 4 "Brothers should not prevent or discourage boys to come to the Superior with complaints. Boys should have free access to the Superior at all times. No brother, young or old, is to allow a boy enter his bedroom. No brother is to be alone with a boy in any place." 6 7 8 9 Then panels and so on in the door which would be part 10 11 of any child protection document of the current day. I would say in one sense that particular set of 12 13 quidelines was ahead of its time. That was sent out to the Resident Manager and these were the guidelines 14 15 from which the Resident Manager was to operate. Why did he have to give those directions? 16 267 0. 17 For the same reason as every school in the country is Α. now required to give them or any other place that is 18 19 dealing with young people for child protection. Was that in response to something? This was 1944 we 20 268 Q. 21 are talking about? 22 Α. Correct, yes, but it is in response to a number of 23 the cases that arose at that stage. This is quite 24 obvious from reading that some of these things did 25 take place, that people obviously were alone with 26 boys and people did A, B and C which the Superiors 27 were now saying -- the last one, maybe it's not 28 included here, but the last one was:

"Should a Brother see any of these

1			being infringed he the attention of	e is to bring it to the Resident Manager
2			i minediateiy.	
3			MD MacovedNi	Vac
4	0.40	0	MR. McGOVERN:	Yes.
5	269	Q.	MR. LOWE:	When you say those
6				guidelines were ahead of
7			its time, are you say	ying that people at that time
8			simply disregarded th	nem because they were irrelevant?
9		A.	No. What I am saying	g is that they are very familiar
10			to me because I have	seen them in child protection
11			guidelines all over	the place nowadays. I taught for
12			quite a long time, fo	or many years, and never had any
13			child protection gui	delines at all presented to me by
14			anyone. I am saying	they were ahead of their time at
15			that stage. I would	say in the 40's there was
16			probably no school i	n the country that had a child
17			protection policy in	relation to sexual abuse.
18	270	Q.	MR. LOWE:	I am simply trying to tease
19				out what people at the time
20			thought of guidelines	s if they were ahead of the time?
21		A.	I don't know.	
22	271	Q.	MR. LOWE:	You are implying that they
23				were simply disregarded?
24		A.	Indeed I am not, no.	I am implying that they were
25			being disregarded.	Nhat I am saying is the fact that
26			abuse was discovered	the Congregation authorities
27			said we need to lay	down some very strict rules to
28			that insofar as poss	ble that that never happens
29			again What Lam say	ving is that in spite of the fact

1 that industrial schools weren't the only places in 2 which abuse took place or perpetrated the first 3 official guidelines in relation to sexual abuse at the very best that I am aware of relate to the late 4 In fact, the early courses in the 70's in 5 6 childcare in relation to people training to work in 7 childcare institutions would tell you that sexual 8 abuse wasn't mentioned at all as part of their course 9 so I would say they were ahead of their time in that 10 case rather in a sense that people disregarded them. 11 272 Ο. MR. McGOVERN: In your conclusion on this 12 section you say that the 13 analysis of those cases you refer to show that while 14 the approach to instances of sexual abuse of children 15 were very inadequate by present day standards, 16 nonetheless the manner in which the Congregation 17 dealt with such matters is characterised by the 18 following and you list a few items. The first one is 19 what I would like you to comment on. You say there was no cover-up of the issue? 20 21 Sorry, I am not sure where you are. A. 22 273 Q. It's on page 129, I am sorry. You say that the 23 manner in which they dealt with it was characterised 24 by the following and you mention a number of items. 25 The first of which was there was no cover-up of the 26 i ssue. 27 Α. Yes. 28 Can I suggest to you that by not reporting any of 274 0.

29

these matters to the Gardaí one could interpret that

- as a cover-up. You were trying to keep it within the confines of the Christian Brothers and the school?
- 3 Α. Yes, it could be interpreted that way. saying in relation to that is I don't know what the 4 5 When I talk about cover-up, people were believed and they didn't say 'this is going on, we 6 7 are not going to do anything about it, we will simply 8 bury it and move away from it'. The Brothers were 9 called on, there was an investigation carried out and 10 in most cases they were dismissed. I agree with you, 11 it wasn't reported to the civil authorities. 12 I mean in the wording there, the perception that 13 I have heard in some places was this was dealt with, 14 people were sent away somewhere else or transferred 15 somewhere else quietly and the thing was simply 16 buried and not dealt with, that's what I am referring 17 to there by no cover-up. I am guite aware of the 18 non-reporting to the civil authorities.
- 19 275 Q. Just for the avoidance of doubt is it the view of the 20 Christian Brothers now that these matters should have 21 been reported to the Gardaí?
- 22 A. Yes.
- 23 MR. McGOVERN: That's really all I want 24 like to ask you about,
- Brother. You have a final statement and I suppose in fairness to you it's probably better if you want to read that out rather than me reading it.
- 28 276 Q. THE CHAIRPERSON: Before you get to that,
 29 Brother, could I ask you,

1			those guidelines, here we have 1944, a specific set
2			of guidelines designed to prevent sexual abuse of
3			chi I dren?
4		A.	Yes.
5	277	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON: To whom were they
6			published, to whom were
7			they sent?
8		A.	I presume to Artane Industrial School. There was one
9			other letter and it specifically says on the top of
10			it to all industrial schools. I am presuming, maybe
11			I am wrong, but I am presuming that was sent to
12			Artane only, I don't know, but that was my
13			presumpti on.
14	278	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON: I am a little puzzled about
15			that if this was the
16			Provincial Council. The Provincial Council would be
17			the governing body in the country. Why would it only
18			send it to Artane if it had devised these sexual
19			protections or these child protections, which were
20			obviously very significant. I mean for 1944 they
21			certainly were advanced?
22		A.	Yes. Presumably because in their lack of wisdom,
23			they would not forgive me for saying that, in their
24			lack of wisdom that didn't realise that if this is a
25			problem in one institution there is a likelihood that
26			it may be a problem in other institutions. I think
27			they looked on instances of sexual abuse as an
28			individual thing that was happening and in fact in
29			some cases and until relatively recent times that the

1			person could be cured or could be sent on a course or
2			a retreat or given religious penances which sometimes
3			happened and then the thing would go away, which of
4			course is totally wrong.
5			
6			Unfortunately it was the understanding then, and the
7			understanding I would say in relatively recent times,
8			that the person could be sent on a course and
9			rehabilitated and given, whatever the institution
10			was, essentially what was a clean bill of health
11			which of course isn't the situation. I would say
12			from a very inadequate understanding of the nature of
13			sexual abuse is the reason for that. Having said
14			that it's my surmise that it went to all
15			(INTERJECTION)
16	279	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON: I understand, you are
17			doing the best you can.
18			From Looking at the documents
19		A.	Yes.
20	280	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON: are you fairly sure that
21			that was sent to Artane and
22			only to Artane?
23		A.	No, I am certain it was sent to Artane. I haven't
24			come across any documentation to say it was sent to
25			elsewhere. Having said that
26	281	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON: No, I understand.
27		A.	I would repeat what I said earlier: I am not
28			familiar with the documentation in the other ones.
29			I think I am reasonably correct it certainly was

1			sent to Artane. Whether	it was sent to other places	
2			I don't know.		
3	282	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	When sent to Artane it	
4				would have to be circulated	
5			to all the brothers in Artane?		
6		A.	Yes.		
7	283	Q.	THE CHAIRPERSON:	It wasn't something that	
8				would be confined to the	
9			Manager or the management	team?	
10		A.	No, my memory of it was that it was sent by letter		
11			and these were instructions to the Resident Manager		
12			which were to be relayed then to the staff.		
13			THE CHAIRPERSON:	Thank you.	
14			MR. McGOVERN:	Chairman, I might be able	
15				to assist the Members of	
16			the Committee on this and	lit can be checked by	
17			Mr. Hanratty and his team	n in due course, but it seems	
18			to be a follow-on from a	visitation report to Artane	
19			of 30 October 1944 which	deals with these sort of	
20			issues and raises these m	natters.	
21			THE CHAIRPERSON:	I think that's the point	
22				that Br. Reynolds makes.	
23			He says arising out of th	nis, out of these events the	
24			Provincial Council intere	ested itself in the problem	
25			and produced these. You	say the relevant is the	
26			visitation report which h	ne cites in fact of October	
27			1944.		
28			MR. McGOVERN:	Yes. I think it's on page	
29				27 of the book. It appears	

ı			to be related to that, I am not certain.
2			MR. HANRATTY: Sorry, if I can assist you,
3			Sir. We were just about to
4			draw your attention to page 29, which is the third
5			page of that report. It is fairly under the heading
6			'Miscellaneous' that the genesis of all of this was
7			as a specific response to the problem that happened
8			in Artane.
9	284	Q.	MR. McGOVERN: Br. Reynolds, as I said
10			I have no further questions
11			to ask you, but you have a final statement which
12			I think in fairness to you, you might want to read
13			out rather than have me read, if you wish to do that?
14		A.	I think rather than reading it verbatim maybe I will
15			summarise it.
16	285	Q.	Just summarise the position.
17		A.	The Congregation's understanding of Artane is that
18			from the time it was opened until it closed it took
19			on the job of providing care and education for people
20			who found themselves in a disadvantaged situation.
21			It did that to the best of its ability and in the
22			main I would say was successful in doing it. There
23			were instances of abuse and I don't want to appear to
24			deny them or to minimise them in any way
25			and certainly don't want to cause any additional harm
26			to people who have been already harmed and I repeat
27			the apology of the Brothers to such people.
28			
29			I would also say, as has been mentioned in some of

1	the statements of the Commission, that the Brothers
2	also in making a submission like this are also in
3	agreement with the Committee that the process of
4	reconciliation in places where it has begun should
5	continue and where it hasn't that perhaps the report
6	of the Committee and so on may help in that
7	particular process.
8	
9	I would also say that perspective needs to be brough
10	to it. I wouldn't want everybody to be demonised by
11	the sins of the few or the work that was done by the
12	Brothers in other Congregations in industrial school
13	and by the vast majority who did this to the very
14	best of their ability with limited resources
15	I wouldn't want that to be diminished.
16	MR. McGOVERN: Thank you very much,
17	Brother.
18	
19	END OF EXAMINATION OF BR. REYNOLDS BY MR. McGOVERN
20	
21	MR. HANRATTY: There is just one matter,
22	Sir. I just feel I should
23	mention it because there is a little bit of a
24	concern, and certainly I don't want to make too much
25	of it. It relates to the report of the chaplain to
26	which reference was made this morning, and in respec
27	of which my Friend, Mr. McGovern, very fairly pointe
28	out that the Department of Education took strong

exception to and disagreed fairly severely with

virtually all of the contents of that report. concern that the Congregation has is that people may leave this room today, this being a public hearing and the remainder being in private, and I know full well that the Commission will be going into all kinds of matters in much more detail in private, but the concern is that people may leave the room today with the impression that here we have a perspective from a genuinely concerned objective observer which may well by the case. They would not be aware from the manner in which it emerged this morning, and I don't say that it's anybody's fault how it emerged, but they may not be aware that there is at least a basis for a question mark as to the reliability of that report, and I don't put it any higher than that and I don't want to be in any way pejorative.

First of all, it is a well known fact because it's in the public realm that the author of the report was himself convicted of sexual abuse of a teenager in the past, in fact he pleaded guilty to the offence. I think in this context more importantly that it's not just the fact that the Department of Education was in disagreement with him which raises a question mark over the reliability of anything or everything in the report, but that within the report itself there are matters, particularly I am referring to education, what he says about the quality of the education, which we know already by objective

1	evidence were spectaculari	ly wrong. I say simply that
2	there is a question mark	there over the reliability.
3	It has obviously all yet	to be determined, but I just
4	simply wanted to flag it a	at this stage, Sir, and
5	obvi ousl y	
6	I don't want to go into a	ny detail. That's as far as
7	I will put it for now.	
8	THE CHAIRPERSON:	Ms. Shanley?
9	MS. SHANLEY:	No.
10	THE CHAIRPERSON:	Very good. Thank you very
11		much. We will proceed to
12	the private hearings.	
13		
14	THE PUBLIC HEARING CONCLU	<u>DED</u> .
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
26		
27		
28		

•	121 [1] - 118:16 122 [1] - 125:6	1946 [1] - 45:25 1947 [3] - 20:18,	1998 [2] - 10:14, 12:15	4
'62 [1] - 102:4	124 [3] - 118:24,	20:22, 56:5	19th [1] - 8:3	4 [2] - 100:20, 119:11
'63/64 [1] - 102:5	124:12, 127:8	1948 [1] - 40:12	1st [1] - 71:14	40 [1] - 38:18
'67 [1] - 102:5	125 [1] - 134:1	1950 [2] - 8:8, 31:26		40's [3] - 120:11,
'care' [1] - 53:21	129 [1] - 136:22	1950's [17] - 8:6, 8:9,	2	128:10, 135:15
'cheery [1] - 44:14	13 [5] - 23:6, 51:6,	8:17, 13:17, 13:28,	2	400 [1] - 21:8
' do [1] - 57:11	71:25, 87:13, 102:4	22:20, 22:27, 27:23,	2 [7] - 1:6, 2:16, 5:11,	42% [2] - 71:19, 72:1
'fundamentally [1] -	13% [1] - 71:22	39:14, 40:3, 43:3,	5:26, 6:2, 119:4,	422 [1] - 8:7
44:8	136 [1] - 8:17	45:12, 60:20, 69:28,	126:19	43 [1] - 40:25
'get [1] - 115:20	13th [2] - 80:3, 88:24	92:14, 127:29, 128:1	2,228,654 [1] - 92:4	44 [1] - 45:17
'good [1] - 44:15	14 [3] - 106:9,	1951 [1] - 79:9	2.5% [2] - 72:10,	44% [1] - 54:23
'if [1] - 97:10	111:25, 112:2	1952 [10] - 27:18,	72:11	45 [1] - 48:1
'look [2] - 33:7, 33:19	15 [6] - 87:16, 87:26,	42:16, 42:26, 44:22,	2.6 [1] - 23:4	46 [3] - 20:19, 48:19,
'miscellaneous' [1] -	91:15, 91:17, 91:29,	44:23, 48:7, 66:20,	20 [4] - 20:19, 30:2,	102:2
141:6	92:4	69:28, 69:29, 94:26	31:23, 87:25	47 [1] - 20:20
'no [1] - 45:1	15th [2] - 1:8, 4:2	1954 [3] - 8:24, 35:7,	200 [2] - 55:6, 97:9	48 [1] - 28:9
'oh [1] - 58:11	16 [4] - 73:4, 75:7,	69:18	2002 [1] - 10:15	
'put [1] - 7:11	87:25, 88:12	1956 [3] - 6:17,	2005 [3] - 1:8, 4:2,	5
'record [1] - 56:20	16th [2] - 53:15,	54:22, 62:9	58:23	
'simulate' [1] - 41:22	53:22	1957 [2] - 59:25,	20th [1] - 78:27	5 [3] - 106:10, 120:20
'this [3] - 56:19,	17 [1] - 88:19	60:10	21st [1] - 78:27	50 [1] - 52:9
108:7, 137:6	18 [4] - 55:7, 82:21,	1958 [3] - 8:7, 71:15,	22 [6] - 9:11, 32:12,	51 [1] - 28:20
'we [1] - 114:24	87:25, 92:3	71:20	41:9, 41:15, 87:25,	51% [1] - 72:13
'yes [1] - 44:29	18% [1] - 35:5	1958/59 [2] - 28:11,	97:25	52 [1] - 28:27
'you [1] - 53:8	1868 [3] - 7:10, 7:20,	29:5	23 [1] - 32:16	53 [1] - 53:13
	7:26	1959 [2] - 95:2,	24 [2] - 8:11, 21:19	55 [3] - 56:26, 57:17,
0	1870 [2] - 7:25, 35:2	122:14	25 [1] - 30:2	58:22
	1877 [1] - 8:1	1960 [2] - 8:11, 94:29	26 [1] - 91:14	56 [1] - 59:1
0.43% [2] - 92:10	18th [1] - 93:19	1960's [16] - 8:10,	26% [1] - 71:20	56.1 [1] - 54:23
0.54% [2] - 92:5,	19 [6] - 2:16, 31:27,	8:17, 13:17, 13:28,	262 [1] - 8:15	58 [1] - 21:28
92:10	31:28, 71:25, 72:2,	22:28, 39:15, 40:5,	26th [1] - 5:19	5th [1] - 88:29
	93:18	43:8, 45:12, 60:21,	27 [1] - 140:29	
1	19% [1] - 71:21	74:17, 75:11, 92:14,	272 [2] - 32:24, 32:25	6
	1906's [1] - 22:27	92:21, 93:4, 96:15	286 [1] - 8:13	
1 [12] - 3:7, 4:17,	1924 [1] - 17:7	1962 [11] - 15:3,	28th [1] - 7:25	60's [1] - 127:29
5:11, 5:25, 6:2, 31:23,	1930's [1] - 91:16	48:23, 59:16, 60:28,	29 [2] - 87:25, 141:4	600 [1] - 38:21
46:22, 102:13,	1931 [1] - 91:29	78:26, 78:27, 80:3,		620 [1] - 8:9
114:11, 119:2,	1932 [3] - 125:19,	93:19, 94:18, 94:29,	3	63 [1] - 120:18
119:11, 119:13	126:10, 126:13	95:3		65 [1] - 121:8
1,000 [1] - 75:28	1933 [2] - 91:13, 92:9	1963 [3] - 28:28,	3 [4] - 5:9, 6:4, 6:10,	66 [1] - 122:11
10 [7] - 71:8, 71:28,	1935 [1] - 101:8	29:4, 101:10	119:6	67 [1] - 122:11
98:12, 102:27, 106:9,	1936 [2] - 37:21,	1966 [1] - 20:23	30 [6] - 8:15, 19:3,	69 [1] - 60:19
106:10, 130:2	56:23	1967 [5] - 9:4, 20:23, 32:23, 73:23, 93:5	30:1, 30:3, 117:18,	
100% [1] - 47:13	1938 [1] - 120:20		140:19	7
102 [1] - 91:27	1939 [3] - 36:20,	1968 [6] - 22:2, 35:2,	30th [3] - 9:9, 13:8,	•
103 [1] - 92:13	71:14, 71:20	94:18, 97:5, 97:6, 97:17	97:18	7 _[2] - 57:17, 78:24
109 [1] - 107:18	1940 [2] - 54:1, 104:9	1969 [13] - 8:12, 9:9,	32 [3] - 43:11, 44:21,	7% [1] - 70:23
10:45p.m [1] - 86:27	1940's [14] - 8:3,	13:8, 16:1, 35:20,	72:2	70% [1] - 35:1
11 [6] - 52:9, 71:28,	8:16, 13:16, 13:28,	54:1, 91:13, 91:29,	32% [1] - 71:25	70's [1] - 136:5
103:17, 104:10,	22:20, 39:14, 39:28,	92:9, 97:17, 97:18,	33 [3] - 34:29, 43:11,	700 [1] - 8:1
107:3, 111:23	40:1, 50:9, 55:26,	97:19, 104:9	43:12	75% [1] - 72:18
11.9% [1] - 72:9	58:13, 91:16, 92:14,	1970 [1] - 35:17	34 [2] - 37:16, 43:11	762 [1] - 8:8
113 [1] - 8:16	120:12	1971 [1] - 101:8	35 [2] - 66:19, 87:16	794 [1] - 8:5
116 [1] - 115:6	1944 [9] - 37:29,	1980's [2] - 12:2,	36 [2] - 44:21, 87:25	
12 [5] - 10:29, 20:28,	39:19, 127:19, 134:1,	136:5	36% [1] - 72:11	<u> </u>
71:28, 91:17, 97:16	134:20, 138:1,	1982 [1] - 14:7	38 [2] - 91:13, 91:15	8
12,010 [1] - 92:1	138:20, 140:19,	1986 [1] - 37:17	392 [1] - 8:11	8 [3] - 86:5, 91:11,
12.5% [1] - 72:12	140:27	1987 [1] - 37:17	3rd [1] - 88:22	106:10
	1945 [1] - 37:29			.00.10

800 [3] - 8:4, 21:8,	128:19, 128:29,	130:26	administering [1] -	89:19, 90:10
41:29	130:4, 131:17, 131:18, 131:20,	accusation [1] - 129:12	46:24	agent [1] - 17:17
802 [1] - 8:5 81 [1] - 71:8	132:9, 132:13,	accused [5] - 64:7,	administration [4] - 14:27, 17:1, 17:5,	ages [1] - 36:5 ago [2] - 59:5, 87:21
818 [1] - 8:5	132:15, 132:16,	117:19, 124:14,	86:21	agree [25] - 14:13,
825 [1] - 8:2	133:4, 133:22,	124:15, 127:15	administrative [6] -	29:8, 47:25, 47:27,
85% [2] - 72:6, 72:13	135:17, 135:26,	accustomed [1] -	6:19, 24:2, 24:12,	50:27, 55:16, 55:17,
	136:2, 136:3, 136:8,	41:27	85:2, 87:17, 88:2	58:4, 68:24, 78:16,
9	136:14, 138:2,	achieve [1] - 70:9	admission [4] -	83:15, 83:16, 84:17,
<u> </u>	138:27, 139:13,	achieved [1] - 72:20	14:27, 34:27, 37:19,	86:1, 86:14, 87:27,
9 _[1] - 16:29	141:23, 143:20	acknowledge [1] -	126:29	88:23, 90:15, 120:27,
95% [1] - 72:17	abused [9] - 12:14,	33:22	admissions [1] -	129:28, 130:18,
96 [1] - 91:11	12:16, 118:28,	acknowledged [1] -	8:14	130:24, 130:25,
97% [1] - 72:15	119:25, 125:7,	84:16	admit [1] - 128:23	133:10, 137:10
	125:17, 128:4,	Act [3] - 7:9, 7:20,	admitted [13] - 8:16,	agreed [1] - 80:14
Α	128:24, 133:8	7:26	8:25, 8:29, 35:1, 35:2,	agreement [3] -
	abuser [3] - 118:20, 126:2, 133:3	act [1] - 93:21	35:22, 37:12, 101:23,	37:28, 37:29, 142:3
abandoned [1] - 7:27	abusers [1] - 118:29	acted [2] - 20:12,	124:14, 124:18,	ahead [7] - 35:17,
ability [3] - 36:11,	abusive [2] - 14:19,	129:3	124:21, 125:16, 133:21	43:29, 134:13, 135:6, 135:14, 135:20, 136:9
141:21, 142:14	117:5	action [7] - 50:15, 50:20, 50:21, 108:17,	admittedly [2] -	aid [1] - 61:12
able [16] - 21:7,	academic [3] - 54:6,	114:21, 126:3, 127:21	129:3, 131:2	aim [2] - 41:19, 57:22
21:18, 29:14, 40:23,	77:16	actions [1] - 126:8	adolescent [1] -	aims [1] - 4:25
70:10, 73:17, 76:19,	acceded [1] - 7:23	active [1] - 21:18	131:14	airs [1] - 75:28
76:23, 83:24, 105:1,	accept [15] - 13:29,	activities [2] - 34:13,	adopted [1] - 6:12	albeit [1] - 90:27
126:8, 128:16, 128:21, 131:7,	90:26, 104:25,	117:12	adult [2] - 58:26,	alerted [1] - 108:7
131:24, 140:14	106:28, 107:2,	activity [1] - 86:10	128:13	Alexander [1] - 1:5
abode [1] - 8:21	114:25, 116:23,	acts [1] - 45:20	advanced [3] -	alive [1] - 13:15
abolished [1] - 14:6	118:3, 121:14,	actual [9] - 32:25,	13:15, 119:27, 138:21	allegation [1] -
abscond [1] - 23:21	124:23, 130:17,	59:2, 65:4, 90:5, 97:4,	advantage [2] -	112:13
absconded [1] -	131:11, 132:8, 133:16	98:5, 116:14, 128:22,	42:21, 43:28	allegations [5] -
102:19	acceptable [4] -	129:2	adverse [1] - 105:27	89:22, 98:13, 102:29,
absconding [5] -	13:27, 13:29, 14:7,	actuated [2] - 90:1,	advised [1] - 25:10	103:4, 127:14
100:18, 100:19,	102:26	90:9	advisers [1] - 28:5	alleged [1] - 103:18
101:7, 102:7, 102:17	acceptance [2] - 31:16, 117:29	add [3] - 12:14, 90:8,	affairs [1] - 24:19	allow [1] - 134:7
absconscion [1] -	accepted [8] - 5:6,	121:22	afraid [2] - 41:10,	allowed [2] - 113:5,
101:20	35:20, 90:26, 102:21,	added [3] - 40:16,	50:3 after-care [12] - 55:5,	113:15
absconscions [1] -	102:23, 102:25,	78:22, 129:11	55:21, 55:22, 56:21,	Allowing [1] - 14:9
101:23	102:26, 108:23	adding [1] - 71:24 addition [2] - 11:12,	56:22, 56:25, 56:29,	allowing [1] - 121:23
absence [2] - 73:27,	access [4] - 40:24,	16:19	57:28, 78:2, 79:8,	almost [7] - 13:20, 21:19, 33:1, 43:17,
118:10	89:13, 113:16, 134:7	additional [1] -	89:16	68:5, 86:27, 122:17
absent [1] - 49:6	accident [1] - 52:14	141:25	afterlife [1] - 88:27	alone [3] - 13:9,
absenteeism [1] - 72:16	accidental [2] - 51:1,	address [1] - 13:1	afternoon [2] -	134:8, 134:25
Abuse[1] - 1:2	51:6	addressed [5] -	19:28, 98:22	alongside [1] -
abuse [57] - 5:14,	accidents [1] - 51:18	27:28, 42:25, 123:22,	afterwards [9] -	130:16
14:13, 15:19, 50:6,	accommodated [1] -	123:23	20:24, 30:29, 40:16,	altar [1] - 43:19
50:10, 50:18, 90:22,	35:19	adequate [4] - 7:3,	52:1, 62:15, 73:29,	alternative [2] - 6:29,
98:13, 100:15,	accommodating [1] - 61:14	27:14, 29:20, 78:14	78:4, 96:26, 125:22	57:8
102:28, 102:29,	accord [1] - 86:14	adequately [4] -	again' [1] - 108:8	amateur [1] - 39:24
103:11, 104:11,	according [6] - 36:1,	25:20, 118:29,	age [22] - 13:16,	amazed [1] - 89:25
116:23, 117:26,	36:2, 36:11, 37:11,	123:22, 133:27	36:2, 37:5, 37:11, 54:19, 71:29, 72:1	amazing [1] - 76:11
118:15, 118:17,	79:23, 116:7	adhered [4] - 47:1, 47:13, 47:17, 47:29	54:18, 71:28, 72:1, 72:26, 73:4, 75:2,	amenable [1] - 69:14
118:27, 119:1,	accords [1] - 90:15	47:13, 47:17, 47:29 adhering [1] - 26:25	75:7, 91:9, 91:29,	amended [1] - 46:3
120:21, 121:8,	account [7] - 34:20,	adjacent [1] - 75:16	92:8, 106:8, 106:10,	amendment [1] - 46:14
122:24, 123:15, 123:20, 124:9,	36:25, 71:26, 72:21,	Adjournment [2] -	107:1, 119:27,	America[1] - 75:20
126:29, 127:10,	87:6, 115:19, 129:14	98:28, 100:2	126:17, 129:17,	amount [8] - 19:20,
127:10, 127:15,	accounts [1] - 18:18	administered [3] -	131:16	37:25, 45:9, 65:7,
127:10, 127:13,	accurate [2] - 1:30,	46:23, 103:24, 116:28	agenda [3] - 20:4,	66:27, 81:7, 91:3,
-,,		, , , ,		, , ,
		2		

131:19 amounted [1] - 8:15	appreciated [1] - 5:4 appreciation [1] -	17:20, 20:17, 22:19, 24:3, 30:25, 31:29,	assess [2] - 77:21, 77:24
ample [2] - 40:8,	76:11	32:24, 32:26, 32:28,	assessed [5] - 35:28,
89:23	apprehensive [1] -	32:29, 33:13, 34:13,	36:12, 36:22, 71:11
analysis [1] - 136:13	28:8	34:22, 34:28, 36:3,	assessment [4] -
ance [1] - 58:1	apprenticeships [1]	37:18, 40:18, 40:27,	36:16, 36:19, 36:23,
Angelus[1] - 86:11	- 69:10	41:28, 42:3, 42:11,	91:2
annals [1] - 116:14	approach [4] - 85:1,	42:28, 47:2, 47:10,	assessments [1] -
annoyed [1] - 81:1	96:15, 118:16, 136:14	47:17, 48:28, 49:4,	36:13
annual [1] - 92:2	approached [1] -	49:13, 53:13, 53:14,	assign [1] - 66:12
annum [1] - 92.2	7:21	54:10, 54:27, 57:18,	assigned [6] - 35:22,
answer [6] - 58:18,	approaches [1] -	57:26, 57:27, 58:2,	35:24, 35:27, 35:29,
61:19, 75:9, 85:7,	86:10	58:15, 60:15, 61:14,	37:3, 37:4
109:18, 120:10	appropriate [3] -	63:22, 64:25, 65:1,	assignment [1] -
answering [1] -	104:16, 107:27,	65:3, 65:18, 66:22,	36:29
65:15	107:28	66:24, 69:11, 69:25,	assist [3] - 7:22,
answers [2] - 36:25,	approval [1] - 35:11	70:2, 70:6, 71:4,	140:15, 141:2
85:5	April [1] - 10:15	72:15, 72:20, 72:29,	assistance [4] -
anxious [1] - 93:22	aptitude [1] - 75:4	73:7, 73:27, 74:2,	21:16, 56:1, 86:27,
Anyway[3] - 78:12,	Archbishop [19] -	75:3, 75:14, 75:19,	93:11
101:1, 116:9	7:20, 15:4, 15:8,	76:6, 76:10, 76:18,	Assistant[1] - 32:6
anyway [2] - 81:22,	15:28, 79:5, 79:6,	77:20, 77:22, 79:6,	associated [1] - 23:8
120:10	79:18, 80:10, 80:11,	80:1, 81:27, 82:5,	Association [5] -
apart [2] - 73:5,	89:15, 93:11, 93:18,	86:9, 88:25, 89:1,	19:16, 19:23, 19:25,
128:21	93:22, 93:25, 94:22,	89:9, 90:17, 91:6,	20:5, 111:15
Apart [1] - 73:9	95:7, 95:14, 96:24,	91:8, 91:10, 91:13,	assured [1] - 52:15
apocryphal [2] -	96:28	91:14, 91:17, 92:8,	atmosphere [5] -
115:19, 116:9	archives [4] - 11:7,	92:10, 92:15, 92:24,	48:28, 81:29, 102:1,
apologised [1] -	11:8, 11:10, 104:18	93:21, 94:12, 94:23,	102:7, 131:12
12:15	area [14] - 6:23,	94:28, 95:23, 95:26,	attached [1] - 100:20
apology [2] - 12:16,	17:21, 18:17, 24:3,	96:2, 96:24, 97:1,	attain [1] - 70:26
141:27	34:10, 40:13, 44:2,	97:11, 102:1, 104:14,	attainment [6] - 36:1,
apparel [1] - 89:23	69:17, 69:26, 70:13,	105:25, 105:27,	36:6, 36:7, 65:20,
appear [11] - 25:17,	75:15, 77:14, 77:15,	106:16, 107:23,	70:5, 72:19
44:11, 49:19, 53:6,	98:18	108:27, 109:5, 109:7,	attempt [1] - 67:9
55:26, 79:14, 85:24,	areas [8] - 12:26,	113:5, 114:15, 121:15, 125:8,	attend [2] - 31:6,
114:21, 123:4,	14:25, 15:21, 20:14,	126:21, 131:12,	75:11
124:25, 141:23	53:29, 65:29, 66:9,	138:8, 138:12,	attendance [2] -
appearance [1] -	81:23	138:18, 139:21,	8:22, 71:4
115:11	arise [3] - 6:9, 51:15,	139:22, 139:23,	attended [1] - 27:12
appeared [4] - 58:13,	64:11	140:1, 140:3, 140:5,	attending [1] - 73:24
104:27, 104:28,	arisen [1] - 10:21	140:18, 141:8, 141:17	attention [8] - 28:7,
133:19	arising [1] - 140:23	artane [1] - 107:1	41:9, 58:22, 87:11,
appellant [1] - 2:28	arm [2] - 107:18,	article [3] - 41:6,	88:10, 127:11, 135:1,
appendices [1] -	107:21	104:6, 115:4	141:4
71:16	arose [3] - 89:17,	articles [4] - 41:7,	attitude [3] - 108:5,
appendix [3] -	110:15, 134:23	100:25, 112:10,	108:11, 121:16
100:20, 101:7, 102:13	arrival [1] - 28:14	112:12	attitudes [2] - 9:6,
applied [3] - 32:24,	arrived [3] - 59:17,	ascribed [1] - 49:9	13:27
32:25, 127:15	73:22, 113:15	aspect [4] - 25:20,	attribute [1] - 44:12
apply [1] - 131:22	arriving [1] - 37:24	39:22, 41:3, 111:10	August[1] - 125:19
applying [2] - 31:4,	Artane [150] - 4:8,	aspects [8] - 12:24,	aunt [1] - 61:23
66:15	4:14, 4:23, 4:25, 5:15,	17:22, 20:8, 21:15,	author [3] - 67:23,
appointed [7] -	6:23, 7:24, 8:4, 8:19,	25:27, 98:11, 103:10,	120:29, 143:19
10:13, 18:10, 18:11,	8:25, 8:29, 9:10,	108:3	authorises [1] -
20:24, 56:6, 56:13,	10:24, 11:21, 12:1,	assault [1] - 124:19	46:25
57:1	12:3, 12:10, 12:18,	assaulted [1] - 130:7	authoritative [1] -
appointing [1] -	13:7, 13:10, 14:19,	assembled [1] -	87:17
89:15	14:28, 15:14, 16:3,	101:19	authorities [8] -
annreciate (1) - 33.6	16:20, 16:27, 17:17,		7:13 96:3 122:8

appreciate [1] - 33:6

123:17, 124:26, sess [2] - 77:21, 135:26, 137:11, sessed [5] - 35:28, 137:18 2, 36:22, 71:11 authority [2] - 31:26, sessment [4] -96:10 availability [1] -6, 36:19, 36:23, 68:23 available [5] - 39:4, sessments [1] -60:21, 71:14, 75:1, 108:26 sign [1] - 66:12 average [7] - 8:5, signed [6] - 35:22, 8:9, 8:12, 58:27, 4, 35:27, 35:29, 72:13, 88:4, 92:17 37:4 signment [1] averaged [1] - 72:17 avoidance [1] -137:19 sist [3] - 7:22, 15, 141:2 aware [17] - 47:20, 49:29, 63:29, 85:20, sistance [4] -6, 56:1, 86:27, 85:21, 94:16, 105:22, 109:12, 109:23, 117:6, 118:12, sistant[1] - 32:6 118:25, 124:8, 136:4, sociated [1] - 23:8 137:17, 143:10, sociation [5] -6, 19:23, 19:25, 143:13 awareness [1] -111:15 sured [1] - 52:15 118:20 nosphere [5] -8, 81:29, 102:1, В 7, 131:12

7:13, 96:3, 122:8,

Bach [1] - 75:29 backfired [1] - 81:7 background [9] -4:29, 36:9, 68:9, 71:26, 73:5, 76:20, 79:1, 79:2, 95:19 backgrounds [1] bad [4] - 41:27, 88:26, 88:27, 116:5 badly [2] - 57:23, 108:2 bakers [1] - 67:26 baking [1] - 54:4 balance [6] - 12:17, 48:13, 67:10, 104:3, 109:2, 131:25 balanced [2] - 44:16, 117:24 balancing [1] - 66:24 baldy [1] - 83:2 Band[2] - 75:19, 76:6 band [11] - 18:2, 24:6, 24:12, 32:9, 34:15, 34:16, 39:6, 67:26, 76:15, 77:10, 77:13 bands [2] - 70:18, banned [1] - 122:19

based [3] - 4:24,	better [9] - 33:14,	boots [1] - 66:29	25:16	9:20, 10:11, 10:21,
11:4, 71:15	62:20, 71:25, 73:25,	borderline [1] -	branches [1] - 17:18	11:8, 11:13, 11:29,
basic [1] - 88:26	73:26, 77:18, 107:16,	72:11	bread [1] - 81:11	12:29, 13:3, 13:12,
basis [7] - 17:29,	110:10, 137:26	boss [1] - 18:6	break [4] - 21:10,	14:11, 14:15, 14:16,
22:6, 85:11, 90:27,	Between [1] - 91:13	bottom [7] - 41:15,	83:7, 98:17, 98:25	15:5, 15:9, 15:29,
96:14, 106:25, 143:13	between [20] - 35:2,	43:13, 43:21, 44:9,	breakdown [2] -	16:2, 16:4, 19:22,
batch [1] - 114:2	37:26, 49:4, 51:29,	52:10, 52:11, 57:17	71:9, 71:18	19:24, 20:19, 20:23,
Bear[1] - 84:14	52:20, 54:1, 60:1,	bought [1] - 67:13	breakfast [2] - 59:20,	20:27, 21:4, 21:9,
Bearing [1] - 68:8	60:7, 64:6, 70:28,	bound [1] - 64:10	81:10	21:16, 21:17, 22:7,
beaten [5] - 82:13,	80:17, 80:18, 82:17,	boy [22] - 50:11,	breaks [1] - 21:23	22:7, 22:10, 26:13,
86:24, 87:4, 108:15,	86:23, 88:11, 89:6,	51:19, 56:19, 57:1,	Brendan [1] - 2:3	26:24, 27:23, 27:29,
130:5	91:29, 115:9, 132:23,	57:6, 57:19, 58:15,	Brian [1] - 2:5	29:1, 29:29, 30:4,
became [6] - 6:28,	133:9	67:2, 68:1, 68:4,	brief [4] - 5:10, 9:16,	30:5, 30:17, 30:21,
17:4, 45:4, 68:23,	big [8] - 33:20,	86:24, 86:25, 87:4,	15:23, 37:16	30:24, 30:25, 33:6,
73:29, 102:15	33:21, 42:2, 48:28,	98:7, 107:18, 107:21,	briefly [1] - 31:15	33:19, 43:2, 43:4,
become [1] - 51:23	70:14, 81:29, 84:20,	108:14, 113:19,	bright [1] - 75:4	43:16, 45:5, 45:7,
becomes [2] - 43:16,	101:29	125:7, 125:17, 134:8,	brighter [1] - 73:16	47:8, 49:5, 49:18,
72:17	bigger [1] - 71:18	134:8	bring [5] - 22:21,	49:23, 55:24, 56:25,
becoming [5] -	bill [1] - 139:10	Boys[4] - 75:19,	68:15, 69:25, 87:11,	68:4, 69:24, 71:7,
57:22, 68:19, 68:25,	birch [1] - 46:1	76:6, 76:10, 134:6	135:1	75:13, 78:2, 78:13, 82:13, 83:19, 83:27,
94:2, 102:11	Birmingham [1] -	boys [90] - 7:28, 8:1,	bringing [3] - 49:21,	85:14, 87:5, 87:16,
bed [7] - 21:13,	112:18	8:2, 8:15, 8:19, 8:26,	70:1, 128:22	87:23, 87:26, 90:26,
42:14, 62:24, 63:7,	birth [1] - 53:23	8:27, 8:28, 9:10, 9:17,	broad [1] - 10:20	92:24, 93:6, 93:12,
64:3, 86:28, 89:23	birthday [2] - 53:15,	15:14, 19:9, 23:20,	broadly [2] - 47:26,	93:24, 94:2, 94:19,
bed-wetting [2] -	53:22	26:27, 35:2, 35:22,	57:12	94:27, 96:10, 96:15,
62:24, 64:3	bit [6] - 22:22, 45:4,	37:1, 37:12, 38:7, 38:16, 41:3, 41:29,	broke [1] - 86:26	97:10, 98:5, 102:22,
bedroom [1] - 134:8	57:14, 113:1, 142:23	41:29, 42:14, 43:15,	broken [4] - 47:3,	104:27, 109:12,
beg [2] - 59:1,	BI [5] - 2:6, 2:6, 2:7,	43:17, 44:11, 49:4,	92:13, 107:19, 107:22	113:29, 114:4, 115:9,
111:24	2:7, 2:13	49:5, 50:10, 53:14,	brother [14] - 104:1,	115:22, 116:22,
begging [1] - 8:20	blame [1] - 113:2	55:14, 55:25, 57:7,	107:22, 108:18,	117:9, 117:10,
begin [1] - 5:12	Blank[1] - 120:23	61:21, 62:22, 63:6,	120:21, 121:28,	117:28, 120:16,
beginning [5] - 8:8,	blanked [1] - 29:1 bless [2] - 95:15,	65:20, 65:28, 66:4,	122:15, 122:23,	120:19, 121:16,
60:20, 67:18, 104:17, 122:13	95:23	66:7, 66:24, 66:29,	125:7, 126:20,	123:12, 126:23,
begins [1] - 43:20	blew [1] - 38:24	67:6, 67:12, 67:26,	126:25, 127:1, 128:4, 134:7, 134:8	127:5, 132:8, 134:2,
begins [1] - 43.20 begun [1] - 142:4	bluntly [2] - 117:9,	70:6, 71:1, 71:4,	Brother [52] - 4:24,	134:5, 137:2, 137:8,
behalf [1] - 83:26	130:5	71:10, 75:28, 76:19,	10:1, 10:25, 18:8,	137:20, 141:27,
behaviours [1] -	board [2] - 106:7,	77:4, 78:17, 81:5,	19:1, 24:10, 24:11,	142:1, 142:12
13:27	132:16	82:7, 82:10, 86:28,	24:15, 26:21, 26:25,	brothers [5] - 22:18,
belief [2] - 22:9,	Board [3] - 8:14,	89:22, 90:16, 91:8,	27:26, 28:4, 28:14,	120:5, 131:15,
75:27	18:23, 58:26	91:10, 91:13, 92:15,	28:24, 29:7, 29:8,	133:21, 140:5
belittle [1] - 12:13	boarding [5] - 38:15,	97:19, 97:21, 97:25,	29:10, 29:25, 29:28,	Brothers' [3] - 20:29,
belonged [1] - 44:2	58:17, 91:7, 131:23,	98:6, 101:7, 102:19,	30:27, 42:26, 44:26,	21:27, 34:27
belongings [1] -	132:4	104:2, 104:13,	49:29, 50:7, 50:13,	brought [9] - 38:27,
122:18	bodies [1] - 123:13	111:29, 112:18,	50:23, 55:27, 56:5,	39:2, 49:23, 57:10,
below [4] - 28:11,	body [2] - 105:13,	112:22, 112:24,	56:13, 56:29, 60:22,	63:13, 102:20, 122:3,
31:18, 67:2, 92:16	138:17	112:26, 113:5,	60:24, 60:25, 60:27,	125:2, 142:9
beneficial [1] - 8:26	bolts [1] - 24:16	113:16, 117:9,	61:2, 66:25, 70:29,	bruise [1] - 52:27
benefit [1] - 13:14	book [11] - 21:29,	117:10, 121:11,	72:23, 86:26, 100:13,	bruises [3] - 51:12,
berating [1] - 58:14	28:10, 28:20, 41:9,	127:20, 127:25,	101:6, 105:12,	51:13, 52:21
Berry[3] - 88:13,	43:11, 75:21, 86:5,	130:3, 131:23, 134:6,	110:11, 114:5, 115:8,	buck [1] - 17:29 budget [1] - 66:24
90:7, 93:14	87:14, 88:12, 120:18,	134:26	117:28, 120:16,	building [2] - 16:26,
best [16] - 33:17,	140:29	boys' [1] - 91:6 Br [15] - 1:12, 3:7,	124:18, 134:29,	41:29
33:22, 41:28, 65:1,	Book [6] - 109:10,	4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:4,	137:25, 137:29,	buildings [4] - 10:28,
65:3, 66:17, 83:23,	109:16, 109:26,	10:6, 83:26, 84:22,	142:17	26:18, 65:10, 95:16
84:2, 94:29, 112:27,	110:15, 110:19, 111:6	98:16, 100:8, 120:23,	Brother' [1] - 44:15	built [1] - 40:21
125:28, 126:3, 136:4,	Bookings [1] -	140:22, 141:9, 142:19	Brother's [3] - 29:2,	bump [1] - 52:27
139:17, 141:21,	111:16	Branch [1] - 48:25	121:12, 130:27	buried [1] - 137:16
142:14	books [1] - 69:21	branch [2] - 17:19,	Brothers [111] - 2:12,	bursar [1] - 18:16
betrays [1] - 122:13	Books[1] - 111:18		4:20, 6:17, 6:18, 7:21,	20.00. [.]

C calculated [1] - 92:1 calendar [1] - 95:28 campus [2] - 40:27, 98:9 cane [4] - 45:29. 46:7, 46:12, 46:15 caning [1] - 46:1 cannot [2] - 41:26, 41:27 canonical [3] -96:11, 125:12, 127:16 capable [2] - 38:17, Cardinal [2] - 7:20, 16:5 care [28] - 7:1, 7:4, 7:5, 16:21, 16:23, 23:25, 38:9, 55:5, 55:21, 55:22, 56:21, 56:22, 56:25, 56:29, 56:29, 57:28, 58:26, 60:18, 61:6, 72:26, 73:7, 78:2, 79:8, 84:26, 84:27, 89:16, 141:19 care' [1] - 7:12 carefully [2] - 88:21, 126:20 carpenter [1] - 32:10 carpenters [1] -67:27 carpentry [2] - 54:3, 54:5 carried [15] - 25:18, 27:3, 27:19, 36:16, 36:19, 78:26, 80:23, 81:20, 85:22, 85:29, 105:19, 112:15, 114:11, 137:9 case [34] - 14:20, 28:14, 28:24, 41:28, 51:19, 51:22, 66:10, 67:26, 67:27, 79:14, 79:29, 83:11, 84:2, 104:1, 107:17, 108:14, 112:17, 113:3, 113:13, 113:17, 114:6. 114:10, 121:4, 121:8, 121:19, 121:28, 123:3, 125:10, 125:18, 126:28, 129:16, 132:20,

136:10, 143:10

bury [1] - 137:8

business [1] - 78:21

buzzes [1] - 110:6

Case[1] - 126:19 cases [36] - 51:26, 53:1, 56:15, 56:17, 57:7, 63:26, 70:14, 82:13, 91:24, 103:17, 103:23, 103:24, 103:29, 104:2, 105:26, 107:3, 107:10, 111:22, 112:8. 112:12. 113:27, 116:26, 117:26, 118:25, 118:27, 124:5, 124:25, 127:10, 127:19, 130:9, 132:13, 133:21, 134:23, 136:13, 137:10, 138:29 cash [1] - 34:25 casual [1] - 25:10 catastrophes [1] -28:17 category [2] - 72:5, 112:5 catered [3] - 18:18, 77:15, 77:19 catering [2] - 7:27, 77:28 Catholic[1] - 7:28 caused [1] - 118:21 causes [2] - 62:29, 125:1 cease [1] - 114:18 censured [1] -120:24 centre [1] - 58:28 Century[2] - 6:27, Cert[6] - 16:9, 54:10, 54:25, 66:14, 74:26, Certain[1] - 46:26 certain [23] - 11:4, 12:24, 12:27, 12:29, 34:13, 34:16, 37:25, 45:9. 50:5. 55:24. 64:14, 66:7, 66:8, 67:5, 68:5, 81:7, 91:3,

95:15, 116:4, 116:12,

131:19, 139:23, 141:1

certainly [53] - 12:5,

12:13, 23:15, 27:17,

27:19, 29:16, 36:18,

39:27, 45:4, 45:12,

47:3, 47:9, 47:16,

50:8, 51:26, 53:3,

61:8, 61:17, 61:19,

61:24, 62:1, 63:18,

67:19, 70:27, 71:17,

77:19, 77:24, 80:8,

82:15, 89:9, 89:18, 90:10, 93:3, 93:28, 95:12, 95:25, 96:28, 101:24, 105:3, 105:20, 115:13, 116:27, 119:13, 123:8, 123:18, 123:21, 129:7, 129:18, 131:24, 138:21, 139:29, 141:25, 142:24 Certainly[6] - 12:9, 47:27, 69:14, 73:19, 85:27, 108:1 certificate [1] - 97:23 certified [4] - 8:2, 25:8, 32:20, 45:18 certify [1] - 1:29 Chairman[11] - 4:6, 5:3, 9:16, 28:8, 31:14, 44:21, 79:22, 79:28, 98:20, 100:12, 140:14 Chairperson[42] -1:20, 4:4, 9:22, 10:4, 33:4, 33:27, 34:6, 41:12, 44:19, 44:22, 44:25, 44:28, 45:14, 82:19, 82:22, 82:29, 83:5, 84:25, 98:14, 98:23, 100:5, 100:22, 100:28, 110:1, 116:18, 132:22, 132:26, 132:28, 133:10, 133:17, 137:28, 138:5, 138:14, 139:16, 139:20, 139:26, 140:3, 140:7, 140:13, 140:21, 144:8, 144:10 challenge [2] - 70:4, 71:6 challenged [3] -71:6, 118:7, 131:1 challenging [1] -87:6 chance [1] - 98:24 chances [1] - 128:2 change [4] - 22:22, 22:26, 70:2 changed [3] - 22:24, 28:1, 45:8 changes [4] - 27:24, 43:5, 45:13, 92:26 changing [2] - 9:6, chapel [2] - 95:6, 95:8 chaplain [2] - 89:11, 142:25 Chaplain [14] - 79:5,

80:9, 80:15, 85:15, 86:4, 87:6, 89:25, 90:1. 90:29. 93:19 Chaplain's [5] -81:24, 88:25, 90:13, 93:13, 95:6 Chapter[2] - 45:20, 96:21 character [3] - 16:26, 48:5, 92:24 characterised [2] -136:17, 136:23 characterises [1] -57:18 characteristic [1] -16:27 charge [9] - 18:3, 19:7, 24:11, 38:19, 43:7, 55:4, 56:24, 66:25, 86:22 chastisement [1] -45:29 check [1] - 105:17 checked [1] - 140:16 cheerful [2] - 49:5, 82:8 cherish [1] - 76:13 chief [1] - 48:8 Child[1] - 1:2 child [16] - 19:13, 41:7, 46:27, 51:23, 118:19, 118:28, 119:5, 124:20, 127:10, 128:2. 134:11, 134:19, 135:10, 135:13, 135:16, 138:19 childcare [3] - 9:7, 136:6. 136:7 children [20] - 7:2, 7:11, 7:14, 8:24, 21:12, 44:2, 44:4, 44:5. 61:16. 64:10. 72:25, 73:16, 75:1, 94:6, 97:9, 97:12, 106:17, 120:7, 136:14, 138:3 children's [1] -128:11 choice [2] - 43:25, choir [1] - 77:11 chops [1] - 59:18 chorus [1] - 65:15 Christian [41] - 2:12, 4:20, 6:17, 6:18, 7:21, 9:20, 10:11, 10:21, 11:7, 11:29, 12:29, 14:10, 14:15, 14:16,

79:15, 79:19, 80:6,

15:5, 18:7, 19:22, 19:24, 21:27, 26:24, 30:4, 33:6, 33:19, 34:26, 83:19, 83:27, 96:10, 102:22, 104:27, 109:12, 115:9, 116:22, 120:16, 120:19, 121:12, 121:16. 123:12, 127:4, 130:27, 137:2, 137:20 Christmas[1] - 21:23 chronology [1] -15:26 cinema [2] - 40:19. circular [2] - 45:21, Circular[1] - 11:9 circulated [1] - 140:4 circumstances [2] -86:28, 106:19 cites [1] - 140:26 City[2] - 54:13, 94:29 city [1] - 96:17 civil [8] - 80:14, 80:19, 88:11, 89:6, 122:7, 123:17, 137:11, 137:18 clarification [1] - 5:9 class [3] - 54:22, 54:25, 58:16 classes [1] - 36:11 classical [1] - 77:6 classroom [1] -117:11 classrooms [1] -24:29 clean [2] - 63:25, 139:10 clear [6] - 5:3, 6:9, 6:28, 71:2, 79:2, 107:21 clearer [1] - 117:27 clearly [6] - 30:17, 71:5, 104:3, 113:11, 114:11, 128:13 clergy [2] - 70:12, 129:10 clerics [1] - 123:5 close [7] - 8:4, 61:13, 92:22, 93:7, 93:25, 96:23, 97:11 closed [7] - 9:5, 9:9, 13:8, 20:22, 22:2, 54:11, 141:18 closer [1] - 48:17 closing [2] - 10:29, 97:16 closure [6] - 15:17,

92:20, 93:26, 93:27,	79:20, 79:22, 79:23,	104:3, 104:10,	confines [1] - 137:2	[1] - 116:16
96:20, 97:4	79:28, 80:5, 84:7,	104:20, 104:26,	confronted [1] -	contentious [4] -
clothes [1] - 35:23	107:15, 140:16,	108:22, 114:1, 117:7,	124:13	5:27, 6:3, 6:8, 98:11
clothing [3] - 25:26,	142:3, 142:6	117:18, 118:13,	confused [1] - 84:6	contents [3] - 11:4,
60:6, 89:24	committing [1] -	124:9, 127:20, 129:2,	Congregation [33] -	12:25, 143:1
cohort [2] - 92:8,	31:11	129:29, 130:3, 130:6,	6:16, 6:17, 12:13,	context [5] - 13:26,
92:16	common [2] - 14:5,	134:6	26:6, 27:3, 29:3,	49:12, 75:22, 88:10,
collar [3] - 122:27,	62:25	completed [1] - 5:11	35:10, 45:20, 46:18,	143:22
123:29, 124:2	commonly [1] -	completely [1] -	47:25, 47:29, 103:12,	contextualise [2] -
college [2] - 25:6,	127:24	89:22	117:13, 117:15,	13:4, 108:21
122:1	communal [1] - 42:2	completing [1] - 25:5	117:17, 117:24,	continuation [1] -
Colley[2] - 115:10,	communicated [1] -	comportment [1] -	119:7, 119:16,	42:18
115:17	57:2	46:24 compositions [1] -	119:23, 119:28, 120:1, 122:5, 124:26,	continue [3] - 35:8,
combination [1] - 74:1	communion [1] - 43:19	75:28	125:11, 125:15,	68:5, 142:5 continued [2] - 8:10,
combine [1] - 72:14	community [10] -	comprising [1] -	125:29, 126:2, 126:7,	9:3
coming [21] - 4:26,	19:22, 22:13, 26:9,	5:11	134:2, 135:26,	Continued [1] - 100:8
15:13, 29:28, 31:24,	26:13, 26:15, 27:5,	concentrating [1] -	136:16, 143:2	continuous [1] -
31:27, 36:4, 36:10,	27:8, 29:17, 43:2,	84:8	Congregation's [4] -	126:24
45:7, 54:18, 60:14,	43:4	concern [5] - 123:14,	4:27, 12:18, 119:17,	contracts [3] - 56:21,
71:4, 71:27, 71:28,	comparable [2] -	123:16, 142:24,	141:17	56:22
76:18, 76:21, 81:8,	76:27, 92:16	143:2, 143:7	Congregational [1] -	contradicted [2] -
86:28, 87:24, 92:21,	compare [1] - 54:16	concerned [6] - 20:9,	96:3	80:25, 81:24
105:25, 131:2	compared [2] -	37:1, 51:5, 78:13,	congregational [1] -	contradiction [1] -
commence [1] - 5:18	105:27, 109:3	116:6, 143:9	104:1	94:7
Commenced [1] - 4:1	comparing [2] -	concerning [1] -	Congregations[1] -	contradictions [2] -
commencing [1] -	32:4, 72:2	5:28	142:12	95:10, 96:7
4:17	competed [1] - 39:26	concerns [2] - 13:2,	connection [2] -	contradicts [1] -
comment [20] -	competition [1] -	13:19	59:26, 96:18	127:24
11:27, 11:28, 11:29,	40:6	conclude [1] - 5:19	Connor[1] - 100:26	contribute [1] - 7:13
21:25, 51:16, 58:17,	competitions [1] -	Concluded [1] -	conscious [1] -	contribution [3] -
65:9, 68:10, 68:12,	39:27	144:14	98:16	12:11, 29:19, 34:22
72:22, 86:2, 86:6, 90:13, 90:25, 106:1,	compiling [1] - 11:18	concluded [1] - 81:26	consciousness [1] - 11:22	control [1] - 126:9
107:10, 115:7,	complain [3] - 50:3, 50:4, 82:11	conclusion [6] -	consequences [1] -	controversy [1] -
123:11, 130:11,	complainants [5] -	89:20, 89:29, 90:6,	119:25	33:9 convened [1] - 80:3
136:19	50:2, 64:1, 82:10,	93:7, 107:20, 136:11	consider [6] - 5:25,	convent [2] - 75:2,
commented [1] -	105:14, 130:3	conclusions [2] -	12:23, 65:19, 85:9,	76:23
77:12	complained [5] -	88:22, 114:7	108:28, 115:7	convents [2] - 72:27,
comments [6] -	13:5, 50:7, 81:3,	concrete [1] - 42:2	considerable [1] -	105:25
11:19, 22:1, 45:2,	82:13, 130:8	concur [1] - 90:2	28:28	conversation [2] -
65:9, 83:28, 112:10	complaining [2] -	condition [1] - 37:22	considered [2] -	45:5, 49:7
Commission[23] -	114:13, 114:24	conditioned [1] -	114:12, 125:10	convert [1] - 41:26
1:2, 2:1, 2:5, 4:7,	complaint [17] -	12:7	consist [1] - 4:17	convicted [1] -
4:12, 4:26, 5:14, 5:22,	7:15, 14:14, 50:11,	conditions [3] -	consisted [1] - 20:18	143:20
9:21, 10:18, 11:5,	50:25, 104:2, 104:13,	26:18, 41:20, 88:24	consists [1] - 75:27	convince [2] - 93:12,
11:12, 21:3, 71:13,	104:24, 106:25,	condone [1] - 117:15	constant [2] - 47:21,	94:19
79:9, 92:22, 97:3,	107:20, 108:25,	condoning [1] -	96:5	cook [1] - 32:9
107:12, 124:9, 131:8, 131:9, 142:1, 143:5	113:14, 114:3,	117:13	consult [1] - 28:4	cooperating [1] -
Commission's [1] -	114:25, 115:3, 124:14, 126:28	conducive [1] -	consulted [1] - 61:15	132:18
10:22		131:16	Consulters[1] - 126:23	copied [1] - 38:2
Commissioners [3] -	complaint' [1] - 114:26	conducting [1] - 84:29	contact [5] - 52:22,	copies [2] - 101:1,
12:23, 34:3, 59:9	complaints [35] -	confessing [1] -	57:7, 80:11, 85:6,	122:18
commit [1] - 53:20	11:20, 11:24, 11:26,	125:7	96:5	copy [3] - 38:3, 38:4,
committed [3] - 8:19,	14:11, 47:20, 48:18,	confidence [1] - 61:2	contagious [1] -	122:19 Copyright[1] - 2:27
8:27, 53:14			17:15	
	50:2, 50:19, 59:11,	confidential [1] -	17.13	cordial (4) - 115.23
Committee[19] - 2:3,	50:2, 50:19, 59:11, 59:22, 66:7, 82:5,	confidential [1] - 79:18	contained [2] - 95:5,	cordial [1] - 115:23 Cork[1] - 69:24
Committee [19] - 2:3, 5:4, 5:15, 5:24, 6:1,		79:18 confined [3] - 46:5,		Cork [1] - 69:24
	59:22, 66:7, 82:5,	79:18	contained [2] - 95:5,	

136:20, 136:25, 126:5 decidina [1] - 31:3 65:6, 76:20, 81:9, Corporal[2] - 46:22, 137:1, 137:5, 137:17 89:1, 114:4, 121:17 dangerous [1] decision [16] - 6:2, corporal [17] - 14:4, covered [2] - 12:27, 114:4 9:3, 9:5, 30:29, 35:7, describes [1] - 57:26 14:12, 45:16, 46:5, 40:13 date [2] - 53:17, 35:10, 35:16, 35:21, describing [2] - 59:5, 46:16, 46:18, 46:25, covering [2] - 27:9, 53:22 89:17, 92:21, 117:22, 91:6 46:25, 48:7, 48:8, 89:27 dated [5] - 22:2, 125:3, 125:11, description [3] -48:9, 48:14, 50:18, Cowen[1] - 108:6 38:4, 93:18, 120:20, 125:16, 131:8 29:8, 44:4, 116:13 63:8, 103:12, 106:5, decisions [1] - 43:17 created [1] - 28:14 125:19 designated [1] - 24:6 117.2 credible [2] - 104:28, dates [1] - 30:17 decline [2] - 8:6, designed [1] - 138:2 Correct[4] - 13:6, 105:18 David's [1] - 9:13 desire [1] - 31:12 26:29. 130:29. 134:22 credibly [1] - 48:27 deemed [2] - 7:4, day's [3] - 22:8, despite [2] - 58:27, correct [26] - 10:10, 33:17, 63:18 71:20 crime [4] - 8:23. 10:16, 10:19, 13:5, 8:27, 119:12, 119:14 days [5] - 22:8, deficit [1] - 33:2 destitution [2] - 7:3, 14:19, 15:24, 17:9, 24:28, 26:11, 80:24 Crime[1] - 79:23 definitely [1] - 26:14 19:11, 31:20, 31:21, de [1] - 56:2 crimes [1] - 130:22 degree [2] - 33:9, detail [7] - 14:21, 32:16, 35:21, 65:17, criminal [5] - 8:24, dead [1] - 58:3 67:9 33:23, 81:17, 101:21, 75:23, 78:29, 80:11, 35:8, 35:14, 120:4, deal [18] - 5:27, 6:1, delinquency [1] -105:1, 143:6, 144:6 80:16, 86:18, 90:24, 124:18 14:26, 15:2, 15:13, detailed [1] - 79:25 96:9, 102:18, 103:8, 16:29, 17:24, 34:25, criminality [1] demands [1] - 66:17 details [6] - 13:1, 109:25, 112:29, 119:15 40:25, 45:15, 52:7, demeanour [1] -43:18, 71:11, 87:22, 129:9, 139:29 critic [1] - 76:6 73:26, 92:20, 100:17, 97:29, 129:7 correctly [1] - 116:24 critical [1] - 65:12 105:7, 124:6, 125:5, demonised [1] detention [2] - 53:16, correspondence [6] 130.29 criticised [1] - 22:10 142:10 53:23 - 51:29, 52:3, 103:25, Dealing [2] - 77:15, denial [1] - 110:27 determined [1] criticising [2] - 94:4, 113:12, 114:2, 115:8 111:21 deny [2] - 131:5, 144:3 106:13 correspondent [1] dealing [18] - 17:17, 141:24 development [1] criticism [8] - 29:11, 41:11 20:11, 23:27, 51:1, 29:12, 33:27, 59:26, Department [55] -131:21 corresponding [1] -62:9, 65:7, 65:8, 55:12, 61:3, 63:19, 15:6, 15:11, 16:14, devices [1] - 126:7 73:13, 78:25, 85:3, 84:20 16:15, 17:3, 17:4, devised [1] - 138:18 cost [1] - 67:2 98:12, 98:18, 102:28, criticisms [7] -17:8. 17:14. 17:18. diary [1] - 95:27 costly [1] - 79:13 104:11, 104:17, 20:10, 20:11, 24:22, 26:21, 26:25, 62:17, dictated [1] - 50:12 cots [1] - 42:1 122:23, 127:9, 134:19 62:18, 78:16, 89:4, 24:23, 25:14, 25:15, died [3] - 91:13, Council[11] - 18:11, deals [10] - 14:25, 25:21, 25:24, 35:11, 91:14, 91:15 26:8. 27:8. 27:9. 15:18, 31:13, 34:27, critique [1] - 94:23 35:12, 36:14, 37:26, difference [3] -124:15, 125:10, 59:6, 59:23, 92:19, 38:1, 46:10, 52:1, Croke[1] - 77:7 82:17, 132:22, 133:8 127:12, 127:14, 103:1, 103:10, 140:19 52:2, 52:13, 52:24, cross [2] - 88:23, different [10] - 28:17, 138:16, 140:24 dealt [17] - 6:10, 53:7, 64:20, 65:16, 105:17 36:29, 44:5, 64:8, Counsel[1] - 2:5 17:19, 17:22, 20:14, 74:6, 74:28, 78:27, cross-examination 68:2. 78:7. 87:20. count [1] - 76:29 51:9. 51:13. 57:14. 80:2, 80:6, 80:7, [1] - 88:23 104:1, 105:6, 130:2 countries [2] - 26:1, 64:8, 77:17, 85:4, 80:20, 80:21, 80:29, difficult [9] - 13:6, Cullen[3] - 7:20, 119:17, 119:23, 85:28, 89:8, 89:20, 15:28, 16:5 13:9, 13:24, 28:24, country [11] - 4:22, 133:27, 136:17, 90:19, 93:9, 93:28, cultural [1] - 77:14 55:29. 64:9. 75:29. 136:23, 137:13, 6:20, 6:22, 16:13, 97:7, 101:29, 109:23, 113:1, 129:17 culture [1] - 123:12 40:24, 47:12, 47:18, 137:16 109:28, 110:13, cured [1] - 139:1 difficulty [6] - 7:12, 91:7, 134:17, 135:16, death [3] - 92:5, 110:16, 111:3, current [2] - 36:27, 36:2, 69:3, 72:2, 138:17 92:8, 92:15 113:12, 142:28, 117:16, 125:23 134:11 course [16] - 15:8, deaths [6] - 15:14, 143:23 diligence [1] - 40:27 Cussen [2] - 37:20, department [2] -23:26, 34:4, 39:6, 91:10, 91:17, 91:22, diminish [1] - 128:28 91:26, 91:28 16:18, 69:12 54:10, 54:14, 86:5, diminished [1] custom [1] - 114:18 Department's [1] debate [1] - 84:25 126:3. 129:22. 142:15 customs [1] - 130:19 130:17, 136:8, 139:1, decade [1] - 8:9 dining [4] - 21:15, cuts [2] - 51:12, 139:4, 139:8, 139:11, deprived [1] - 73:5 deceased [1] - 13:13 52:21 38:22, 38:24, 38:28 140:17 december [1] - 5:20 depths [1] - 122:18 dinner [3] - 59:19, courses [1] - 136:5 December [9] - 15:3, Deputy [5] - 4:18, 81:6, 81:9 D court [1] - 84:1 78:26, 78:27, 80:3, 6:15, 10:8, 10:14, dip [1] - 63:20 courts [1] - 122:25 115:2 80:24, 88:22, 88:24, diphtheria [1] daily [3] - 14:28, cover [5] - 136:20, 88:29, 93:19 describe [2] - 4:25, 91:23 34:28, 58:13 136:25, 137:1, 137:5, decide [1] - 43:19 60:17 direct [1] - 13:14 damage [1] - 118:21 137:17 decided [3] - 81:4, described [9] -Direct [1] - 3:7 damaged [1] - 119:6 37:18, 44:1, 49:14, cover-up [5] -93:24, 124:1 direction [3] - 65:28, danger [2] - 118:19,

92:25, 109:3 59:29 109:8, 109:27, drill [1] - 49:22 directions [1] - disease [2] - 17:15, 114:10, 118:8, dual [1] - 66:23 Dublin [12] - 1:6, directors [1] - 24:13 disinter [1] - 45:2 dismantled [1] - 98:4 dismissal [1] - disadvantage [1] - dismissal [1] - disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 disagreement [4] - disagree [1] - 121:21 disappeare [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 41:20 disputation [1] - 42:17 disagreed [1] - 121:21 disputation [1] - 41:29 disputation [1] - 41:20 disputation [1] - 41:21 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:21 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:21 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:22 disputation [1] - 41:23:28 disputation [1] - 41:27 disputation [1] - 41:27 disputation [1] - 41:27 disputation [1] - 41:27 disputation [1] - 41:28 33:28 disputting [1] - 41:25 disputting [1] - 41:25 disputting [1] - 41:26 33:22 disputting [1] - 41:28 33:28 disputting [1] - 41:28 43:16 duty [1] - 87:27 disputting [1] - 41:28 33:28 disputting [1] - 41:28 33:28 disputting [1] - 41:28 43:16 40:29 43:16 duty [1] - 87:27 disputting [1] - 41:28 33:28 disputting [1] - 41:28 43:16 40:29 40:28 43:16 40:29 40:28 43:16 40:22 40:38 43:16 40:29 43:16	77:21, 80:27, 94:28, 96:6, 97:21, 141:19, 143:28, 143:29 Education's [1] - 25:15 educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
134:16 diseases [2] - 17:15, 114:10, 118:8, dual [1] - 66:23 directly [1] - 32:7 91:16 118:10, 126:14, Dublin [12] - 1:6, directors [1] - 24:13 disinter [1] - 45:2 126:18, 127:6, 129:2, 2:16, 4:23, 6:21, 7:21, disadvantage [1] - dismantled [1] - 98:4 131:6, 139:24, 139:28 8:29, 35:1, 35:3, 40:6, 121:3 dismissal [1] - documented [4] - 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 disadvantaged [1] - 127:15 dy:28, 53:4, 118:1, due [4] - 63:3, 97:4, 141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 documenting [1] - duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - documents [13] - 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, 29:24 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 143:24 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, disputation [1] - dominated [2] - disputation [1] - disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - disputing [1] - discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	143:28, 143:29 Education's [1] - 25:15 educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
directly [1] - 32:7 91:16 118:10, 126:14, Dublin [12] - 1:6, directors [1] - 24:13 disinter [1] - 45:2 126:18, 127:6, 129:2, 2:16, 4:23, 6:21, 7:21, disadvantage [1] - dismantled [1] - 98:4 131:6, 139:24, 139:28 8:29, 35:1, 35:3, 40:6, 121:3 dismissal [1] - documented [4] - 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 disadvantaged [1] - 127:15 49:28, 53:4, 118:1, due [4] - 63:3, 97:4, 141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 documenting [1] - duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappeared [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 123:16, 123:19 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, <td< td=""><td>Education's [1] - 25:15 educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,</td></td<>	Education's [1] - 25:15 educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
directors [1] - 24:13 disinter [1] - 45:2 126:18, 127:6, 129:2, 2:16, 4:23, 6:21, 7:21, disadvantage [1] - dismantled [1] - 98:4 131:6, 139:24, 139:28 8:29, 35:1, 35:3, 40:6, 121:3 dismissal [1] - documented [4] - 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 disadvantaged [1] - 127:15 49:28, 53:4, 118:1, due [4] - 63:3, 97:4, 141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 disagree [5] - 15:25, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, 29:24 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, dominated [2] - 40:14, 68:22, 71:19, disastrously [1] -<	25:15 educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disadvantage [1] - dismantled [1] - 98:4 131:6, 139:24, 139:28 8:29, 35:1, 35:3, 40:6, 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 121:3 dismissal [1] - documented [4] - 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 40:24, 65:3, 76:6 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:0 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:0 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:4] - 63:3, 97:4, 40:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:1 40:41:41:41:41:41:1	educational [5] - 19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
121:3 dismissal [1] - documented [4] - 40:22, 65:3, 76:6 disadvantaged [1] - 127:15 49:28, 53:4, 118:1, due [4] - 63:3, 97:4, 141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 documenting [1] - duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 documents [13] - 124:17 documents [13] - During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, domain [3] - 11:15, domain [4] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 disputing [1] - duty [1] - 87:27 disputage [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	19:10, 45:11, 69:21, 76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disadvantaged [1] - 127:15 49:28, 53:4, 118:1, due [4] - 63:3, 97:4, 141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 documenting [1] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 124:17 documents [13] - 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 12:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 13:24 [1] - 58:1 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 12:110, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 disputation [1] - 123:18, 139:18, 123:19, 86:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 46:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:3, 40:12, 109:14, 43:16, 109:14, 43:1	76:27, 76:29 effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
141:20 dismissed [3] - 118:11 97:6, 140:17 disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 documenting [1] - duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, 29:24 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] -	effect [4] - 58:8, 73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disagree [5] - 15:25, 119:28, 121:5, 137:10 documenting [1] - duration [4] - 19:2, 83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - 51:10 19:19, 30:14, 31:10 disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, 29:24 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	73:9, 73:12, 123:20 effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
83:17, 84:10, 90:8 Dispensation [1] - disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - dispensation [1] - during [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - dispensation [1] - dispensation [1] - dispensation [1] - during [15] - 8:12, 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately dispersation [1] - 58:1 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, 43:39:18 disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - during [1] - 87:27 41:27 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - dury [1] - 87:27	effective [1] - 78:23 efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disagreed [2] - 90:7, 124:17 documents [13] - During [2] - 8:3, 142:29 dispensation [1] - 11:14, 21:29, 41:6, 29:24 disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	efficient [2] - 77:25, 78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
$\begin{array}{c ccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$	78:22 effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disagreement [4] - 121:21 41:9, 46:17, 71:3, during [15] - 8:12, 80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	effing [1] - 115:21 eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 120:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, dispu	eight [1] - 88:5 either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
80:17, 80:18, 88:10, disproportionately 83:28, 86:6, 88:12, 21:10, 21:23, 25:8, 143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
143:24 [1] - 58:1 107:10, 120:14, 43:3, 46:19, 48:7, disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	either [15] - 9:10, 23:17, 26:7, 53:1, 61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disappear [1] - 93:21 disputation [1] - 120:18, 139:18 49:6, 60:21, 62:21, 62:21, 62:21, 62:21, 62:21, 62:22, 71:19, 64:14, 68:14, 68:14,	61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
disappeared [1] - 37:26 domain [3] - 11:15, 64:14, 68:22, 71:19, 123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	61:6, 61:22, 82:11, 103:24, 109:3,
123:28 dispute [4] - 33:21, 123:16, 123:19 86:12, 109:14 disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	103:24, 109:3,
disastrously [1] - 64:6, 105:3, 113:9 dominated [2] - duties [2] - 23:8, 41:27 disputing [1] - 39:28, 132:2 43:16 discharge [2] - 119:15 Dominican [1] - duty [1] - 87:27	
41:27	109:27, 110:15,
discharge [2] - 119:15	126:26, 127:15,
101.01	128:2, 128:15
	elaborate [1] - 66:22
discharged [2] - 135:8, 135:23, done [20] - 26:18, Dáil [2] - 108:7, 115:3	
9:10, 53:26 135:25, 136:10 37:11, 49:15, 57:23,	element [1] - 116:23
50:27 50:29 62:40	elementary [1] -
discharging [1] - dissatisfied [1] - 53:12 57:6 63:27, 59:26, 63:19, 63:27, 68:13, 70:27,	86:11
disciplinarian [11] - distance [1] - 63:14 72:7, 79:27, 82:12, early [8] - 14:25,	eleven [1] - 76:21
19:1, 21:5, 22:29, distasteful [1] - 91:21, 94:5, 104:25, 16:2, 22:27, 36:20,	elsewhere [3] -
23:13, 23:18, 23:24, 121:22 105:20, 114:25, 40:5, 55:26, 74:17,	108:13, 108:27,
23:25, 38:24, 48:5, distinct [1] - 36:3 114:26, 142:11 136:5	139:25
48:9, 86:22 distinction [1] - door [2] - 110:7, Early [1] - 61:10	embarrassment [1] -
disciplinary [1] - 133:16	133:1
102:15 distracting [1] - doors [1] - 7:24 easy [1] - 58:8	emerged [4] - 48:27,
discipline [12] - 110:7 dormitories [7] - economic [2] - 36:9,	85:19, 143:11, 143:12
23:21, 23:29, 40:26, district [2] - 25:11, 21:11, 37:1, 37:8, 68:4	emergency [1] - 61:3
41:3, 43:8, 47:10, 65:2 39:1, 39:2, 41:29, edge [1] - 96:17	emerges [2] - 6:9,
48:6, 57:16, 86:7, divided [6] - 6:18, 81:17 editorial [1] - 103:5	13:3
86:9, 117:1 14:24, 38:18, 43:5, dormitory [3] - educated [1] - 36:10	emotional [1] -
35:23 37:10 37:11	118:28
Discipline [1] - 40:25 57:12, 102:29 57:12, 102:29 discontinue [1] - 58:1 educating [1] - 71:7 dotal [1] - 58:1 Education [31] -	emphasis [1] - 16:22
double (4) = 26:12	employed [1] - 46:6
15.7. 16.14. 16.15.	employer [1] - 57:1
doubt [6] - 27:20	employment [5] -
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10,	
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, 132:9, 137:19 137:19 137:19	. ,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, 23:26, 50:13, 53:17 52:24, 64:20, 65:17,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] -
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, Discovery [1] - 93:5 104:10, 114:27 Date of 2027, 20:44	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discover [1] - 78:8 120:17, 120:19, 32:26, 50:13, 53:17, 74:6, 78:28, 80:2, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, Discovery [1] - 93:5 104:10, 114:27 Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1, 129:6 -11:11, 25:2, 25:17, documentation [4], 11:9 94:10, 96:1, 111:9 9:13, 15:2, 16:8,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1, 129:6 -11:11, 25:2, 25:17, dramatically [2] - 16:10, 31:11, 54:28,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29 End [1] - 142:19
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, 11:11, 135:26 documentary [7] - 67:23, 82:23, 82:25, 80:21, 80:29, 85:28, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1, 129:6 -11:11, 25:2, 25:17, dramatically [2] - 16:10, 31:11, 54:28, discussed [3] - 20:1, 32:18, 37:12, 37:20, dramatically [2] - 16:10, 31:11, 54:28, 43:1, 111:14 48:15, 51:10, 53:7, dramatically [2] - 55:12, 55:20, 64:18,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29 End [1] - 142:19 endangered [1] -
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, education [31] - 7:1, 129:6 -11:11, 25:2, 25:17, dramatically [2] - 16:10, 31:11, 54:28, 43:1, 111:14 48:15, 51:10, 53:7, dramatic [1] - 90:7 55:12, 55:20, 64:18, discussion [6] - 62:3, 79:3, 79:4, dramatic [1] - 90:7 64:25, 65:23, 65:25,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29 End [1] - 142:19 endangered [1] - 119:4
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, 94:10, 96:1, 111:9 91:3, 15:2, 16:8, discussed [3] - 20:1, 32:18, 37:12, 37:20, dramatically [2] - 16:10, 31:11, 54:28, 43:1, 111:14 48:15, 51:10, 53:7, drastic [1] - 90:7 64:25, 65:23, 65:25, 27:22, 43:3, 65:11, 82:16, 95:14, 101:17, draw [5] - 28:7, 41:8, 70:8, 70:21, 73:18,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29 End [1] - 142:19 endangered [1] - 119:4 ended [4] - 15:29,
discourage [1] - 52:5, 52:14, 61:6, doubt [6] - 27:29, 17:8, 17:18, 20:10, 134:6 61:7, 61:29, 112:21 44:17, 47:6, 96:8, 24:22, 24:24, 25:24, discouraged [1] - document [7] - 123:9, 137:19 35:12, 36:14, 52:13, 46:27 75:18, 88:9, 93:17, down [14] - 10:4, 52:24, 64:20, 65:17, discovered [2] - 126:12, 134:11 53:23, 54:11, 58:3, 80:6, 80:7, 80:20, discovery [1] - 50:17, 50:19, 64:5, 92:13, 121:18, 89:8, 89:21, 93:9, 121:23 103:16, 103:24, 128:13, 135:27 109:23, 110:13, discuss [2] - 127:28, documentation [35] Dr[5] - 92:27, 93:11, 94:10, 96:1, 111:9 91:3, 15:2, 16:8, discussed [3] - 20:1, 32:18, 37:12, 37:20, dramatically [2] - 10:10, 102:8 55:12, 55:20, 64:18, 43:1, 111:14 48:15, 51:10, 53:7, drastic [1] - 90:7 64:25, 65:23, 65:25,	53:29, 55:8, 55:9, 70:19, 78:3 encouraged [1] - 127:21 end [15] - 8:2, 18:16, 23:3, 25:3, 25:8, 42:29, 44:11, 58:3, 60:20, 64:13, 88:2, 108:7, 122:26, 126:15, 131:29 End [1] - 142:19 endangered [1] - 119:4

England [4] - 7:8,	evidence [40] - 4:14,	Exit [1] - 48:8	facets [1] - 77:2	fault [4] - 48:27,
31:29, 122:15, 123:29	4:24, 5:5, 5:12, 5:17,	exits [1] - 39:23	facilitate [1] - 97:19	81:26, 128:8, 143:12
enjoyed [1] - 76:8	5:25, 6:5, 6:14, 13:14,	expect [1] - 70:24	facility [1] - 75:1	features [1] - 41:24
enjoyment [1] -	25:19, 25:22, 50:8,	expectation [1] -	fact [39] - 14:20,	feelings [3] - 115:28,
76:12	50:9, 50:17, 50:20,	61:17	29:21, 33:12, 36:10,	116:4, 116:5
enlisted [1] - 93:10	52:29, 58:1, 63:11,	expected [1] - 5:19	39:27, 52:6, 56:3,	Feena[1] - 2:9
enquired [1] - 81:10	64:5, 82:15, 83:26,	expeditiously [1] -	57:29, 58:12, 58:14,	fellow [1] - 49:21
enquiries [2] - 46:20,	83:29, 84:19, 84:23,	121:21	58:27, 59:2, 61:5,	felt [6] - 8:25, 22:14,
51:22	85:10, 98:11, 103:17,	expel [2] - 125:12,	63:16, 67:12, 71:16,	80:1, 106:14, 119:24,
ensure [1] - 27:13	103:22, 103:25,	125:16	72:19, 78:7, 89:26,	130:29
ensuring [3] - 23:20,	104:3, 104:10,	expelled [2] - 126:4,	94:22, 96:20, 97:20,	female [2] - 91:5,
27:4, 30:4	104:18, 105:9, 109:2,	126:6	101:14, 106:4,	91:9
entail [1] - 23:26	109:24, 111:1,	expended [1] - 66:28	106:14, 112:6,	females [2] - 131:14,
enter [1] - 134:8	114:27, 128:11, 144:1	expense [1] - 79:13	122:16, 124:2,	131:26
entered [1] - 78:20	evident [1] - 76:12	experience [8] -	125:22, 128:22,	Fergus[1] - 2:6
entire [6] - 8:15,	evolved [1] - 16:10	25:29, 30:8, 36:8,	133:7, 135:25,	few [4] - 28:17, 59:5,
19:2, 48:29, 73:3,	exactly [1] - 18:20	66:11, 79:17, 85:3,	135:29, 136:5,	136:18, 142:11
82:1, 92:6	examination [1] -	89:13, 106:16	138:28, 140:26,	field [2] - 70:19,
entirely [5] - 28:29,	88:23	expert [2] - 57:22,	143:18, 143:21,	105:11
75:27, 88:24, 89:1,	Examination [2] -	76:24	143:23	figure [3] - 72:6,
95:14	3:4, 142:19	expertise [1] - 63:19	factor [2] - 32:2, 33:1	72:10, 92:2
entrances [1] - 39:23	examine [1] - 114:9	experts [3] - 33:11,	factors [2] - 9:6, 74:1	figures [5] - 8:13,
entrusted [1] - 87:17	Examined [2] - 10:2,	34:10, 43:16	factory [4] - 54:4,	32:16, 34:23, 34:24,
entry [3] - 36:2,	100:8	explain [2] - 52:3,	66:29, 67:2, 67:3	71:17
65:20, 70:22	examined [2] - 52:6,	96:28	factually [1] - 75:23	file [1] - 32:18
environment [1] -	69:14	explaining [1] -	failing [1] - 118:18	filed [1] - 5:13
42:13	example [3] - 66:27,	84:21	failure [4] - 46:23,	filled [1] - 71:12
equal [1] - 86:29	124:11, 125:5	exploitation [1] -	47:16, 47:22, 119:1	film [1] - 81:9
equation [2] -	examples [6] -	131:17	fair [3] - 62:28,	films [1] - 40:17
130:15, 130:16	26:29, 29:29, 45:29,	exploited [1] - 68:3	106:22, 129:8	final [7] - 15:17,
equipped [1] - 55:1	124:4, 129:1, 129:20	explore [2] - 70:29,	fairly [5] - 60:12,	92:20, 97:10, 98:17,
era [2] - 45:11, 129:5	excellent [7] - 42:7,	120:15	139:20, 141:5,	98:19, 137:25, 141:11
error [1] - 103:5	44:11, 48:6, 73:19,	express [2] - 33:15,	142:27, 142:29	finally [1] - 9:9
essentially [3] -	74:5, 77:25, 81:10	116:5	fairness [2] - 137:26,	finance [3] - 14:27,
29:14, 68:19, 139:10	excellently [1] -	expressed [5] -	141:12	20:15, 31:14
Essentially [1] -	62:15	27:21, 78:17, 103:25,	familiar [10] - 10:27,	Finance[1] - 20:3
21:18	except [5] - 43:18,	115:29, 116:7	10:28, 11:1, 11:17,	financial [1] - 34:18
establish [2] - 58:8,	72:4, 101:13, 101:18,	extended [1] - 7:9	11:25, 109:6, 121:27,	financing [2] - 33:21,
103:23	130:11	extensive [1] -	130:10, 135:9, 139:28	88:26
established [1] -	exception [5] -	103:23	families [1] - 63:21	fine [1] - 15:27
7:26	20:23, 54:5, 54:8,	extent [10] - 12:28,	family [8] - 14:5,	fingering [1] - 75:28
establishment [2] -	85:14, 142:29	13:12, 19:12, 34:13,	42:3, 48:28, 81:29, 82:20, 82:25, 102:1,	fingernails [1] -
17:2, 67:1	excessive [2] - 14:12, 103:17	34:17, 61:15, 76:10,	106:18	51:20
esteem [1] - 129:10	excessively [1] -	104:11, 106:20,	famous [1] - 39:6	fingers [1] - 51:20
estimation [1] -	•	117:29		finish [1] - 98:22
98:15	86:25 exchanged [1] - 89:6	extraordinary [3] -	far [6] - 37:15, 38:5, 78:12, 79:9, 121:2,	finished [2] - 40:13,
etc [1] - 57:3	Exchequer [1] - 7:17	77:4, 88:6, 94:17	144:6	49:14
ethos [1] - 57:26	excited [1] - 102:16	extras [1] - 32:14	Farm[1] - 28:12	First [6] - 29:6, 56:23,
European [1] - 26:1	excluded [1] - 40:4	extreme [1] - 49:27	farm [6] - 18:1, 24:3,	117:13, 129:16,
evaluate [1] - 104:28	excuse [1] - 119:20	extremely [3] -	24:10, 34:14, 34:16,	130:9, 143:18
evaluation [1] -	excusing [1] - 52:18	42:22, 49:26, 55:28	34:22	first [26] - 7:25, 11:3,
104:25	executive [1] - 19:20	eye [1] - 55:25	farmers [2] - 55:15,	14:23, 14:25, 25:5,
evening [1] - 44:15	executive [1] - 19.20	eyes [2] - 29:20,	67:26	30:28, 37:5, 51:27,
events [3] - 15:7,	127:10	43:15	farming [3] - 54:1,	57:3, 57:14, 61:12,
15:26, 140:23	exercise [3] - 8:21,	eyewitness [1] - 87:6	55:16, 78:3	66:14, 68:12, 79:21,
eventually [2] -	27:2, 105:19		farms [1] - 78:8	85:20, 85:23, 92:23, 103:1, 106:17,
27:23, 29:23	exist [1] - 50:24	F	fashion [2] - 105:27,	112:17, 114:22,
everywhere [1] -	existence [2] - 7:6,	face (4) 96:24 97:4	133:2	125:5, 129:5, 136:2,
63:24	85:21	face [4] - 86:24, 87:4,	Fathers[1] - 121:24	136:18, 136:25
Evidence[1] - 1:12	·	115:29	- *	100.10, 100.20

fit [1] - 95:24 fitted [1] - 67:28 five [7] - 56:21, 65:4,	114:7 founded [1] - 88:27 four [10] - 26:11,	39:26, 40:14, 40:16 Gardaí [6] - 56:3, 124:20, 126:25,	gradually [1] - 22:26 grandmother [2] - 114:3, 114:24	25:14, 31:24, 58:25 hall [1] - 42:2 hallmark [1] - 39:20
72:26, 91:16, 93:10,	32:2, 51:12, 59:20,	127:1, 136:29, 137:21	grant [2] - 31:26,	hand [7] - 39:21,
93:15, 93:29	60:16, 72:26, 73:4,	gardening [1] - 54:4	45:13	46:1, 46:26, 50:15,
fixed [1] - 30:3	81:13, 112:11, 116:26	gate [1] - 113:9	granted [4] - 38:20,	66:29, 75:24, 126:4
flag [1] - 144:4	fourteen [1] - 37:9	General[4] - 45:22,	58:6, 105:5, 124:17	handicap [1] - 42:20
flagged [1] - 33:28	fourth [2] - 103:10,	96:21, 125:10, 127:13	grants [1] - 31:24	handicapped [2] -
flattering [1] - 29:5	120:22	general [35] - 4:29,	grateful [2] - 34:2,	72:10, 72:12
floor [5] - 37:5, 37:6,	Fr [1] - 88:21	11:28, 12:2, 14:22,	123:18	handled [3] - 64:11,
42:1, 84:23, 84:27	frankly [2] - 49:5,	15:1, 15:22, 19:8,	gratuitous [1] -	64:17, 108:2
fobbed [1] - 51:24	82:8	24:25, 25:3, 25:26,	117:8	handwriting [2] -
follow [6] - 4:9,	Fred[1] - 1:26	26:7, 26:18, 27:15,	grave [2] - 118:18,	128:11, 128:12
27:13, 27:14, 44:28,	free [2] - 73:22,	31:16, 33:18, 48:23,	118:27	Hanratty [4] - 2:12,
62:13, 140:18	134:6	51:14, 59:6, 60:13,	gravity [1] - 46:24	140:17, 141:2, 142:21
follow-on [1] -	freedom [1] - 43:24	60:14, 61:12, 64:24,	great [14] - 12:11,	happy [8] - 48:28,
140:18	French[1] - 122:19	64:26, 64:27, 65:4,	30:18, 59:10, 62:3,	49:5, 81:29, 82:8,
followed [2] - 4:13,	frequent [1] - 126:24	65:16, 70:6, 72:19,	63:19, 67:20, 79:7,	85:9, 95:15, 101:29,
27:28	Frequently[1] -	77:22, 81:19, 84:29,	81:17, 109:2, 113:26,	102:6
following [7] - 1:30,	128:23	93:2, 94:11, 113:28,	117:7, 118:12,	harm [1] - 141:25
15:10, 72:20, 86:6,	frequently [6] -	130:22	123:15, 125:22	harmed [1] - 141:26
115:4, 136:18, 136:24	16:28, 30:22, 44:14,	generalisation [1] -	greater [1] - 126:5	harsh [1] - 26:27
follows [2] - 38:20,	56:20, 86:10, 130:4	132:5	greeting [1] - 44:13	hasten [1] - 90:8
71:19	fridge [2] - 81:14,	generalise [1] - 14:9	grew [1] - 7:29	head [3] - 55:3,
Follows[4] - 4:1,	81:15	generally [9] - 24:15,	grievance [1] - 68:3	69:28, 118:6
10:2, 100:1, 100:9	Friend[1] - 142:27	27:11, 55:20, 62:6,	grooming [1] - 133:5	heading [4] - 28:11,
food [13] - 15:1,	friendly [1] - 49:4	66:4, 74:5, 76:28,	ground [1] - 18:5	28:12, 41:16, 141:5
25:26, 34:23, 38:28,	frivolous [1] - 122:22	129:6, 132:2	grounds [2] - 119:1,	Headquarters [1] -
44:12, 59:7, 59:10,	fro [1] - 80:12	Generally[5] - 17:16,	119:20	11:10
59:11, 60:5, 60:8,	fro-ings [1] - 80:12	20:21, 65:3, 81:22, 93:1	group [14] - 20:5,	heads [2] - 83:3,
60:12, 80:28, 81:3	front [3] - 38:26,	generation [2] -	20:11, 20:13, 24:27,	102:21
football [3] - 39:29,	43:12, 130:2	22:21, 45:7	38:19, 48:14, 50:15,	Health [3] - 8:14,
40:5, 40:15	frustrated [2] -	genesis [1] - 141:6	59:16, 64:7, 68:16,	17:14, 58:26
footing [1] - 69:27	83:25, 94:2	genuine [1] - 133:1	71:29, 72:22, 86:10,	health [10] - 15:2,
footwear [1] - 89:24	fulfill [1] - 29:14	genuinely [1] - 143:9	107:1	16:21, 17:15, 25:26,
forbidden [1] - 46:2	full [5] - 29:26, 56:6,	George[1] - 115:10	groups [5] - 38:18,	42:8, 44:12, 59:7,
foreign [1] - 76:6	61:2, 78:10, 143:4	given [24] - 5:25,	79:12, 91:29, 92:29,	80:28, 111:9, 139:10
forgive [1] - 138:23	full-time [2] - 29:26,	6:14, 14:18, 31:23,	132:17	hear [2] - 84:18,
forgot [1] - 96:24	56:6	35:23, 37:13, 37:17,	grown [2] - 41:27,	110:3
form [2] - 46:6, 46:25	function [1] - 110:4	42:15, 64:14, 65:28,	116:12	heard [8] - 4:15,
Form[2] - 37:28, 38:1	functioning [1] -	66:4, 71:1, 71:17,	guardianship [1] - 8:22	44:3, 48:8, 76:6, 76:8, 84:15, 88:21, 137:13
formal [6] - 16:12,	88:17	73:18, 73:19, 74:6,	guest [1] - 116:3	hearing [13] - 1:31,
19:25, 54:27, 69:9,	fund [1] - 34:14	76:14, 80:9, 85:5,	guest [1] - 110.3	4:8, 4:9, 4:18, 5:10,
69:13, 75:8	fundamentally [1] -	87:22, 88:15, 130:2,	134:3, 134:13,	5:12, 5:26, 6:5, 6:14,
formally [1] - 61:8 format [1] - 4:9	43:21	139:2, 139:9	134:14, 135:6,	12:28, 76:15, 107:17,
	funded [1] - 33:7	glad [1] - 33:28	135:11, 135:13,	143:3
former [7] - 11:14, 11:21, 37:18, 49:13,	funding [8] - 7:16, 9:8, 12:27, 14:27,	gleaned [1] - 46:17	135:20, 136:3, 138:1,	Hearing [3] - 4:1,
58:10, 82:10, 102:13	31:13, 31:17, 31:22,	God[2] - 93:21,	138:2	100:1, 144:14
forms [6] - 20:15,	74:12	122:7	Guilds [1] - 54:13	hearings [7] - 5:16,
24:20, 24:21, 46:26,	furnished [1] - 30:16	Godparents[1] -	guilty [8] - 7:2, 8:24,	5:18, 5:20, 105:6,
50:5, 131:16	futility [1] - 67:5	23:20	35:8, 35:14, 122:24,	117:23, 130:12,
fortnight [1] - 25:11	future [4] - 46:5,	good' [1] - 44:15	133:22, 143:21	144:12
forum [5] - 64:8,	67:21, 68:10, 76:15	Gould[1] - 75:29	gut [1] - 118:6	hearsay [1] - 83:29
78:7, 105:6, 130:1,		governed [1] - 45:17		heart [1] - 91:22
131:3	G	governing [2] - 5:21,	Н	heated [1] - 40:20
forward [1] - 121:21	G	138:17		heavy [2] - 22:14,
forwarded [1] -	Galway[2] - 4:23,	Government [4] -	hack [1] - 34:9	22:15
127:13	6:21	17:3, 17:17, 31:25,	hair [1] - 112:29	held [3] - 113:29,
foundation [1] -	games [4] - 39:5,	41:25	half [5] - 4:22, 6:22,	127:24, 129:10
	=			

Held [1] - 1:5 Helen's [1] - 6:21 help [3] - 13:12, 22:6, 142:6 helped [1] - 34:14 helpful [2] - 28:29, 107:6 helping [1] - 63:25 Herbert [1] - 2:16 hereby [1] - 1:29 heretofore [1] - 102:17 herself [1] - 60:1 hierarchy [1] - 18:13 high [9] - 8:5, 8:8, 39:24, 48:6, 58:1, 58:16, 64:27, 102:5, 129:10	hotel [2] - 54:3, 54:8 hour [1] - 21:19 hours [4] - 19:5, 19:6, 22:8, 86:27 house [3] - 16:4, 86:26, 95:21 housed [1] - 41:29 housing [1] - 8:1 huge [2] - 41:29, 42:2 hurling [1] - 39:28 hurt [1] - 12:14 hygiene [2] - 16:23, 57:16 hyper [1] - 115:13 hypersensitive [1] -	65:26 inadequacy [1] - 9:8 inadequate [8] - 7:16, 31:23, 42:1, 89:2, 89:24, 111:11, 136:15, 139:12 inadmissible [1] - 84:1 incidence [1] - 113:26 incident [4] - 107:18, 108:1, 108:8, 114:13 incidentally [1] - 29:25 incidents [3] - 90:28, 107:15, 117:8 inclined [1] - 33:5 include [3] - 8:13,	individuals [4] - 23:14, 23:15, 25:4, 104:21 indoor [1] - 40:20 industrial [46] - 7:5, 7:14, 9:7, 10:26, 14:1, 16:7, 17:5, 19:17, 20:8, 20:12, 20:13, 30:6, 37:27, 41:8, 41:28, 42:10, 42:24, 42:27, 45:18, 45:24, 45:26, 46:5, 55:22, 62:25, 66:23, 69:11, 72:9, 72:24, 79:8, 88:16, 89:10, 93:3, 93:8, 94:11, 97:23, 98:8, 105:23, 105:24, 109:10, 114:16,	13:21 inordinately [1] - 102:5 Inquire [1] - 1:2 inquiry [4] - 59:19, 83:8, 83:18, 85:4 Inquiry [3] - 1:20, 5:22, 83:24 insecurity [1] - 63:3 inside [1] - 70:10 insignificant [2] - 86:24, 87:5 insofar [2] - 109:23, 135:28 inspect [1] - 81:4 inspected [6] - 25:1, 25:3, 25:4, 25:20, 25:23, 65:6
higher [2] - 106:8, 143:15	ı	72:16, 104:20 Included [1] - 39:25	114:29, 115:15, 130:21, 136:1,	inspection [21] - 15:3, 15:4, 15:6,
highlighting [2] - 27:10, 27:11 highly [2] - 77:25, 81:1 himself [6] - 31:2, 79:23, 96:29, 115:16, 143:20 Historically [1] - 7:12 history [3] - 9:16, 15:23 Hold [1] - 83:12	idea [3] - 102:9, 120:27, 120:29 ideal [1] - 47:28 ideals [1] - 47:1 ideas [1] - 79:10 identified [1] - 6:2 ill [1] - 51:23 illiterate [3] - 71:20, 72:1, 76:22 illness [1] - 53:1	included [12] - 4:23, 8:19, 25:25, 26:17, 51:11, 89:27, 93:5, 104:21, 105:21, 112:3, 112:11, 134:28 including [11] - 4:27, 9:6, 11:13, 13:23, 59:24, 72:4, 74:1, 79:8, 79:11, 94:12, 104:15 inclusive [1] - 91:13	138:10, 142:12 Industrial [15] - 4:8, 4:14, 7:9, 7:19, 7:24, 17:21, 19:23, 19:26, 20:6, 25:16, 48:25, 88:25, 88:29, 92:9, 138:8 inelegantly [1] - 95:18 inescapable [2] - 48:29, 82:2	24:21, 24:23, 24:25, 24:26, 26:3, 26:5, 48:24, 48:27, 60:28, 78:25, 78:26, 80:23, 81:20, 85:22, 85:29, 110:22, 111:8, 111:10 inspections [7] - 16:16, 24:20, 25:7, 25:10, 25:15, 65:5, 110:14 inspector [10] -
Hold [1] - 83:12 holds [1] - 41:28 holidays [5] - 21:21, 21:22, 73:6, 91:15, 112:27 home [13] - 8:20, 23:19, 35:20, 41:19, 41:24, 42:12, 52:22, 73:6, 91:15, 112:26, 113:1, 113:20, 113:22	illnesses [2] - 25:25, 91:26 immediate [1] - 121:20 immediately [2] - 70:17, 135:2 immoral [1] - 118:19 impact [1] - 118:28 imperfections [1] -	inconclusive [1] - 103:26 incorrect [1] - 91:1 increase [1] - 101:25 increased [1] - 102:8 Indeed [1] - 135:24 indeed [1] - 107:2 independent [1] - 60:10	infection [1] - 133:15 infirmary [8] - 18:2, 19:14, 24:6, 24:15, 24:17, 60:22, 61:4, 108:16 influenced [1] - 9:5 inform [2] - 80:2, 96:24 information [13] -	24:26, 25:10, 48:21, 59:28, 60:5, 60:29, 62:14, 62:18, 80:29, 109:22 Inspector [2] - 48:24, 88:29 inspector's [3] - 59:15, 60:11, 60:15 inspectorate [2] -
homeless [1] - 58:26 homes [1] - 14:5 homosexual [1] - 121:11 honed [1] - 40:10 hope [1] - 76:14 hopeless [1] - 67:27 horseplay [1] - 37:7 hospice [2] - 91:14,	14:3 imperfectly [1] - 71:21 implying [2] - 135:22, 135:24 important [1] - 70:1 importantly [1] - 143:22 impose [1] - 23:12 impossible [2] -	Index [1] - 3:2 indicate [2] - 108:20, 109:18 indicated [1] - 126:23 indicating [2] - 72:9, 112:21 indication [2] - 20:29, 108:16	5:1, 32:17, 33:16, 34:4, 37:13, 37:21, 38:6, 88:15, 89:11, 89:13, 91:25, 101:18, 122:2 informed [1] - 6:11 infringed [1] - 135:1 ings [2] - 80:12 inherent [1] - 132:12	21:27, 64:28 inspectorial [1] - 26:14 inspectors [4] - 24:27, 48:17, 48:20, 59:16 inspectors' [2] - 47:5, 77:26 instance [12] - 13:29,
91:18 hospital [4] - 52:15, 61:16, 91:14, 91:18 Hospital [2] - 61:13, 92:27 hospitalisation [1] - 62:5 hospitalised [1] - 107:19 hospitality [1] - 54:9 Hotel [1] - 1:5	68:24, 83:11 impoverished [1] - 76:21 impression [8] - 48:2, 48:28, 64:27, 64:28, 65:16, 81:29, 95:13, 143:8 improbable [1] - 105:15 improvement [1] -	indicative [3] - 108:4, 108:10, 108:11 indicator [1] - 108:4 individual [14] - 11:24, 14:17, 18:26, 20:12, 27:16, 56:15, 94:14, 106:25, 119:6, 130:9, 132:13, 132:20, 133:3, 138:28 individually [1] - 92:29	inherited [1] - 78:8 initiated [1] - 44:14 injured [3] - 19:12, 51:23, 107:21 injuries [3] - 25:26, 51:6, 56:18 injury [8] - 51:2, 51:19, 51:28, 52:7, 52:15, 52:16, 53:2, 103:3 innocence [1] -	14:4, 47:15, 61:20, 61:24, 81:2, 91:1, 96:15, 112:9, 123:8, 125:25, 128:12 instanced [2] - 47:6, 61:20 instances [16] - 14:17, 27:15, 47:7, 49:26, 53:6, 62:2, 64:4, 102:25, 106:8, 126:5, 128:6, 129:24,

130:6, 136:14, 138:27, 141:23	63:21, 85:23, 93:8, 95:4, 122:12	100:25 irrelevant [1] - 135:8	judicial [2] - 36:14, 71:12	L
instant [1] - 117:26 instead [1] - 97:17 institute [1] - 128:9 institution [41] - 4:28, 5:1, 5:7, 5:17,	interests [1] - 125:28 interfering [2] - 96:13, 121:11 Interjection [10] - 34:5, 82:17, 83:9,	irrespective [1] - 67:29 islands [1] - 31:19 isolated [1] - 108:8 issue [33] - 15:14,	July[1] - 7:25 jump [1] - 87:20 jumped [1] - 101:9 June[3] - 9:9, 13:8, 97:18	lack [7] - 7:3, 36:8, 74:24, 89:23, 126:18, 138:22, 138:24 lady [1] - 114:9 laid [1] - 128:8
5:29, 6:6, 9:4, 12:20, 14:19, 15:24, 17:23, 18:28, 25:20, 25:24,	83:12, 100:21, 111:4, 125:20, 132:21, 132:27, 139:15	17:24, 33:11, 33:20, 33:21, 33:29, 38:7, 45:15, 55:25, 59:10,	junior [1] - 74:22 juniors [1] - 43:6 jurisdiction [1] -	Lankford[1] - 101:4 lapse [1] - 13:9 large [7] - 13:11,
27:6, 27:25, 31:27, 39:20, 41:19, 44:5,	internal [1] - 46:17 interpret [3] - 74:11,	59:12, 60:18, 62:24, 64:18, 71:1, 80:21,	97:1 jurisdictions [1] -	20:15, 55:13, 64:10, 71:29, 102:3, 117:6
48:29, 49:21, 61:4, 82:1, 91:8, 106:20, 110:19, 110:24,	116:11, 136:29 interpretation [2] - 122:6, 123:9	87:20, 91:10, 100:18, 106:5, 110:15, 111:17,	31:18 Justice [3] - 1:18,	largely [2] - 31:2, 83:28
111:7, 111:11, 113:2, 113:12, 113:13,	interpreted [1] -	111:21, 114:15, 115:9, 118:15,	17:4, 35:12 justification [1] - 22:9	largest [1] - 94:13 last [9] - 15:17, 59:1, 59:2, 75:21, 76:3,
117:5, 119:6, 128:2, 128:3, 128:16, 131:13, 138:25, 139:9	interventions [1] - 84:28	118:22, 125:12, 134:3, 136:20, 136:26	justified [2] - 68:4, 90:20	84:11, 98:7, 134:27, 134:28
institutionalisation	interview [3] - 37:16, 49:13, 102:14	issued [6] - 25:4, 45:21, 46:10, 57:9, 57:19, 62:17	justify [1] - 103:13 juvenile [1] - 6:28	late [7] - 12:2, 22:27, 39:14, 45:12, 54:9,
institutionalise [1] - 73:12	introduce [1] - 74:19 introduced [2] - 49:18, 49:24	issues [18] - 5:8, 5:28, 6:1, 6:3, 6:8,	Juvenile [1] - 79:23	80:24, 136:4 latter [1] - 67:28
institutionalised [1]	invariably [1] - 18:7	6:10, 10:21, 15:1,	K	laundry [2] - 63:13, 131:29
- 106:21 institutions [16] -	inversion [1] - 13:22 investigated [6] -	15:2, 15:18, 24:16, 25:25, 35:9, 71:5,	Karen _[1] - 2:6 keep _[5] - 55:25,	Laura _[1] - 2:7 law _[1] - 121:1
4:11, 7:23, 9:8, 9:11, 31:22, 33:8, 62:26,	50:14, 50:21, 108:17, 126:20, 127:12,	95:28, 100:14, 103:2, 140:20	94:19, 109:9, 125:29, 137:1	lay [6] - 20:20, 20:26, 66:25, 113:2, 123:5,
82:26, 106:15, 106:24, 106:26,	127:14 investigating [1] -	issuing [2] - 23:23, 23:27	keeping [2] - 53:21, 62:20	135:27 layout [1] - 10:27
109:7, 111:13, 114:23, 136:7, 138:26	4:11 Investigation [2] -	it' [1] - 137:8 item [5] - 20:4,	Kennedy [6] - 25:28, 25:29, 31:21, 35:17,	layperson [1] - 127:4 lead [1] - 133:1
Instructed [2] - 2:9, 2:15 instruction [3] -	2:3, 6:1 investigation [6] -	21:25, 100:16, 119:10, 121:7 items [3] - 107:16,	72:8, 111:12 kept [5] - 18:18,	Leade r[4] - 4:18, 6:15, 10:8, 10:14
46:10, 71:23, 114:22 instructions [1] -	15:9, 15:11, 50:29, 112:14, 114:11, 137:9 invitation [1] -	136:18, 136:24 itself [13] - 14:1,	36:24, 62:10, 62:15, 109:16	leadership [2] - 10:13, 134:2
140:11 instrumental [1] -	115:16 invite [5] - 39:16,	27:2, 27:5, 31:21, 42:10, 43:21, 44:7,	Kiera[1] - 2:7 kind [1] - 41:24	learning [1] - 65:14 lease [1] - 51:22 least [9] - 26:2,
10:17 insubordination [1] - 113:24	90:14, 115:7, 115:14, 123:10 inviting [1] - 130:17	47:25, 91:14, 119:3, 128:19, 140:24, 143:26	kindly [1] - 106:15 kinds [2] - 63:23, 143:5	54:26, 62:12, 64:29, 73:27, 76:13, 119:9,
insufficient [1] - 103:24	involve [2] - 5:12, 111:27	Ivor [1] - 2:15	kitchen [4] - 24:4, 59:27, 67:1	126:8, 143:13 leather [2] - 46:15, 46:26
intake [1] - 7:28 intellectually [1] -	involved [9] - 8:23,	J	knives [1] - 113:24 knowing [1] - 43:28	leave [4] - 6:3,
75:5	15:29, 28:18, 67:19, 83:1, 92:27, 94:4,	jail [1] - 122:28	knowledge [8] - 64:12, 94:25, 94:28,	119:10, 143:3, 143:7 leaves [1] - 72:12
intelligences [2] - 77:17, 77:18 intend [1] - 90:12	96:6, 120:21 involving [6] - 5:16, 12:29, 113:9, 121:8,	January _[1] - 71:14 job _[7] - 30:12, 30:14, 52:4, 78:14,	126:18, 130:27, 130:28, 132:15,	Leaving [1] - 66:14 leaving [5] - 54:29, 57:20, 68:17, 103:25,
intended [2] - 4:29, 16:3	121:15, 126:19 Ireland [19] - 4:19,	83:9, 83:11, 141:19 jobs [2] - 67:7, 70:16	133:24 known [11] - 18:29, 41:28, 49:17, 70:5,	115:20 led [2] - 27:24, 75:27
intention [1] - 7:26 Inter [2] - 74:26, 74:29	4:20, 6:16, 6:18, 7:9, 7:19, 10:9, 14:6, 26:2, 31:19, 32:1, 32:5,	Joint _[4] - 79:19, 79:22, 80:5 Joseph _[1] - 2:13	77:5, 77:25, 96:2, 96:4, 122:25, 123:21,	left [17] - 29:22, 30:9, 31:2, 41:16, 48:13, 54:24, 55:6, 56:4,
interest [1] - 79:7 interested [2] - 6:10,	32:21, 32:25, 32:27, 69:22, 73:23, 77:6,	judge [1] - 58:14 judged [1] - 38:17	143:18 knows [1] - 101:2	56:19, 65:22, 65:24, 70:26, 75:24, 78:17,
140:24 interesting [5] -	122:20 Irish [2] - 41:12,	judgment [1] - 131:22		100:28, 101:4, 126:6 left-hand [1] - 75:24

legal [5] - 28:5. 115:28, 116:5, Lower61 - 1:26. Maxwells [1] - 2:15 manager (8) - 18:26. 70:12, 85:2, 96:11, 129:26, 129:27, 18:27, 24:10, 27:10, 133:10, 133:16, Mccabe [1] - 111:9 120:3 130:20, 133:8 135:5, 135:18, 135:22 32:20, 52:20, 56:29, Mcdevitt [3] - 89:26, limit [1] - 117:28 legalities [1] - 17:12 lower [1] - 67:23 89:1 89:28, 90:4 limitations [1] - 42:3 lowest [1] - 122:17 Manager's [2] - 38:8, Mcgettigan [1] - 2:15 Legion[1] - 56:2 legislation [2] - 5:21, limited [10] - 6:8, luckily [1] - 122:2 52:19 Mcgoldrick [1] - 2:7 77:3, 90:27, 91:9, managers [2] -6:26 lunch [1] - 100:13 Mcgovern [40] - 2:5, 107:6, 116:24, 20:13, 46:11 legs [1] - 108:15 Luncheon[2] - 98:28, 3:7, 4:5, 4:6, 10:2, Leinster[2] - 9:1, 130:26, 131:27, Managers [4] -10:6, 33:4, 33:25, 133:20, 142:14 19:17, 19:23, 19:26, lying [2] - 82:23, 34:2, 34:11, 41:14, line [6] - 4:11, 4:22, 20.6 44:21, 44:23, 45:15, length [1] - 88:6 82:24 6:21, 6:23, 120:22 managing [3] - 7:15, 78:12, 83:13, 84:14, lengthy [1] - 12:21 Lenihan[2] - 115:18, lined [2] - 38:26, 18:3, 64:13 85:11, 85:12, 98:19, M 39:1 manner [7] - 2:28, 100:6, 100:8, 100:12, 115:20 list [1] - 136:18 47:23, 132:17, 133:4, 100:23, 100:27, less [7] - 19:25, 29:4, machine [1] - 51:28 listed [1] - 118:24 136:16, 136:23, 101:5, 110:11, 67:13, 93:21, 117:21, Macmahon [1] - 2:5 listened [1] - 88:23 143:10 110:26, 111:2, 122:22, 123:14 main [10] - 11:7, manual [1] - 38:3 116:19, 133:19, listening [1] - 76:12 lesson [1] - 39:23 12:9, 17:16, 20:4, lists [1] - 28:17 March [3] - 10:14, 135:4, 136:11, lessons [3] - 46:23, 29:12, 34:20, 53:29, 137:23, 140:14, 47:16, 47:22 literally [1] - 17:19 12:15, 120:20 54:29, 60:16, 141:22 140:28, 141:9, letter [15] - 27:9, lives [2] - 31:11, 70:7 marching [1] - 77:9 maintain [1] - 48:6 142:16, 142:19, Marian [1] - 1:25 52:13, 58:13, 88:22, living [1] - 97:28 maintenance [2] -142:27 mark [5] - 33:22, 89:27, 93:4, 96:23, loaned [1] - 2:28 7:14, 31:24 67:29, 143:14, Mcquaid [9] - 15:4, 112:20, 114:15, Local[1] - 17:3 major [2] - 36:2, 79:5, 92:27, 93:11, 143:25, 144:2 120:22, 120:29, local [8] - 7:13, 59:12 93:18, 94:10, 94:22, marked [1] - 101:25 122:12, 122:26, 17:24, 19:22, 31:25, majority [5] - 8:28, 96:1. 96:29 138:9, 140:10 marmalade [1] -39:17, 75:11, 95:8, 35:1, 120:11, 120:12, Mcquaid's [1] - 79:7 Letterfrack[4] -81:12 127:11 142:13 meals [1] - 42:2 12:28, 83:4, 101:15, located [1] - 11:8 marshaled [1] male [3] - 91:28, mean [12] - 41:22, 109:3 86:11 lodge [1] - 113:9 92:3, 132:2 53:16, 85:17, 104:16, letters [3] - 45:21, martial [1] - 75:27 long-term [1] males [1] - 131:14 109:1, 123:1, 123:4, 80:13, 95:24 Mary [2] - 56:2, 118:21 malice [2] - 90:2, 129:16. 132:11. level [31] - 7:16, 100:24 look [18] - 34:10, 90:9 133:14, 137:12, 16:9, 26:12, 31:17, Mary's [5] - 4:19, 55:25, 56:17, 71:8, Malone [2] - 2:27, 138:20 31:22, 32:23, 36:1, 6:16, 6:19, 6:24, 10:9 74:12, 75:23, 87:22, 2:29 meaning [1] - 56:10 36:6, 39:24, 45:25, master [2] - 32:10, 93:17, 100:29, 102:4, man [7] - 43:27, means [7] - 4:13, 51:9, 54:28, 59:3, 49:22 108:24, 108:25, 43:29, 82:23, 82:28, 47:13, 54:23, 55:8, 65:23, 65:24, 70:5, 115:8, 118:24, Mater [3] - 61:12, 90:4. 96:3. 110:29 78:19, 123:2, 133:7 70:8, 70:21, 73:24, 120:17, 122:11, 62:1, 92:27 managed [1] - 60:22 meant [6] - 116:19, 74:12, 74:22, 77:21, 124:4, 133:29 material [2] - 11:5, management [15] -120:26, 120:27, 77:23, 95:3, 96:19, looked [14] - 18:16, 11:6 5:28, 14:26, 17:1, 97:1, 97:21, 106:8, 128:28, 133:12, 22:19, 24:16, 24:18, materials [1] - 68:23 17:24, 17:25, 18:4, 133:13 106:24, 128:7 41:2, 42:8, 52:28, mathematically [1] -18:14, 18:25, 19:4, measured [1] - 81:16 levels [3] - 36:5, 52:29, 62:23, 69:18, 19:24, 24:8, 88:26, mechanics [2] -131:25, 132:19 81:16, 96:29, 110:16, matter [17] - 18:22, 88:27, 128:9, 140:9 liberally [1] - 27:20 54:3, 67:27 138:27 28:7, 29:22, 34:11, Management [1] liberty [1] - 130:29 mecum [1] - 57:10 looking [11] - 20:3, 39:2, 43:3, 50:28, lice [1] - 112:29 33:11, 33:13, 49:17, media [1] - 12:1 51:15, 64:6, 87:13, Manager [34] medical [21] - 19:10, licensed [1] - 91:18 55:27, 87:23, 96:17, 89:29, 105:5, 108:17, 17:26, 17:28, 18:4, 24:17, 24:18, 25:17, lies [1] - 127:26 105:13, 106:6, 122:22, 124:19, 18:7, 18:27, 19:15, 25:25, 37:22, 48:21, life [9] - 4:25, 4:28, 127:29, 139:18 19:16, 19:19, 19:29, 126:19, 142:21 59:15, 59:28, 60:5, 16:24, 42:2, 42:3, looks [2] - 41:12, 32:5, 32:6, 32:19, matters [20] - 5:27, 60:11, 60:14, 60:18, 41:14 44:13, 66:24, 131:15 13:4, 16:23, 19:9, 50:14, 51:28, 52:1, 60:29, 61:1, 61:6, light [5] - 46:7, Lord[1] - 121:22 19:10, 20:9, 87:7, 52:5, 52:14, 53:5, 62:14, 62:17, 62:22, 46:12, 46:14, 101:26, 100:16, 103:26, loss [2] - 34:17, 55:27, 56:7, 60:1, 80:29, 89:21 122:3 34:19 121:15, 123:6, 129:6, 61:26, 81:21, 85:27, medically [1] - 60:27 129:7, 130:4, 136:17, lights [1] - 43:15 lost [2] - 44:20, 84:7 87:12, 88:3, 97:14, meet [1] - 66:17 likelihood [1] low [7] - 8:4, 8:7, 136:29, 137:20. 111:15, 114:13, meeting [6] - 19:29, 138:25 8:14. 65:8. 101:8. 140:20, 143:6, 143:27 134:14, 134:15, 80:3, 83:8, 83:12, maximum [1] - 53:15 likely [7] - 6:9, 128:5, 128:7 135:1, 140:9, 140:11

94:26, 110:4	5:20	month's [1] - 21:22	N	neighbouring [1] -
meetings [4] - 20:2,	middle [2] - 48:13, 117:21	months [3] - 58:27, 96:23, 97:16		_ 31:19
20:16, 80:13, 111:15 Member [7] - 78:9,	might [16] - 13:1,	Moorhead [1] - 2:13	name [3] - 28:9,	net [1] - 63:20 never [10] - 43:17,
82:18, 82:20, 82:23,	14:9, 28:4, 49:17,	mooted [1] - 74:9	29:3, 60:24 named [2] - 117:19,	46:23, 48:8, 89:9,
83:2, 84:24, 110:29	61:10, 65:29, 66:1,	moral [5] - 118:17,	131:10	90:19, 90:21, 90:25,
member [7] - 19:16,	72:22, 96:11, 105:18,	118:18, 119:1,	namely [2] - 46:6,	123:24, 135:12,
19:21, 26:7, 29:3,	107:16, 112:7,	119:23, 120:3	53:15	135:28
29:26, 80:19, 82:20	127:26, 128:22,	morally [1] - 119:2	names [3] - 28:29,	new [2] - 35:23, 95:1
members [1] -	140:14, 141:12	morals [1] - 119:4	31:8, 120:13	News [2] - 122:18,
126:23	mile [1] - 86:26	mores [2] - 108:22,	narrow [1] - 77:16	122:19
Members [6] - 1:23,	militate [1] - 128:20	130:18	national [17] - 16:13,	newspaper [9] -
2:1, 4:7, 5:3, 31:14,	mind [8] - 12:8,	morning [16] - 4:4,	20:5, 25:9, 45:19,	11:27, 41:10, 58:22,
140:15	13:11, 68:8, 84:14,	4:6, 4:17, 10:6, 10:7,	45:26, 46:11, 48:16,	104:6, 112:10,
memory [4] - 47:8,	88:24, 105:16, 121:2	19:28, 21:11, 44:15,	54:17, 68:16, 70:22,	112:12, 115:4,
76:14, 106:17, 140:10	mindset [1] - 120:28	59:20, 81:11, 81:12,	70:25, 72:5, 72:14,	122:19, 122:19
meningitis [1] -	minimise [1] -	87:24, 88:28, 110:8,	72:18, 91:25, 92:5,	newspapers [1] -
91:22	141:24	142:26, 143:11	92:16	58:14
mental [3] - 28:14,	minimum [1] - 46:22	Most [1] - 9:9	nationally [4] -	next [9] - 28:12,
28:24, 29:11	Minister [1] - 115:10	most [12] - 7:13,	72:12, 91:26, 91:28,	28:27, 31:13, 34:26,
mentally [2] - 72:10,	ministries [2] -	8:29, 22:8, 31:8,	92:11	59:6, 72:6, 78:24,
72:11	26:10, 26:16	58:25, 78:4, 78:5,	natural [1] - 131:20	92:19, 121:7
mention [7] - 69:17,	Ministry [1] - 32:7	86:11, 98:10, 108:1,	nature [16] - 39:12,	night [3] - 21:12,
75:17, 108:14,	minute [7] - 31:8,	120:8, 137:10	67:29, 70:9, 77:8,	64:13, 64:14
119:22, 123:24,	74:2, 82:29, 83:5,	mother [4] - 107:20,	90:28, 108:12,	nine [3] - 37:9, 88:5,
136:24, 142:23	83:10, 84:5, 90:9	112:17, 112:23,	112:11, 114:17,	91:14
mentioned [24] -	minutes [3] - 20:3,	114:24	115:1, 117:14,	No.s [1] - 3:4
49:12, 56:19, 57:15,	20:15, 59:5	move [14] - 31:1,	118:29, 125:24,	nobody [2] - 71:23,
61:25, 62:18, 68:21,	misdemeanour [1] -	31:6, 31:12, 33:25,	126:17, 132:5,	72:5
69:5, 71:10, 72:6, 91:1, 94:10, 94:17,	86:25	34:11, 38:22, 38:23,	132:14, 139:12	Noel [1] - 2:5
101:20, 102:12,	misfits [1] - 88:27	38:25, 78:24, 94:21, 98:10, 100:14,	near [2] - 42:28, 76:15	non [6] - 22:10,
111:12, 112:9, 113:8,	misnomer [1] - 23:22	102:27, 137:8	nearby [1] - 9:14	35:19, 54:6, 62:4, 71:4, 137:18
113:26, 119:26,	mistaken [3] - 33:12, 70:15, 86:4	moved [8] - 29:24,	nearly [1] - 33:2	non-academic [1] -
125:25, 128:12,	mistakes [1] - 63:24	30:22, 31:5, 40:16,	necessarily [2] -	54:6
136:8, 141:29	mitching [1] - 102:10	43:7, 67:17, 98:8,	53:17, 128:8	non-attendance [1] -
mentioning [2] -	mixed [1] - 76:19	103:6	necessary [2] - 6:29,	71:4
58:14, 62:16	mixing [1] - 8:27	moves [1] - 28:20	88:21	non-offenders [1] -
mentions [1] - 49:22	Mobile [2] - 109:29,	Moving [6] - 34:26,	need [14] - 7:4,	35:19
Merrion [1] - 1:5	110:24	53:12, 55:20, 60:18,	12:12, 12:17, 26:1,	non-reporting [2] -
messaging [1] - 54:3	mobile [4] - 110:2,	64:18, 91:10	37:3, 48:9, 59:13,	62:4, 137:18
met [8] - 19:27,	110:3, 110:4, 110:27	moving [6] - 22:21,	60:24, 61:6, 61:11,	non-teaching [1] -
19:28, 26:13, 49:16,	mode [1] - 84:20	31:3, 37:10, 98:21,	85:7, 91:2, 97:11,	22:10
61:23, 79:19, 96:27	moderate [3] - 71:21,	118:15, 133:5	135:27	None[1] - 32:14
metal [2] - 68:20,	71:25, 72:3	music [2] - 24:14,	needed [4] - 26:3,	none [3] - 34:18,
74:24	moment [11] - 14:10,	77:10	27:12, 61:10, 69:17	76:9, 104:28
methodologies [1] -	19:15, 33:13, 43:18,	musical [6] - 24:13,	Needless[1] -	nonetheless [1] -
63:23	43:19, 52:26, 55:4,	39:18, 70:13, 76:6,	121:21	136:16
methodology [1] -	83:7, 100:17, 120:15,	76:19	needn't [1] - 128:8	Nonetheless [2] -
56:10	127:28	Musicals [1] - 77:13	needs [3] - 6:27,	12:16, 114:14
Michael [6] - 1:12,	Monday [1] - 5:18	musicals [3] - 39:9,	45:8, 142:9	norm [1] - 128:14
4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1,	money [6] - 31:28,	39:13, 39:14	negative [5] - 12:4,	normal [4] - 13:22,
115:3	33:8, 33:10, 41:26,	musicians [1] -	24:1, 29:15, 65:7,	24:23, 52:21, 131:20
mid [2] - 5:20, 92:21	66:28, 67:13	76:24	65:9	normally [6] - 18:11,
mid-1960's [1] -	monitor [4] - 38:13,	must [8] - 2:27,	negatives [1] - 27:11	19:28, 53:22, 53:23,
40:20	38:19, 49:18, 126:8	43:19, 63:10, 75:22,	neglect [7] - 7:3,	61:7, 88:3
mid-1970's [1] - 70:22	monitors [3] - 38:11,	90:1, 109:1, 128:25, 128:26	35:9, 103:4, 111:21,	norms [1] - 131:22
mid-19th [1] - 6:27	38:15, 38:27	myth [1] - 116:12	112:7, 112:8	north [3] - 4:22, 6:20,
mid-tecember [1] -	month [3] - 57:1,	iiiyui [1] - 110.12	neglected [2] - 7:27,	95:21
illia-aecellibei [1] -	112:27, 113:1		18:15	North [1] - 11:9

Northern [7] - 31:19. 32:1, 32:4, 32:21, 32:24, 32:27, 69:22 northern [2] - 4:22, 6:20 note [1] - 60:2 noted [2] - 77:10, 77:28 notes [2] - 1:31, 79:25 noteworthy [1] -127:19 Nothing [1] - 42:2 nothing [10] - 41:24, 78:18, 78:19, 82:11, 100:26, 109:17, 110:14, 118:10, 124:2, 126:15 notice [4] - 96:19, 96:23, 103:6 notified [4] - 6:11, 52:14, 52:27, 53:10 noting [1] - 30:9 notion [1] - 43:24 notoriety [1] - 77:13 nourished [1] -89:23 November [1] - 45:25 novitiate [2] - 16:3, 16:6 nowadays [2] -30:11, 135:11 Number[1] - 24:21 number [55] - 5:13, 8:12, 9:5, 11:1, 14:25, 29:6, 29:23, 40:1, 50:1, 50:26, 51:8, 51:16, 52:9, 54:12, 56:8, 57:17, 58:2, 60:19, 63:29, 64:10, 65:14, 67:16, 67:19, 68:18, 69:17, 70:12, 71:3, 72:4, 72:28, 73:1, 91:9, 91:28, 92:26, 92:28, 96:16, 97:19, 97:21, 98:6, 101:7, 101:9, 102:4, 102:7, 105:22, 111:22, 112:1, 113:4, 113:27, 117:6, 118:13, 119:1, 129:29, 131:27, 134:22, 136:24 numbers [4] - 8:3, 8:7, 8:11, 43:9 numerous [2] -110:13, 124:8 nurse [3] - 24:18, 60:21, 131:28

nuts [1] - 24:16

0 o'clock [1] - 98:25 **Cleary** [2] - 115:3, 115:14 **Crafferty** [1] - 88:13 **Osullivan** [1] - 2:13 object [1] - 96:25 Object[1] - 41:16 objective [2] - 143:9, 143:29 obligation [1] - 55:21 observance [2] -26:15, 29:18 observations [3] -14:23, 90:21, 108:28 observed [1] - 46:24 observer [1] - 143:9 obsolete [2] - 68:19, 68:25 obvious [9] - 36:7, 37:4, 37:7, 68:26, 69:15, 79:25, 94:1, 126:13, 134:24 Obviously[8] -12:22, 24:9, 33:15, 52:19, 58:5, 64:6, 119:19, 132:20 obviously [35] - 14:7, 14:22, 17:13, 18:17, 21:6, 23:14, 29:7, 32:19, 35:11, 36:9, 50:12, 50:28, 56:16, 58:6, 60:10, 63:16, 67:17, 68:12, 93:13, 94:4, 95:11, 105:15, 106:23, 107:5, 107:13, 116:15, 117:25, 124:28, 126:4, 131:9, 133:18, 134:25, 138:20, 144:3, 144:5 occasion [2] - 62:12, occasionally [1] -26:20 occasions [3] -62:19, 64:29, 113:4 occurred [3] - 91:17, 103:18, 103:19 occurrence [1] -106:7 October[2] - 140:19, 140:26 offence [7] - 7:2, 53:20, 80:8, 86:23, 118:27, 124:19,

143.21

offences [4] - 8:24.

35:9, 35:14, 124:14

offender [2] - 119:6, 122:13 offenders [4] - 6:28, 35:18, 35:19, 58:26 offer [2] - 106:1, 124.29 offering [1] - 69:12 offers [1] - 74:21 office [2] - 36:28, 49:15 officer [3] - 24:17, 61:1. 89:21 official [3] - 110:16, 110:17, 136:3 officially [1] - 95:25 old [4] - 91:29, 92:4, 132:3, 134:7 older [4] - 22:10, 22:18, 37:6, 38:16 olds [2] - 37:9 omissions [1] on-call [1] - 61:9 once [7] - 19:27, 30:11, 40:17, 57:2, 61:8, 61:9, 76:15 one [139] - 4:19, 12:4, 12:21, 13:2, 14:3, 19:25, 21:6, 21:26, 23:8, 23:21, 23:22, 24:1, 24:11, 24:13, 24:21, 25:22, 26:12, 26:19, 27:18, 27:19, 28:2, 28:7, 28:20, 34:5, 35:16, 36:20, 39:19, 41:6, 41:29, 43:18, 43:20, 44:3, 48:13, 48:20, 49:21, 49:24, 50:15, 51:15, 51:18, 51:22, 51:27, 52:8, 52:22, 52:23, 52:26, 53:9, 53:26, 55:2, 55:27, 57:13, 58:12, 58:13, 59:5, 59:24, 60:7. 61:20, 62:1, 62:12, 64:29, 65:17, 66:3, 66:25, 66:26, 66:29, 68:22, 69:1, 69:23, 69:24, 70:1, 70:11, 70:14, 71:16, 74:9, 74:15, 74:25, 75:20, 77:29, 78:2, 80:7, 81:2. 81:5. 81:11. 81:14, 82:25, 82:27, 85:2, 85:19, 86:14, 87:24, 89:21, 90:7, 92:23, 94:13, 95:5, 95:8, 95:20, 95:27, 96:22, 97:8, 100:16,

102:3, 102:9, 105:9, 108:1, 109:7, 113:8, 113:10, 113:13, 113:19, 114:2, 118:5, 118:17, 119:10, 119:27, 121:19, 121:29, 123:4, 123:26, 123:27, 123:28, 125:26, 126:3. 126:10. 128:11, 130:6, 130:14, 132:19, 133:3, 134:12, 134:27, 134:28, 136:18, 136:29, 138:8, 138:25, 142:21 One[9] - 10:11, 18:15, 21:29, 34:11, 50:11, 83:18, 89:8, 95:4, 132:27 onerous [6] - 22:29, 23:8, 23:16, 23:17, 87:27, 88:1 ones [11] - 37:5, 37:6. 51:12. 73:16. 106:29, 107:1, 126:16, 128:10, 130:29, 131:1, 139:28 ongoing [1] - 7:15 onus [1] - 13:20 onwards [1] - 12:3 open [12] - 39:15, 39:16, 46:6, 93:10, 93:15, 93:29, 94:20, 95:15, 95:20, 95:25, 96:16, 123:8 opened [3] - 7:24, 95:27, 141:18 opening [1] - 94:29 openings [1] - 69:16 openly [1] - 129:8 operate [3] - 9:3, 36:29. 134:15 operated [4] - 4:28, 7:8, 35:13, 64:20 operation [4] - 5:29, 9:18, 26:16, 38:14 opinion [1] - 114:12 opportunity [9] -5:24, 6:5, 34:7, 35:23, 64:15, 71:1, 73:21, 76:14, 98:17 opposing [1] -103:25 opposite [1] - 14:20 oppressive [2] -49:20, 49:26 opt [1] - 74:25

option [1] - 74:23

optional [1] - 66:13

oral [2] - 36:23, 36:25 orchestras [1] -70:18 Order[3] - 26:22, 87:22, 105:17 order [12] - 6:29, 9:12, 23:18, 37:23, 37:25, 39:3, 53:16, 53:24, 57:16, 81:4, 84:12, 93:29 orders [2] - 41:26, ordinarily [1] - 57:2 Ordinary[1] - 1:23 organisation [1] -66:22 organisations [4] -45:10, 45:11, 56:1 organising [2] -23:19, 23:20 original [4] - 7:28, 38:1. 38:5. 52:13 orphaned [2] - 7:27, 8.23 ought [1] - 53:2 ourselves [1] - 34:9 outlined [2] - 103:13, 127:10 outlining [1] - 5:14 outside [14] - 18:29, 19:5, 19:6, 23:26, 66:24, 67:3, 110:7, 114:1, 115:29, 121:15, 125:20. 125:21, 128:3, 128:15 outstanding [1] -Overall[1] - 77:21 overall [7] - 11:25, 14:14, 14:18, 17:27, 18:5, 21:5, 73:12 overheard [2] -116:8, 116:20 overlooked [1] -100:16 oversight [1] - 96:26 own [11] - 21:27, 56:10, 56:27, 56:29, 64:19, 79:16, 88:24, 89:17, 109:27, 126:6, 128:11

Ρ

page [63] - 11:3, 16:29, 20:28, 21:28, 23:6, 28:9, 28:20, 28:22, 28:27, 31:23, 32:12, 32:16, 34:29,

37:16, 40:25, 41:9, 41:15, 41:16, 43:10, 43:12, 44:19, 45:17, 48:1, 48:19, 52:9, 52:10, 52:11, 53:13, 56:26, 57:17, 58:22, 59:1, 60:19, 66:19, 71:8, 72:7, 75:21, 75:24, 76:4, 86:5, 87:13, 88:12, 88:19, 91:11, 91:27, 92:13, 93:18, 102:1, 107:17, 115:6, 118:24, 120:18, 121:8, 124:12, 125:6, 127:8, 133:29, 136:22, 140:28, 141:4, 141:5
pages [1] - 122:11 Pages [1] - 44:21
paging [1] - 54:2
paid [3] - 32:7,
32:14, 76:7
painters [1] - 67:27
painting [2] - 54:4,
90:5
palm [2] - 46:6,
46:26
panels [1] - 134:10 papers [4] - 36:24,
39:19, 51:17, 52:28
paradox [1] - 93:17
paragraph [6] - 23:4,
28:21, 59:2, 75:24,
76:3, 121:9
pardon [2] - 59:1,
111:24
parent [1] - 8:21
parental [1] - 7:4 parents [9] - 51:21,
51:22, 52:27, 53:1,
53:26, 61:15, 62:4,
111:27, 113:4
parishes [1] - 95:9
Park[1] - 77:7
part [26] - 6:20, 14:8,
16:20, 16:26, 22:8,
29:24, 30:23, 59:6,
63:12, 76:29, 89:11,
102:12, 102:29, 103:1, 103:2, 103:3,
103:6, 103:10,
112:27, 113:21,
113:22, 126:24,
127:1, 133:24,
134:10, 136:8
Part [1] - 94:9
part-time [1] - 89:11
participated [1] -
39:26

particular [19] - 13:1. 15:21, 22:1, 26:21, 42:11, 42:18, 43:27, 72:5, 81:12, 91:24, 105:11, 111:10, 113:3, 113:22, 114:6, 122:1, 125:2, 134:12, 142.7 particularly 191 -17:15 20:9 45:10 59:15, 65:19, 92:25, 96:6, 114:8, 143:27 parties [1] - 6:11 Partly [1] - 41:25 partly [1] - 41:26 parts [3] - 9:1, 40:24, 103:1 party [2] - 2:28, 115:29 passage [1] - 42:19 passed [3] - 7:10, 17:7, 107:10 passing [1] - 7:19 past [3] - 4:10, 67:3, 143:21 pastoral [1] - 26:12 Patrick [1] - 2:12 pattern [1] - 101:14 Paul [3] - 2:6, 56:2, 92.27 paying [1] - 67:13 Peadar [1] - 108:6 peer [1] - 131:19 peers [1] - 49:25 pejorative [1] -143:16 penances [1] - 139:2 people 1981 - 11:16. 12:12, 13:16, 13:21, 14:18, 17:13, 18:13, 21:6, 22:19, 22:23, 24:7, 26:2, 30:7, 31:10, 34:8, 34:21, 35:8, 35:14, 37:8, 37:22, 38:17, 40:8, 40:9, 47:4, 47:22, 48:1, 48:14, 50:11, 50:16, 50:25, 50:26, 51:13, 54:12, 54:17, 54:27, 55:18, 56:4, 58:2. 58:9. 59:11. 61:11, 68:9, 68:16, 70:4, 70:7, 70:8, 70:14, 70:23, 70:25, 71:29, 72:8, 80:4, 80:5. 81:1. 83:14. 83:16, 83:25, 84:17, 85:8, 89:21, 98:1,

98:2, 100:24, 102:7,

102:16, 105:17,

105:23, 106:14, 113:28, 113:29, 117:19, 119:25, 123:5, 123:21, 126:4, 128:22, 129:6. 129:14, 130:20, 130:23, 131:4, 131:9, 131:21, 132:17, 134:19, 134:25, 134:26, 135:7. 135:19, 136:6, 136:10, 137:5, 137:14, 141:19, 141:26, 141:27, 143:2, 143:7 People [2] - 33:29, 81:10 per [2] - 58:28, 66:27 percentage [3] -70:22, 71:18, 73:24 percentages [2] -58:19, 71:15 perception [2] -127:25, 137:12 perfect [5] - 43:20, 74:3, 74:4, 83:22, 83:23 perfection [1] -42:28 perhaps [7] - 5:5, 54:5, 108:26, 116:9, 123:13, 125:28, 142:5 period [33] - 4:26, 8:12, 8:15, 9:18, 15:14, 18:9, 18:12, 19:2, 19:3, 24:28, 25:7. 46:19. 51:5. 53:15, 53:18, 55:6, 56:1, 71:19, 74:15, 86:26, 91:27, 92:6, 92:9, 92:21, 95:7, 101:8, 101:10, 101:25, 104:9, 109:14, 127:2, 127:3, 128:1 permanent [1] -52:16 permissible [1] permission [2] -2:29.95:8 permitted [4] -45:25, 45:26, 47:23, perpetrated [2] -14:17, 136:2 person [32] - 18:2,

49:24, 51:27, 55:4, 56:24, 58:28, 64:7, 66:20, 67:14, 80:7, 80:21, 101:23, 116:1, 116:6, 121:1, 122:10, 123:28, 124:17, 124:21, 130:8, 139:1, 139.8 person's [1] - 115:28 personages [1] -39.16 personal [1] - 79:17 personnel [2] -26:17, 87:14 persons [2] - 5:13, 6.6 perspective [6] -79:7, 120:3, 120:4, 142:9, 143:8 perspectives [1] -117:23 pertaining [1] -133:12 pervaded [3] - 40:27, 48:29, 82:1 petty [1] - 8:23 Phase [8] - 4:17, 5:9, 5:11, 5:25, 6:4, 6:10 phase [1] - 68:26 phased [2] - 20:21, 67:18 Phases [1] - 6:2 phases [1] - 4:15 phone [6] - 109:29, 110:2, 110:3, 110:5, 110:24, 110:28 photocopied [1] -2:27 phrase [3] - 44:8, 78:21, 90:2 physical [16] - 15:18, 16:23. 50:5. 90:22. 100:14, 103:2, 103:3, 103:18, 103:23, 104:11, 108:23, 111:21, 116:23. 117:4, 117:25, 117:26 picked [1] - 40:9 picture [14] - 6:8, 6:9, 11:25, 12:3, 13:10, 14:18, 50:27, 60:14 90:4 90:5 107:6, 130:25, 130:27 piece [1] - 75:18 pitied [1] - 120:23 pity [1] - 94:20 place [36] - 5:20, 8:20, 10:28, 12:11, 15:4, 15:7, 27:22, 28:24, 29:16, 45:8,

45:13, 49:25, 49:27, 54:11, 59:17, 59:29, 61:29, 74:18, 77:11, 85:23, 93:15, 97:4, 97:6, 101:20, 101:24, 114:14, 114:17, 117:26, 129:21, 131:12, 134:8, 134:18, 134:25, 135:11. 136:2 Place [1] - 2:16 place' [1] - 115:21 placed [3] - 54:1, 54:12, 67:3 places [10] - 77:6, 77:12, 95:20, 105:28, 107:29, 120:6, 136:1, 137:13, 140:1, 142:4 placing [1] - 67:25 play [2] - 42:2, 75:28 played [1] - 77:9 playing [5] - 38:22, 40:14, 40:15, 76:6, 76:11 pleaded [1] - 143:21 pleasant [3] - 39:21, 63:17, 115:23 pleased [1] - 58:11 pleasure [2] - 76:12, 115:15 plenty [1] - 25:22 plus [1] - 66:28 pocket [1] - 110:6 point [22] - 7:29, 27:17, 29:18, 34:29, 42:8, 46:9, 53:13, 53:25, 62:16, 63:16, 64:12, 67:8, 67:14, 68:15, 70:1, 70:3, 78:20, 103:16, 112:7, 119:18, 128:7, 140:21 pointed [2] - 32:3, 142:27 pointing [1] - 52:2 policy [6] - 30:3, 30:20, 46:18, 61:11, 103:11, 135:17 pool [1] - 40:21 poor [1] - 106:18 population [5] -8:10, 72:11, 72:14, 92:3, 96:18 pork [1] - 59:18 portion [1] - 20:15 position [13] - 10:14, 10:20, 12:18, 14:10, 14:15, 14:16, 17:10, 17:11, 67:25, 94:7,

116:25, 130:11,

141:16

18:29, 19:6, 20:26,

21:7, 27:16, 29:12,

43:6, 49:10, 49:11,

positions [2] - 87:17,	34:24, 37:20, 50:14,	23:16	proportion [2] -	published [1] - 138:6
120:6	79:16, 107:9, 107:11,	principles [1] - 47:24	86:23, 104:27	pulmonary [1] -
positive [5] - 12:11,	135:13	prioritise [1] - 66:17	proposals [1] - 16:5	91:16
12:19, 23:29, 41:3,	press [1] - 39:18	prison [3] - 58:3,	propose [3] - 9:18,	punished [11] -
62:6	Presumably [1] -	58:9, 58:26	31:15, 107:14	47:22, 47:23, 50:6,
positives [1] - 27:11	138:22	prisons [1] - 78:9	proposed [1] - 5:26	63:7, 64:1, 82:12,
possibility [1] -	presumably [2] -	private [8] - 5:21,	proposition [1] -	86:25, 86:29, 102:20,
119:27	61:27, 130:12	105:6, 107:16,	33:18	127:26, 130:5
possible [4] - 43:20,	presume [8] - 29:17, 38:3, 41:22, 53:19,	117:23, 130:12, 143:4, 143:6, 144:12	propriety [1] - 46:24	punishing [1] - 120:29
74:15, 84:29, 135:28 possibly [7] - 18:15,	77:3, 122:4, 126:10,	probability [1] -	prospect [1] - 68:9	Punishment [8] -
44:7, 58:21, 62:19,	138:8	81:22	prospects [1] - 67:20 protection [6] - 7:1,	109:9, 109:16,
77:17, 80:4, 116:26	presuming [2] -	probationary [1] -	134:11, 134:19,	109:26, 110:15,
post [4] - 23:9, 68:2,	138:10, 138:11	25:7	135:10, 135:13,	110:19, 111:6,
73:21, 73:22	presumption [1] -	problem [13] - 28:14,	135:17	111:15, 111:18
post-primary [2] -	138:13	62:4, 62:29, 64:9,	protections [2] -	punishment [38] -
73:21, 73:22	prevent [2] - 134:5,	97:7, 100:19, 112:28,	138:19	14:4, 14:12, 41:2,
postponed [1] -	138:2	119:23, 130:28,	proud [1] - 57:23	45:16, 45:25, 46:5,
97:16	previous [2] - 36:7,	138:25, 138:26,	prove [1] - 13:21	46:16, 46:19, 46:22,
potatoes [1] - 59:18	62:12	140:24, 141:7	provide [9] - 6:27,	46:23, 46:25, 46:25,
potted [1] - 15:23	prices [1] - 67:2	problems [1] -	6:29, 7:10, 16:8, 26:2,	46:26, 47:7, 47:15,
Poultry [1] - 28:11	pride [1] - 57:22	112:21	34:21, 41:26, 67:1,	48:7, 48:8, 48:9,
practicable [1] -	priest [3] - 122:1,	procedures [6] -	68:8	48:15, 49:27, 50:18,
74:11	122:7, 128:4	4:13, 6:12, 14:28,	provided [4] - 5:21,	56:18, 63:8, 63:15,
practically [2] -	Primary [5] - 16:9,	34:29, 102:15, 127:9	7:16, 34:22, 74:13	86:21, 86:23, 87:2,
20:22, 80:26	17:19, 24:24, 54:25,	proceed [2] - 84:22,	providing [3] -	103:2, 103:12,
practice [4] - 16:24,	65:18	144:11	21:19, 37:13, 141:19	103:18, 103:23, 106:5, 108:23,
40:8, 66:26, 86:22	primary [63] - 16:12,	process [6] - 13:22,	Province [6] - 4:19,	111:17, 113:23,
practices [1] - 26:26	16:16, 17:20, 17:21,	63:12, 79:28, 94:1,	6:16, 6:20, 6:22, 6:24,	116:28, 117:2, 117:4
praised [1] - 95:3	18:1, 18:19, 18:20,	142:3, 142:7 produce [1] - 91:25	10:9	punishments [2] -
praying [1] - 57:14	18:21, 18:23, 18:24, 18:28, 18:29, 20:20,	produced [4] -	province [3] - 4:21,	23:27, 114:16
pre [2] - 38:4, 107:1	20:25, 23:17, 23:23,	77:14, 110:16,	10:13, 11:8	pupils [18] - 7:25,
pre-artane [1] - 107:1	23:24, 23:28, 24:22,	132:14, 140:25	provinces [3] - 4:20, 6:19, 10:11	7:29, 8:5, 8:9, 8:13,
pre-dated [1] - 38:4	24:26, 25:21, 30:10,	producer [1] - 39:24	Provincial [20] -	9:11, 16:21, 23:25,
precision [2] - 39:19,	30:24, 30:28, 31:2,	producing [1] -	11:9, 18:11, 26:7,	32:24, 36:24, 48:5,
76:11	31:9, 31:11, 32:8,	88:26	27:9, 32:22, 45:20,	53:12, 53:29, 55:6,
predominantly [1] -	35:24, 36:3, 38:26,	production [1] -	74:10, 96:21, 96:27,	56:29, 72:28, 82:10,
12:4	39:27, 40:6, 42:22,	39:22	97:13, 97:15, 120:20,	104:14
prefect [1] - 38:14	47:11, 47:14, 47:18,	productions [2] -	122:5, 124:15,	pure [1] - 86:10
premier [2] - 39:29,	54:23, 64:19, 64:26,	39:9, 40:19	127:12, 127:12,	purpose [6] - 34:20,
40:5	65:18, 65:26, 69:12,	profession [1] -	127:13, 138:16,	46:15, 66:24, 66:26,
premises [1] - 116:3	72:15, 73:19, 73:21,	70:12	140:24	70:2, 83:17
preparations [1] -	73:22, 73:28, 74:4,	proficiency [1] -	provision [3] - 46:2,	purposes [2] - 6:19,
21:13	74:21, 74:25, 77:23,	71:21	75:5, 97:12	55:29
Preparatory [1] -	77:24, 81:18, 81:20, 88:7, 95:1, 95:23,	programme [1] -	prudent [1] - 121:24	pursue [1] - 9:12 pushing [1] - 46:27
69:19	106:6, 110:20,	37:19	psychological [2] -	put [27] - 15:4, 15:7,
preparatory [1] -	110:23, 111:6, 132:1	progressed [2] -	91:2, 118:21	32:16, 36:11, 39:25,
69:22	principal [13] -	82:26, 82:27	public [22] - 4:8,	43:6, 47:28, 49:6,
prepared [1] - 5:15	18:19, 18:20, 18:21,	promoting [1] - 47:29	5:10, 5:26, 6:14,	51:25, 56:24, 65:22,
preparing [1] - 10:17	18:22, 35:28, 36:16,	promotion [1] - 41:3	11:15, 12:8, 12:28, 13:11, 39:15, 39:16,	66:1, 66:8, 69:26,
presence [1] - 86:24	36:22, 66:12, 71:11,	promotional [2] -	39:17, 63:28, 83:8,	74:28, 75:17, 77:15,
present [13] - 5:6,	88:4, 88:7, 92:25,	75:18, 75:22	93:2, 123:16, 123:19,	96:4, 110:5, 110:9,
7:11, 13:10, 49:6,	95:3	Proper [1] - 46:23	130:1, 131:3, 143:3,	112:5, 117:9, 127:15,
58:9, 59:3, 63:18, 71:6, 79:15, 126:2,	Principal [1] - 32:8	proper [1] - 8:21	143:19	130:5, 130:16,
131:7, 133:29, 136:15	principals [4] -	properly [3] - 26:26,	Public [9] - 1:5, 78:9,	143:15, 144:7
Present [1] - 2:1	30:10, 31:7, 31:9,	33:10, 43:26	82:18, 82:20, 82:23,	putting [4] - 13:20,
presented [10] -	88:5	property [2] - 16:3,	83:2, 84:24, 110:29,	28:3, 68:4, 74:26
11:26, 12:3, 13:11,	principalship [1] -	16:7	144:14	puzzled [1] - 138:14
,,				

$\mathbf{\cap}$	
u	

qualified [1] - 25:9 quality [1] - 143:28 quantity [1] - 29:16 queries [1] - 43:24 questions [7] -36:25, 49:6, 55:19, 82:9, 84:23, 85:1, 141:10 quickly [2] - 31:5, 134:4 quietly [1] - 137:15 Quite[1] - 112:1 quite [38] - 12:11, 13:8, 13:24, 15:8, 19:20, 25:23, 27:20, 40:1, 50:26, 54:11, 54:14, 63:29, 65:11, 65:26, 69:15, 71:2, 72:29, 76:13, 79:24, 92:26, 94:1, 94:6, 96:16, 103:8, 107:21, 110:23, 111:11, 113:11, 114:10, 115:22, 117:2, 126:12, 130:20, 131:26, 132:3, 134:23, 135:12, 137:17 quotation [4] -48:19, 70:11, 78:2, 94.16 quote [3] - 27:18, 49:2, 49:9 quoted [4] - 27:19, 64:29, 65:1, 65:2 quotes [1] - 50:24

R

radio [4] - 11:27, 37:18, 49:13, 102:14 Raftery 11 - 100:25 raised [2] - 5:8, 109:22 raises [2] - 140:20, 143:24 ran [3] - 18:5, 34:17, 42:22 range [1] - 66:13 ranged [1] - 8:7 ranging [3] - 8:4, 8:11, 21:8 rapidly [1] - 7:29 rate [11] - 29:19, 54:21, 54:22, 55:9, 65:26, 70:22, 72:16, 92:5, 92:8, 92:15, 98:20

139:13 rates [3] - 32:21. 32:25, 32:26 reasonably [5] rather [15] - 6:7, 11:24, 37:7, 114:6, 24:1, 31:5, 90:6, 121:27, 139:29 94:14, 94:17, 95:28, Reasons[1] - 8:19 106:9, 118:7, 120:3, reasons [7] - 8:28, 125:3, 136:10, 36:7, 37:4, 37:6, 137:27, 141:13, 53:20, 68:4, 126:13 141:14 recalcitrance [1] -Rather[1] - 20:11 23.27 Rattigan[1] - 2:7 receipt [1] - 52:13 raw [1] - 68:23 receive [1] - 42:7 re [2] - 88:22, 101:23 received [2] - 65:25, re-admitted [1] -101:23 receiving [1] - 85:29 re-read [1] - 88:22 recent [5] - 12:1, reach [2] - 66:14, 30:26, 58:22, 138:29, 67:10 139.7 reached [3] - 8:1, recently [2] - 63:22, 54:25, 70:7 reaction [2] - 89:20, Recently[1] - 86:25 128:21 recidivism [1] read [13] - 28:1, 118:22 51:17, 63:6, 71:3, recidivistic [1] -71:20, 71:22, 75:22, 118:28 88:22, 108:6, 122:6, recitation [1] - 86:11 137:27, 141:12, reckoned [1] -141:13 102:14 readily [2] - 128:16, recognise [3] - 69:4, 129:19 69:8, 131:4 reading [12] - 25:16, recollect [1] - 88:28 28:1, 30:21, 62:3, recommend [1] -71:22, 79:20, 95:13, 63:27 121:27, 124:25, recommended [1] -134:24, 137:27, 63:26 141:14 reconciliation [1] real [2] - 33:23, 142.4 69:27 reconsidered [1] realise [1] - 138:24 realised [1] - 79:27 record [7] - 12:5, Really[1] - 120:10 56:16, 56:21, 56:22, really [25] - 13:21, 62:20, 116:16, 117:1 19:27, 24:21, 24:24, recorded [1] - 55:5 25:7, 34:25, 39:2, records [5] - 62:7, 40:14, 55:10, 57:13, 62:10, 108:25, 58:18, 60:2, 62:18, 110:13, 133:20 66:6, 69:28, 70:29, recreation [2] - 39:4, 97:27, 105:12, 107:8, 86:12 120:14, 130:10, redacted [1] - 28:9 130:17, 131:8, reduced [1] - 46:22 131:18, 137:23 Reedy[1] - 2:3 realm [1] - 143:19 refectory [1] - 67:2 reason [20] - 30:23, refer [6] - 43:10, 32:17, 51:9, 52:4, 49:11, 51:27, 115:19, 53:19, 53:27, 75:17, 121:7, 136:13 101:12, 101:13, reference [14] -102:12, 104:15, 22:16, 28:21, 36:19,

125:23, 142:26 references [1] -94:25 referred [17] - 11:15, 16:28, 19:13, 22:16, 25:28, 29:4, 42:16, 45:6, 59:29, 60:28, 61:12, 61:16, 86:3, 101:25, 102:1, 104:6, 133:21 referring [6] - 42:19, 69:1, 106:29, 121:4, 137:16, 143:27 refers [4] - 87:13, 115:2, 122:14, 122:16 reflect [1] - 83:7 reflected [1] - 74:6 reformatory [1] -Reformatory[4] -6:26, 19:26, 20:6, 88:29 refute [1] - 89:22 regard [8] - 5:17, 11:19, 11:29, 13:2, 67:25, 104:12, 123:5, 130:18 regarding [2] - 4:14, 14:11 regimental [2] -43:15, 86:16 regimentation [2] -41:2, 86:10 regimented [1] -42:13 Registrar[1] - 2:3 regular [4] - 30:4, 30:15, 44:12, 96:14 regularly [1] - 63:7 regulations [7] -16:16, 45:18, 45:24, 46:3, 47:24, 47:28, 64:22 rehabilitated [1] -139:9 relate [1] - 136:4 related [4] - 53:19. 91:16, 91:17, 141:1 relates [1] - 142:25 relating [4] - 100:15, 104:10, 115:9, 130:3 relation [81] - 11:23, 13:19, 13:26, 16:6, 20:8, 25:14, 25:23, 26:14, 26:16, 29:11, 30:6, 35:15, 36:3, 37:22, 46:18, 50:9, 50:17. 50:18. 52:3. 52:22, 53:9, 54:21, 56:17, 56:29, 57:5,

57:9, 57:13, 60:3, 60:5, 61:14, 62:4, 62:19, 64:26, 65:12, 67:11, 67:15, 67:16, 68:29, 69:2, 70:21, 72:7, 72:18, 79:3, 79:11, 80:1, 80:2, 80:26, 80:27, 81:23, 88:7, 95:6, 95:29, 97:1. 101:21. 103:17. 106:26, 109:4, 109:5, 110:22, 110:24, 111:12, 112:1, 112:14, 113:10, 113:19, 114:10, 114:22, 114:26, 114:27, 117:4, 121:14, 122:12. 123:25, 123:26, 124:24, 125:18, 129:2, 135:17, 136:3, 136:6, 137:4 relationship [2] -49:4. 58:8 relatively [4] - 51:18, 61:13, 138:29, 139:7 relaxed [2] - 43:8, 102:16 relayed [1] - 140:12 released [2] -113:20, 113:21 relevance [2] - 19:2, 20:14 relevant [7] - 5:7, 5:16, 5:28, 6:6, 27:8, 46:19, 140:25 reliability [3] -143:14, 143:25, 144:2 religion [1] - 57:13 religious [9] - 26:15, 26:26, 29:17, 41:25, 94:28, 96:5, 123:13, 131:15, 139:2 remain [7] - 17:10, 27:27, 31:1, 53:18, 93:10, 93:15, 93:29 remainder [1] -143:4 remained [6] - 9:12, 17:11, 78:6, 97:25, 97:27, 98:6 remaining [1] - 91:17 remarkable [2] -60:6, 72:21 remedial [1] - 20:24 remember [1] - 71:9 remit [1] - 4:26 remove [1] - 117:16 removed [3] -

112:17, 112:24,

36:21, 47:21, 55:3,

61:22, 66:2, 75:25,

79:24, 79:26, 109:26,

106:2, 113:21, 114:1,

125:2, 134:17, 137:5,

114:29, 124:26,

112:26
renovated [1] - 95:1
repeat [3] - 12:15,
139:27, 141:26
repertoire [3] -
75:27, 76:10, 77:7
rephrasing [1] -
95:18
replicated [1] - 91:6
replied [3] - 49:5,
52:14, 82:8
reply [2] - 52:19,
74:10
report [60] - 21:27,
22:1, 25:3, 27:7,
27:18, 28:11, 29:15,
35:18, 36:21, 42:17,
42:26, 43:10, 44:16,
48:17, 55:2, 56:9,
59:9, 59:16, 59:25,
60:5, 60:11, 60:15,
66:19, 66:20, 67:21,
69:6, 69:29, 78:1,
79:6, 79:15, 79:16,
79:18, 80:10, 80:25,
81:6, 81:25, 85:13,
85:14, 85:21, 88:12,
90:14, 93:13, 95:6,
101:28, 112:15,
120:1, 124:14,
127:25, 128:17,
140:18, 140:26,
141:5, 142:5, 142:25,
143:1, 143:14,
143:19, 143:26
Report[8] - 25:28,
25:29, 31:21, 35:17,
37:20, 56:23, 72:8,
111:12
reported [15] - 39:17,
58:23, 94:27, 104:1,
119:21, 122:8,
123:17, 124:20,
126:25, 127:1, 127:4,
127:11, 127:13,
137:11, 137:21
reporter [1] - 43:12
reporting [9] - 18:3,
39:18, 62:4, 66:20,
124:24, 128:3, 128:6,
136:28, 137:18
reports [30] - 11:16,
11:27, 11:28, 12:1,
21:26, 26:20, 27:28,
28:1, 39:13, 47:5,
48:2, 48:16, 51:17,
59:14, 59:15, 59:24,
60:4, 60:10, 62:6,
62:14, 62:15, 65:4,

66:3, 69:17, 74:7,

77:26, 77:29, 86:15,
108:29
represents [1] - 92:5 reproduced [1] -
2:28
Republic[1] - 32:15
reputation [1] - 119:6
request [2] - 7:23,
16:5
require [1] - 5:8
required [2] - 21:15, 134:18
requirement [6] -
109:9, 110:19,
110:20, 111:2, 111:5, 111:7
research [2] - 72:7,
109:5
Resident[38] - 17:26,
17:28, 18:4, 18:7, 18:27, 19:15, 19:16,
19:17, 19:19, 19:26,
19:29, 20:6, 32:5, 32:6, 32:18, 38:8,
50:14, 51:28, 52:1,
52:5, 52:14, 52:19,
53:5, 55:27, 56:6,
60:1, 61:26, 81:21, 85:26, 87:12, 88:3,
97:14, 111:14,
114:12, 134:14, 134:15, 135:1, 140:11
resident [7] - 32:20,
37:18, 49:13, 52:19,
91:13, 98:8, 102:13
residential [2] - 7:5, 30:7
residents [2] - 11:14,
11:21
resistance [1] - 45:9 resisted [1] - 22:22
resolution [1] - 5:8
resources [2] - 77:3,
142:14 respect [2] - 113:29,
142:26
respectful [1] -
121:11
respondent [1] - 2:28
response [4] -
124:15, 134:20,
134:22, 141:7 responsibility [8] -
4:21, 6:24, 17:14,
17:26, 17:27, 21:6, 56:7, 128:25
56:7, 128:25 responsible [8] -
17:4, 19:4, 19:8, 21:4,

rest [4] - 9:1, 20:26,
35:5, 45:2
result [6] - 15:7,
44:26, 50:22, 97:13,
105:7, 130:5
resulted [1] - 43:5
results [4] - 36:12,
48:6, 65:27, 72:15
Resumed[1] - 100:1
retained [3] - 36:26,
36:27
retention [3] - 54:20,
54:22, 55:9
reticence [2] - 96:4,
129:11
retired [2] - 22:18,
86:28
retreat [1] - 139:2
retrospect [1] -
106:26
retrospectively [1] -
117:18
Return[2] - 36:14,
71:12
return [1] - 5:26
returned [4] - 5:9,
36:12, 36:13, 38:5
review [1] - 15:15
revisited [1] - 57:2
revoked [1] - 97:24
Revnolds[14] - 1:12.
Reynolds [14] - 1:12,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road[1] - 11:9 Robinson[1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12, 26:11, 26:12, 27:4,
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigdr [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [2] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road [1] - 11:9 Robinson [1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:10, 24:12, 26:11, 26:12, 27:4, 29:14, 38:8, 89:16
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road [1] - 11:9 Robinson [1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12, 26:11, 26:12, 27:4, 29:14, 38:8, 89:16 Roman [1] - 7:27
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 27:2 rigours [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road; 1 - 11:9 Robinson; 1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12, 26:11, 26:12, 27:4, 29:14, 38:8, 89:16 Roman; 1 - 7:27 Romberg; 1 - 75:29
3:7, 4:18, 6:15, 9:19, 10:1, 10:4, 10:6, 83:26, 98:16, 100:8, 140:22, 141:9, 142:19 Reynolds [2] - 4:24, 84:22 rid [1] - 68:26 rigid [1] - 86:9 rigorous [1] - 121:1 ring [1] - 85:6 rings [2] - 109:29, 110:25 rise [1] - 10:22 rising [2] - 21:12, 43:15 Road [1] - 11:9 Robinson [1] - 2:9 rod [2] - 46:12, 46:15 role [14] - 19:1, 23:8, 23:23, 23:24, 23:28, 24:8, 24:10, 24:12, 26:11, 26:12, 27:4, 29:14, 38:8, 89:16 Roman [1] - 7:27

23:18, 27:21, 38:8,

56:28

room [10] - 21:15, 38:22, 38:24, 38:28, 40:16, 83:15, 83:16, 85:9, 143:3, 143:7 rota [2] - 21:9, 21:14 round [2] - 12:10, 12:19 routine [2] - 14:28, 34:28 Rté[2] - 37:17, 37:18 rule [1] - 74:28 rules [9] - 16:15, 45:18, 45:19, 45:24, 46:3, 47:24, 47:27, 64:22, 135:27 run [5] - 24:7, 51:14, 74:13, 83:24, 134:3 running [6] - 7:22, 18:28, 20:8, 27:24, 54:10 Ryan[1] - 1:18 régime [1] - 123:4 S sabbaticals [1] -30:13 safety [4] - 19:9, 23:19, 37:7, 39:3 salaries [1] - 34:20 salary [6] - 32:5, 32:6, 32:7, 32:9, 32:10 Saleyah [1] - 75:29 sanction [1] - 127:15 sanctions [1] - 23:23 sanitorium [2] -91:14, 91:18 Saorstát [1] - 17:2 Sara[1] - 2:13 sat [1] - 38:28 satisfactory [2] -33:24, 67:25 sausages [3] -59:20, 81:13, 81:14 saved [2] - 122:28,

sarcasm [1] - 46:27 satisfied [1] - 88:24 124:1 saw [5] - 27:3, 48:8, 77:7, 87:4, 90:14 **Sc**[4] - 2:5, 2:5, 2:12, 2:13 scale [1] - 116:24 scandal [3] - 118:19, 119:4, 123:13 schedule [2] - 5:15, 95:24 school [144] - 7:5, 7:25, 8:22, 9:3, 9:9,

9:17, 10:26, 14:1, 16:7, 16:8, 16:12, 16:13, 16:16, 16:18, 17:20, 17:21, 17:25, 18:1. 18:14. 18:19. 18:20, 18:21, 18:23, 18:28, 18:29, 19:5, 19:6, 20:9, 20:12, 20:21, 20:25, 23:17, 23:26, 24:20, 24:22, 24:27, 24:29, 25:22, 27:6, 27:27, 30:10, 30:25, 30:28, 31:1, 31:6, 31:9, 31:11, 32:8, 32:20, 34:14, 35:25, 35:27, 36:1, 36:8, 37:13, 38:2, 38:18, 38:26, 39:21, 39:25, 39:26, 39:27, 42:4, 42:10, 42:20, 42:22, 42:24, 42:27, 43:5, 44:4, 45:26, 46:6, 47:9, 47:10. 47:14, 48:16, 48:27, 54:16, 54:17, 54:24, 54:28, 56:28, 57:7, 58:10, 58:12, 64:19, 64:26, 65:1, 65:3, 65:5, 65:19, 65:21, 65:27, 66:12, 68:8, 69:11, 69:12, 70:24, 70:25, 71:5, 72:15, 73:4, 73:19, 73:24, 73:28, 74:4, 74:9, 74:14, 74:15, 74:21, 75:12, 75:13, 75:15, 77:24, 78:23, 81:18, 81:20, 87:16, 88:8, 88:16, 89:1, 89:10, 92:28, 95:1, 95:16, 95:23. 97:23. 97:29. 98:8, 102:10, 105:23, 106:10, 107:25, 110:20, 110:23 111:6, 121:12, 132:1, 134:17, 135:16, 137:2 School [12] - 4:9, 4:14, 7:24, 9:13, 17:19, 17:22, 25:16, 65:18, 69:20, 88:25, 92:9, 138:8 schooling [1] - 77:22 Schools [8] - 7:9, 7:19, 19:23, 19:27, 20:7, 24:24, 48:25, 88:29 schools [59] - 6:26, 7:10, 7:14, 7:15, 9:7, 14:5, 14:6, 17:5,

18:24, 19:18, 20:14,

24:26, 25:12, 30:7,

shall [2] - 57:1, 76:13 36:4, 37:27, 38:15, 54:6, 59:21, 81:26, 135:18, 135:23, seriousness [1] -40:6, 41:8, 41:28, 108:21, 116:22, 137:7, 137:15, 144:1, 128:29 Shanley [3] - 1:25, 45:19, 45:24, 45:26, 123:23 servant [2] - 80:14, 144:8, 144:9 144:4 46:5, 46:11, 47:11, seemingly [2] sinful [1] - 119:2 80:19 sharing [1] - 37:10 47:18, 54:23, 55:22, 28:24, 90:6 single [1] - 131:23 servants [2] - 88:11, shaved [1] - 102:21 seemstress [1] -58:11, 58:17, 62:26, 89.7 sins [1] - 142:11 **sheet** [1] - 68:20 66:23, 68:17, 69:22, 131:28 serve [4] - 4:29. sheets [2] - 63:12, sister [1] - 61:23 72:9, 72:18, 72:24, self [2] - 34:19, 41:3 66:23, 66:23, 66:26 Sit[1] - 10:4 64:16 73:8, 79:8, 91:7, 93:3, self-discipline [1] served [3] - 38:29, sit [1] - 74:28 shelved [1] - 16:6 93:8. 94:11. 96:16. 68:1, 87:23 sitting [2] - 84:3, shillings [2] - 31:27, 105:24, 106:6, self-sufficient [1] service [1] - 21:20 31:28 109:10, 114:16, 34:19 Services [2] - 2:27, shoe [1] - 54:2 situation [12] - 34:1, 114:29, 115:15, send [2] - 114:28, 59:3. 73:10. 74:3. shoemakers [2] -120:6. 130:22. 138:18 session [1] - 85:8 66:27, 67:25 84:3, 107:7, 108:26, 131:23, 132:4, 136:1, senior [3] - 22:7, Session[1] - 1:5 shoemaking [1] -115:16, 117:11, 138:10, 142:12 80:14, 89:6 set [13] - 6:26, 15:9, 124:23, 139:11, 67:11 Scotland [2] - 7:8, seniors [1] - 43:6 46:16, 47:25, 75:13, shoes [1] - 67:13 141:20 31:29 situations [2] sense [22] - 12:7, 75:15, 80:22, 91:21, shop [1] - 66:25 search [1] - 126:12 13:7, 23:22, 35:16, 29:23, 58:3 107:2. 133:2. 133:4. shops [1] - 66:25 second [12] - 28:21, 40:2, 40:7, 42:23, 134:12, 138:1 Six [1] - 87:16 shorter [1] - 21:23 37:6, 54:28, 56:13, 44:3, 44:16, 48:12, sets [3] - 10:20, six [14] - 18:12, shorthand [1] - 1:31 59:1, 73:24, 74:22, 73:12, 90:3, 92:23, 40:21, 40:23 20:20, 26:2, 40:7, shortly [2] - 81:19, 75:24, 97:20, 103:2, 96:12, 96:13, 96:28, 58:27, 67:3, 88:3, setting [3] - 9:16, 95:7 103:6, 107:17 118:6, 120:13, 121:6, 91:29, 92:4, 96:23, 69:19, 74:8 shout [2] - 84:4, 84:9 secondary [11] -132:19, 134:12, settled [1] - 8:20 118:25, 118:26, show [10] - 26:1, 9:12, 23:17, 30:10, 136:10 124:5, 127:10 seven [7] - 21:19, 30:17, 32:12, 36:6, 31:1, 31:6, 66:12, sensibilities [1] sixth [3] - 54:22, 22:8, 56:21, 88:5, 45:24, 65:27, 88:15, 70:24, 74:19, 74:20, 130:19 112:2, 112:8, 112:12 54:25, 124:11 92:14, 104:3, 136:13 75:11, 97:28 sensitive [1] several [2] - 77:12, size [8] - 7:29, 8:2, showed [2] - 8:6, Secondary [1] - 9:13 115:13 24:29, 26:9, 42:21, 110:8 75:3 Secondly [3] - 29:9. sensitively [1] -42:25, 44:4, 45:11 severe [8] - 45:25, shower [1] - 35:24 129:10, 129:18 131:3 skills [2] - 40:9, 47:7, 48:5, 59:25, showing [2] - 50:20, section [26] - 15:17, sent [22] - 29:13, 86:9, 104:2, 108:27, 54:26 91:24 16:17, 17:22, 18:1, 32:22, 36:15, 83:3, 116:27 slapped [1] - 64:2 shown [2] - 79:7, 22:17, 25:18, 31:13, 96:22, 104:23, slapping [1] - 46:6 severely [5] - 50:6, 114:11 34:26, 37:16, 50:29, 112:20, 122:15, 82:12, 86:24, 87:4, sleep [1] - 41:29 shows [3] - 12:5, 51:1, 55:11, 57:15, 124:14, 134:13, 142:29 slightly [1] - 46:9 91:27, 101:7 65:8, 74:20, 78:24, 137:14, 138:7, severity [1] - 86:29 small [7] - 43:18, side [7] - 75:24, 81:18, 91:11, 98:12, 138:11, 139:1, 139:8, sex [1] - 131:23 50:1, 51:8, 65:13, 76:19, 76:27, 76:29, 98:19, 102:27, 103:7, 139:21, 139:23, Sexual [1] - 119:1 68:18, 79:11, 81:15 105:10, 130:15, 124:5, 125:5, 136:12 139:24, 140:1, 140:3, smaller [3] - 19:25, sexual [38] - 14:13, 130:16 sections [3] - 57:13, 140:10 15:18, 50:10, 50:18, 24:9 43:9 sides [1] - 105:8 77:27, 94:15 sentence [1] - 59:2 90:22, 100:15, social [2] - 8:28, signal [1] - 38:25 secure [2] - 58:25, sentencing [1] -103:11, 118:15, significant [11] - 8:6, 121:20 58:15 118:17, 118:27, society [7] - 44:2, 22:26, 24:11, 27:24, see [24] - 22:25, September [3] - 1:8, 120:21, 121:8, 108:5, 126:6, 129:27, 34:21, 45:13, 51:2, 33:14, 38:6, 41:27, 4:2, 5:19 122:24, 123:15, 129:28, 130:22, 132:2 57:17, 105:22, 48:2, 52:11, 56:4, series [1] - 41:7 124:9, 124:19, socio (11 - 36:9 106:24, 138:20 59:21, 102:27, serious [20] - 48:27, 126:28, 126:29, socio-economic [1] silent [2] - 110:4, 104:26, 107:15, 51:12, 51:18, 52:6, 128:17, 128:19, - 36:9 110:9 110:21, 113:5, 113:6, 52:15, 53:10, 80:8, 128:29, 129:6, 129:7, solicitor's [1] similar [6] - 32:20, 114:28, 115:16, 80:20, 81:26, 89:4, 130:4, 130:7, 130:22, 38:13, 59:4, 62:26, 112:20 116:9, 122:11, 90:22, 108:1, 118:28, 131:17, 132:9, 101:14, 131:13 **solution** [1] - 80:22 124:27, 125:18, 119:4, 119:24, 133:22, 135:17, sometimes [3] similarity [1] - 60:7 126:14, 133:14, 119:25, 122:22, 136:3, 136:7, 136:14, 18:15, 22:22, 139:2 simple [3] - 29:21, 134:1, 134:29 124:19, 129:23, 138:2. 138:18. somewhat [3] -104:15, 120:10 seeing [3] - 33:13, 130:21 138:27, 139:13, 15:23, 38:13, 59:4 simply [15] - 21:17, 43:28, 114:2 seriously [5] - 12:6, 143:20 somewhere [5] -76:10, 84:8, 84:20, seeking [1] - 16:24 31:22, 82:4, 89:29, sexually [1] - 128:4 58:10, 72:18, 75:6, 101:17, 119:17, seem [7] - 29:13, 93:14 Seán [1] - 1:18 137:14, 137:15 120:1, 126:18, 135:8,

91:11, 92:19, 98:12, 134:6, 134:7 soon [1] - 6:28 staff [16] - 20:17. statistically [1] -100:20, 102:2, Sorry[9] - 34:6, 20:18, 20:20, 20:25, 128:5 superior [5] - 19:21, 44:19, 82:19, 110:1, 20:26, 24:2, 29:27, statistics [11] -102:28, 103:1, 105:4, 27:10, 71:23, 72:3, 107:3, 111:22, 115:2, 111:24, 116:19, 49:19, 85:24, 91:5, 36:15, 58:5, 58:7, 72:4 115:6, 118:16, 124:5, 132:28, 136:21, 141:2 91:9, 97:27, 98:5, 71:13, 73:23, 86:3, superiors [2] -131:27, 132:1, 140:12 132:7, 142:2 sorry [3] - 95:1, 92:13, 101:18, 133:22, 133:25 submissions [2] -121:22, 136:22 staffing [2] - 91:5, 101:19, 102:10, 105:2 Superiors [1] -131:25 12:25, 125:6 134:26 sort [13] - 16:25, stay [1] - 48:7 submit [1] - 38:1 20:1, 20:10, 37:12, stage [42] - 5:10, stayed [1] - 97:22 supervise [1] - 21:7 5:29, 12:17, 16:22, submitted [6] - 9:20, 38:4, 51:28, 54:29, Stenography [2] supervised [2] -11:20, 35:15, 37:23, 18:24, 20:26, 30:26, 57:10, 61:26, 89:19, 2:27, 2:29 21:10, 21:11 108:4, 123:6, 140:19 39:9, 40:18, 55:7, 51:10, 71:13 step [2] - 124:27, supervising [1] -56:25, 58:12, 60:11, sound [1] - 49:25 133:3 submitting [1] soundness [1] -61:5, 62:21, 66:16, 121:1 still [8] - 13:15, supervision [5] -67:18, 68:14, 68:19, 29:11 22:19, 29:3, 50:3, subsequently [2] -19:11, 21:5, 21:14, 74:9, 92:23, 93:6, 50.6 87.3 source [1] - 89:10 97:8, 97:27, 126:1, 21:15, 38:7 93:9, 95:20, 97:8, substantial 131 supplied [3] - 2:28, sources [1] - 11:7 126:29 97:22, 97:24, 102:13, stimulate [1] - 41:19 71:3, 104:26, 105:13 Sousa[1] - 75:29 38:6.53:4 102:15, 106:5, stitches [1] - 61:28 success [2] - 40:2, **supply** [2] - 66:28, south [1] - 6:22 106:11, 112:28, southern [1] - 6:22 stopped [1] - 17:29 72:16 116:13, 117:22, space [1] - 42:1 straight [4] - 54:19, successful [11] suppose [3] -119:17, 122:1, 30:8, 54:12, 54:15. spaced [1] - 42:1 72:29, 75:3, 85:5 117:16, 133:15, 125:26, 125:28, 73:14, 73:29, 74:16, 137:25 straightaway [1] speaking [11] -127:12, 134:23, 74:17, 78:4, 78:6, supposed [2] -53:11 11:12, 17:16, 47:26, 135:15, 144:4 78:23, 141:22 66:23, 79:17 65:4, 66:4, 81:23, strains [1] - 23:12 staged [1] - 39:18 succession [1] surmise [1] - 139:14 83:10, 83:28, 83:29, strap [4] - 45:29, stages [1] - 127:14 46:7, 46:15, 46:26 40:7 surpass [1] - 76:9 93:1, 132:2 stand [3] - 82:28, successor [1] special [4] - 15:3, stress [2] - 65:13, surprise [1] - 108:9 118:8, 131:7 115:18 41:11, 78:25, 88:11 69:11 surprised [3] standard [6] - 48:6, suffered [1] - 5:14 specific [6] - 81:23, stresses [1] - 23:12 61:24, 63:26, 108:5 64:24, 65:10, 65:19, sufficient [5] - 34:19, 112:2, 112:8, 112:13, surprises [1] - 87:10 stretching [1] -72:19, 80:27 56:12, 103:22, surprising [1] -138:1, 141:7 112:7 standardised [2] -126:11, 131:6 specifically [4] strict [7] - 25:25, 95:29 36:17, 36:18 sufficiently [1] -11:23, 50:2, 75:14, 26:27, 34:18, 47:11, suspicion [1] standards [4] -138:9 77:16, 117:2, 135:27 113:28 63:18, 117:5, 133:29, suggest [16] - 50:23, specifics [2] - 80:27, **strictly** [2] - 24:12, sustainable [2] -136:15 51:17, 55:13, 57:29, 112:14 104:4. 132:6 83:29 start [2] - 83:13, 79:4, 82:7, 82:9, strong [2] - 31:17, spectacularly [1] swift [1] - 127:21 84:15 104:23, 107:5, 119:9, 144:1 142:28 swimming [1] started [4] - 15:28, 120:28, 121:26, spectrum [2] - 120:2, stronger [1] - 69:26 40:20 40:12, 69:15, 69:27 129:14, 129:23, 125:1 strongly [1] - 83:17 Swords[1] - 95:21 State [3] - 9:8, 58:27, 136:28 students [5] - 19:5, speculate [1] - 90:11 Sworn [1] - 10:1 73:7 suggested [3] spend [2] - 25:11, 21:8, 66:13, 72:22, sympathetic [1] -State's [1] - 58:25 37:21, 56:23, 79:29 115:14 72:28 84:28 statement [13] suggesting [4] sympathetically [1] spending [2] - 58:27, studies [1] - 31:6 9:19, 10:18, 11:3, 30:15, 52:26, 101:4, 59:3 studying [1] - 29:25 12:21, 14:24, 15:21, 129:5 spent [3] - 24:27, subject [6] - 16:15, sympathy [1] - 22:7 86:5, 89:26, 95:2, suggests [1] - 22:13 26:8, 33:10 17:1, 24:20, 64:22, system [53] - 6:29, 104:24, 128:13, spirit [1] - 40:26 **suitability** [1] - 27:26 88:27, 104:12 7:6, 7:8, 9:7, 14:1, 137:25, 141:11 sum [2] - 32:27, spite [2] - 129:20, subjects [1] - 66:13 14:2. 14:8. 18:25. statements [14] -66:28 135:29 submission [43] -22:23, 30:12, 30:24, 4:12, 5:13, 12:23, summarise [2] spoken [2] - 49:5, 4:25, 11:4, 11:18, 30:25, 32:28, 32:29, 50:10, 50:25, 63:6, 141:15, 141:16 82:7 12:9, 13:3, 14:1, 35:13, 36:29, 38:11, 104:13, 104:20, summary [2] - 23:3, 38:13, 38:14, 41:27, **spot** [1] - 116:7 14:24, 15:22, 16:28, 105:14, 108:24, 46:16 42:10, 42:24, 42:27, 16:29, 20:28, 22:17, **Square**[1] - 1:5 127:21, 128:10, summer [1] - 21:23 22:25, 23:4, 31:13, 43:1, 43:20, 44:7, St[7] - 4:19, 6:16, 130:1, 142:1 34:25, 34:27, 40:26, Supae[1] - 75:29 44:17, 47:10, 54:17, 6:19, 6:21, 6:24, 9:13, states [1] - 43:12 Superior [8] - 45:22, 45:17, 48:20, 53:13, 55:22, 56:11, 56:27, stating [2] - 46:3, 49:6, 124:13, 126:20, 57:5, 57:28, 70:25, stable [2] - 68:9, 55:12, 59:6, 59:23, 127:11, 127:13, 71:2, 78:25, 85:16, 73:4, 76:23, 83:22, 78:5

83:23, 84:2, 84:12, 88:16, 93:2, 94:14, 105:23, 132:12, 132:14, 133:7, 133:13, 133:15 systematic [8] - 132:9, 132:11, 132:19, 132:24, 133:2, 133:4, 133:6, 133:12 systemic [5] - 132:19, 132:23, 133:6, 133:13, 133:14

T

Table[3] - 31:23, 71:8. 92:3 table [7] - 32:12, 34:23, 36:6, 36:27, 71:24, 91:23, 100:20 tables [4] - 32:3, 34:4, 38:28, 91:25 tailoring [5] - 54:2, 54:5, 54:13, 54:14, 77:28 tailors [1] - 67:25 tame [1] - 101:28 task [7] - 7:22, 13:23, 17:7, 23:16, 23:18, 121:22 tasks [1] - 88:1 taste [1] - 75:4 taught [3] - 24:14, 69:23, 135:11 **Td**[1] - 108:6 tea [1] - 81:11 teacher [4] - 20:24, 25:9, 30:27, 30:28 teachers [6] - 24:14, 65:13, 74:15, 74:24, 120:9 Teachers[1] - 25:1 teaching [11] -20:17, 20:18, 21:1, 21:4, 21:17, 22:10, 25:5, 29:10, 30:21, 56:9. 120:5 team [5] - 10:13, 85:2, 140:9, 140:17 teams [1] - 40:9 tease [1] - 135:18 technological [1] -38:4 teenager [1] - 143:20 teenagers [1] - 58:25 teeth [1] - 82:25 television [4] -11:28, 40:21, 40:23,

40:24

ten [6] - 56:22. 76:21, 81:5, 82:26, 88:6, 91:16 tend [1] - 129:22 tenor [1] - 12:9 term [2] - 69:20, 118:21 terminology [1] terms [11] - 10:20, 14:14, 15:22, 15:25, 18:4, 29:5, 34:18, 64:24, 70:6, 71:7, terrible [1] - 78:21 tested [1] - 22:24 tests [2] - 36:17, 36:18 that' [1] - 131:5 theatre [1] - 40:18 themselves [13] -22:13, 26:24, 27:23, 43:4, 43:18, 45:5, 70:28, 127:20, 128:16, 128:23, 128:24, 131:4, 141:20 therefore [7] - 13:13, 41:19, 105:7, 107:13, 109:5, 130:25, 132:4 Therefore[3] - 13:22, 110:22, 111:8 thinking [4] - 120:16, 122:10, 123:27, 126:10 third [9] - 26:5, 70:8, 70:21, 103:3, 108:14, 115:29, 120:22, 121:9, 141:4 Thirteen[1] - 8:16 threatening [1] -113:24 Three[2] - 24:21, 91:16 three [16] - 4:15, 7:28, 16:11, 24:21, 24:25, 24:28, 26:11, 30:19. 33:1. 51:11. 60:15, 62:19, 74:29, 91:15, 103:22, 116:26 throughout [3] -16:13, 47:18, 91:7 throw [1] - 101:26 thrust [1] - 85:15 Thurles[1] - 107:24 Thursday[2] - 1:8, tie [2] - 59:14, 59:21

tiered [1] - 40:17

tinsmith [3] - 66:29,

tilt [1] - 109:2

67:3, 68:1 tinsmithing [3] -67:15, 67:17, 68:13 tinsmiths [3] - 67:6, 67:28, 69:1 tiny [1] - 61:22 to-ings [1] - 80:12 today [3] - 93:21, 143:3, 143:7 toilet [1] - 64:15 took [16] - 27:22, 32:23, 45:13, 74:18, 80:7. 80:20. 89:28. 96:25, 101:24, 117:26, 126:11, 128:13, 128:24, 136:2, 141:18, 142:28 top [15] - 20:28, 43:21, 44:9, 51:19, 55:3, 56:26, 60:19, 74:19, 74:20, 74:23, 118:6, 124:11, 138:9 topic [4] - 45:5. 92:19, 118:13, 120:17 total [9] - 8:7, 18:9, 19:5, 31:26, 32:27, 38:17, 91:28, 92:3, 113:2 totality [1] - 116:29 totally [4] - 67:11, 85:25, 131:5, 139:4 tours [2] - 75:20, 87:27 towards [2] - 7:13, Towards[1] - 131:29 trade [8] - 54:26, 57:22, 69:8, 69:22, 69:23, 73:21, 73:29, 75:4 Trades[1] - 69:19 trades [22] - 16:17, 16:19, 18:1, 24:3, 32:11, 34:16, 42:23, 65:29, 66:9, 66:22, 66:23, 66:26, 68:18, 68:25, 69:2, 69:3, 69:12, 69:26, 74:3, 74:8, 77:23, 77:26 tradesman [1] -66:26 trading [2] - 34:17, 34:19 train [1] - 91:3 trained [6] - 30:27, 30:28, 40:9, 60:27, 73:20, 73:28 training [22] - 7:1, 16:4, 16:17, 16:18, 16:20, 25:6, 34:21,

transferred [8] -9:11, 30:22, 69:25, 107:22, 107:23, 107:25, 108:13, 137:14 transpired [1] -37:24 trauma [1] - 128:19 travel [1] - 55:29 treated [1] - 106:15 treatment [1] -105:26 trend [2] - 48:12, 60:7 trends [1] - 96:18 tribute [2] - 76:7, 77.4 trick [1] - 132:29 tried [4] - 22:24, 29:22, 63:22 trophies [1] - 39:29 trouble [1] - 55:17 true [12] - 1:30, 12:6, 22:15, 26:19, 43:17, 48:12, 66:6, 67:16, 80:9, 82:16, 115:28, 131:26 trusted [1] - 38:16 truth [1] - 82:28 try [4] - 14:22, 66:17, 69:25, 93:12 trying [18] - 28:15, 31:8, 34:9, 57:19, 57:27, 66:12, 70:29, 84:28, 94:18, 95:24, 103:13, 104:22, 105:14, 111:27, 119:19, 132:28, 135:18, 137:1 tuberculosis [3] -17:16, 91:15, 91:17 tunes [1] - 77:9 turn [3] - 62:24, 76:23, 110:10 turnaround [2] -30:5, 30:16 turned [5] - 42:20, 78:4, 78:11, 95:25, 110:2 turns [3] - 39:21, 51:2, 59:10 twelve [1] - 82:26

41:3, 42:7, 54:26,

55:1, 66:24, 67:6,

67:12, 67:14, 68:3,

69:13, 95:21, 136:6

Tramore[1] - 121:12

transcript [1] - 1:30

Transcripts[1] - 2:27

68:17, 69:4, 69:8,

twice [3] - 19:27, 61:8, 88:21 two [43] - 4:19, 6:18, 10:11, 17:18, 24:28, 25:6, 30:18, 51:11, 51:26, 54:10, 57:3, 61:21, 62:1, 62:19, 64:29, 66:14, 66:27, 68:1, 68:3, 70:26, 74:27, 78:8, 80:17, 80:18, 80:24, 82:17, 86:27, 88:11, 89:6, 89:12, 89:20, 95:20, 98:25, 103:1, 103:29, 104:2, 112:10, 113:7, 117:23, 121:11, 122:18, 130:6, 133:9 type [11] - 9:17, 26:2, 31:28, 44:4, 54:19, 61:29, 65:11, 68:2, 80:10, 98:4, 131:13 types [3] - 24:25, 54:7, 55:14

U

umbrella [3] - 20:5, 20:10. 20:13 unanimous [2] -125:11, 125:15 unannounced [2] -59:17, 81:2 unaware [2] - 15:5, unbalanced [1] uncommon [1] -107:29 under [20] - 6:26, 7:9, 7:26, 15:15, 16:14, 17:18, 19:24, 24:23, 32:27, 32:29, 33:7, 41:16, 43:15, 47:24, 64:20, 65:10, 88:26, 89:23, 92:25, 141:5 under-financing [1] -88:26 under-funded [1] -33:7 under-nourished [1] undergirding [1] underneath [1] underreporting [2] -129:23, 130:21 understandable [1] -97:8

understood [3] -43:26, 62:29, 118:29 undoubtedly [1] -50:24 unemployed [1] -55:7 unemployment [1] -79:10 unfair [2] - 115:12, 116:10 unforgettable [1] -76:13 unfortunately [6] -20:4, 54:9, 63:11, 101:26, 126:11, 128:24 Unfortunately [7] -36:26, 52:7, 118:5, 118:27, 121:3, 125:18, 139:6 unfounded [1] -89:26 unhappy [1] - 57:6 union [1] - 69:3 unions [1] - 69:8 unit [1] - 58:25 unitary [1] - 18:25 university [4] -29:26, 31:4, 70:23, 70:27 unknown [1] - 15:9 unless [1] - 74:29 Unsatisfactory [1] -67:26 unskilled [3] - 54:6, 55:14, 55:16 unusual [1] - 45:9 up [51] - 6:26, 15:9, 16:9, 17:12, 20:19, 27:13, 27:14, 27:28, 30:26, 33:14, 38:18, 38:26, 39:1, 42:14, 44:28, 50:12, 54:22, 57:12, 58:2, 58:26, 62:13, 63:25, 69:19, 70:17, 73:4, 74:8, 74:21, 75:13, 75:15, 75:17, 80:22, 82:28, 83:24, 84:2, 85:3, 85:6, 92:21, 102:5, 105:16, 110:29, 115:17, 118:8, 120:5, 126:12, 126:13, 131:9, 136:20, 136:25, 137:1, 137:5, 137:17 **Up**[1] - 20:18 uppermost [1] -

123:14

urban [1] - 116:12

usual [1] - 39:5

V

vacancy [1] - 67:28 vade [1] - 57:10 valid [1] - 14:14 validated [1] - 33:16 validity [1] - 60:3 value [1] - 78:22 values [1] - 34:25 variance [3] - 46:9, 50:27, 82:4 varied [1] - 23:8 variety [2] - 77:18, 119:22 various [21] - 11:14, 11:16, 13:4, 25:2, 36:4, 36:5, 43:16, 48:3, 49:22, 55:24, 56:17, 57:12, 68:25, 80:4, 80:12, 91:26, 103:10, 107:29, 114:23, 122:4 vast [5] - 8:28, 34:29, 120:11, 120:12, 142:13 vegetables [1] -59:18 verbatim [2] - 12:22, 141:14 victim [1] - 40:2 victims [1] - 123:15 view [8] - 4:27, 12:2, 29:18, 63:16, 64:12, 70:1, 119:18, 137:19 viewed [2] - 41:2, 118:27 views [3] - 27:20, 33:15. 103:25 vigorously [1] -25:18 Vincent[1] - 56:2 violence [1] - 117:8 virtually [2] - 73:3, 143.1 visit [10] - 21:28, 56:4, 81:5, 81:18, 115:22, 115:24, 115:25, 116:17, 116:18, 116:21 visitation [28] -21:26, 26:20, 27:2, 27:18, 28:10, 28:28, 29:15, 36:21, 42:17, 42:26, 43:10, 47:5, 48:2, 48:17, 55:2,

56:9, 59:25, 60:4,

62:14, 66:3, 66:19,

66:20, 74:7, 78:1,

86:15, 108:28, 140:18, 140:26 visited [3] - 25:1, 55:5. 81:17 visiting [2] - 113:15, 113:16 visitor [9] - 26:6, 28:3, 29:9, 29:20, 42:18, 67:8, 70:3, 104:1 visitor's [2] - 67:21, visitors [1] - 48:3 visits [1] - 23:19 vocation [1] - 26:26 vocational [12] -16:18, 42:6, 54:16, 54:28, 65:28, 70:7, 74:9, 74:14, 74:15, 74:19, 74:20, 74:23 voluntarily [1] -125:7 voluntary [2] - 8:13, 56:1

111:9

88:27

64:3

90:19

101.22

well-founded [1] -

wetting [2] - 62:24,

41:25, 101:27, 109:24

Whereas [2] - 21:5,

whistle [1] - 38:24

whole [17] - 12:10,

12:19, 42:1, 42:9,

43:8, 43:24, 51:5,

65:5, 69:26, 70:13,

71:1, 93:2, 121:10,

wider [1] - 70:19

willing [1] - 93:28

wisely [1] - 29:20

wish [2] - 12:14,

Witness[1] - 3:4

won [1] - 40:5

wondering [4] -

30:19, 74:13, 84:4,

woodwork [1] -

word [4] - 31:17,

61:1, 97:10, 133:12

wording [1] - 137:12

words [11] - 17:28,

18:26, 35:13, 61:27,

105:9, 107:11, 112:9,

workload [3] - 20:29,

workshops [1] - 98:3

World[2] - 122:18,

world [1] - 78:21

worried [1] - 96:1

worse [2] - 50:3,

works [2] - 48:5,

65:5, 71:24, 78:5,

witnesses [1] - 5:16

woman [2] - 131:28,

wonder [2] - 43:20,

wonderful [1] - 76:15

winning [1] - 39:29

wisdom [2] - 138:22,

128:19, 129:28,

131:11, 131:13

138:24

141:13

132:1

102:6

74:24

132:13

75:29

122:19

126:29

22:14, 22:15

wherefore [1] -

whatsoever [3] -

wet [1] - 63:7

W

wages [1] - 66:27 Wagner[1] - 75:29 Wait[1] - 83:9 wait [2] - 33:14, 116:6 waiters [1] - 67:26 walk [1] - 110:6 war [2] - 55:28, 68:22 Ward[1] - 2:6 warning [2] - 125:13, 127:16 washed [1] - 63:12 waste [1] - 42:2 watched [1] - 22:10 watchful [1] - 43:15 ways [1] - 107:16 wear [2] - 67:1, 67:2 wearing [2] - 89:23, 124:2 wearying [1] - 22:8 weavers [1] - 67:27 weaving [1] - 54:2 Wednesday[1] weed [1] - 105:14 week [8] - 21:20, 22:9, 24:28, 26:11, 40:17, 61:8, 61:9, 115:14 weeks [1] - 89:1 welfare [8] - 15:1, 16:21, 19:8, 23:25, 38:9, 59:7, 62:22,

worst [1] - 121:20 worth [2] - 30:9, 62:16 worthwhile [1] -68:22 write [6] - 28:5, 57:1, 71:21, 71:22, 85:6, 96:26 writer [1] - 42:9 writer's [1] - 121:2 writing [4] - 28:4, 50:12, 71:22, 88:13 written [18] - 2:29, 11:20, 11:22, 27:7, 28:6, 36:23, 36:24, 50:10, 50:13, 56:20, 104:23, 116:15, 121:29, 122:14, 124:14, 127:21, 128:10 wrongdoing [2] -103:14, 126:24 wrote [2] - 95:7, 122:10 wrought [1] - 65:14

Υ

yard [7] - 19:12, 21:9. 38:21. 38:23. 40:14, 49:15, 63:15 year [19] - 4:10, 8:15, 19:3, 19:27, 22:2, 25:5, 25:6, 25:11, 36:5, 36:15, 37:9, 56:19, 57:3, 60:16, 66:29, 91:29, 102:3, 121:10 years [57] - 10:29, 11:2, 14:26, 15:17, 16:2, 18:12, 30:1, 30:2. 30:3. 30:19. 39:7, 40:1, 40:3, 40:7, 45:3, 54:11, 55:28, 56:8, 57:3, 60:19, 66:14. 67:3. 68:1. 68:4, 68:22, 70:26, 71:28, 72:20, 72:28, 74:16, 74:17, 74:27, 74:29, 75:7, 76:14, 82:27, 87:16, 87:25, 87:26, 88:3, 88:6, 89:12, 92:4, 92:20, 93:10, 93:15, 93:29, 94:24, 98:6, 100:19, 101:9, 101:10, 117:18, 135:12 young [14] - 21:18, 35:14, 49:21, 58:25, 72:25, 75:2, 98:2,

123:21, 130:23,
131:16, 131:21,
132:3, 134:7, 134:19
younger [5] - 22:7,
22:20, 37:5, 45:6,
106:4
youngster [2] 63:17, 123:25
youngsters [8] 35:29, 38:21, 52:21,
69:23, 92:29, 121:29,
128:15, 129:17
yourself [3] - 10:24,
17:13, 90:27
youth [1] - 79:9

£

£127,000 [1] - 33:2 £209,904 [1] - 32:28 £362,000 [1] - 58:28 £4 [1] - 32:1 £4.15 [1] - 32:1 £5-4s-9p [1] - 31:29 £73,991 [1] - 32:29 £800 [1] - 66:27

É

Éireann[1] - 17:2